SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC LIBRARY
3 1223 03473 6463

5th Floor
CLOSED
STACKS

San Francisco Public Library

GOVERNMENT INFORMATION CENTER
SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC LIBRARY

REFERENCE BOOK

Not to be taken from the Library

L 1 5 2003

3 1223 03473 6463

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

F
80
1
1/14/99

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

DOCUMENTS DEPT.
JAN 12 1999
SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THURSDAY, January 14, 1999

4:30 P.M.
25 VAN NESS AVENUE
EIGHTH FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Comer Marshall, Chair	Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Agar Jaicks
Shirley Dimapilis	Martha Knutzen
Julia Globus-Sabori	Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Stephen Herman	Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
Mercy Gharechedaghy
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are the 26, 42, and 71 and the Metro station at Van Ness and Market. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of 25 Van Ness Avenue. The following services are available upon request with 48 hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.sfhumanrights.org.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2012 with funding from
California State Library Califa/LSTA Grant

http://archive.org/details/minutesofmeeting1999huma

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. SF GIANTS ANNUAL REPORT ON CONSTRUCTION OF PACIFIC BELL PARK AND THE PROGRAM IN DIVERSITY

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   a. Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of December 10, 1998

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

6. CONSIDERATION OF AND POSSIBLE APPROVAL OF THE TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT NEEDS ANAYSIS SURVEY

7. REPORT OF THE CHAIR
   a. Individual Commissioners Report on their activities in the Community

8. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR
a. HRC Program Unit Activities

9. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Comer Marshall, Chair
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee meeting of December 16, 1998

NOTE: *The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will be held on Wednesday, January 20, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

b) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. Report on the Employment Committee Retreat of January 7, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, February 4, 1999, at 12:00 noon. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

4 49386 SFPL: ECONO JRS
88 SFPL 07/07/03 27

c) Issues Committee

Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Approval of the recommendation to endorse the petition of the U.S. Prostitutes Collective to implement the recommendations of the Task Force on Prostitution created by the Board of Supervisors in 1994, including sending letters urging review of the Task Force's final report to the Mayor, Board of Supervisors, Police Commission and the District Attorney
2. Report from the Committee meeting of January 4, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be held on Monday, February 4, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102*

d) Youth and Education Committee

Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diane Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will be held on Thursday, January 21, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

e) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee

Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will be held on Tuesday, January 19, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at The Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

10. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

11. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

12. CLOSED SESSION

Conference with Legal Counsel
Existing Litigation: ABB-Daimler Benz Transportation, Inc. v. City and County of San Francisco (pursuant to Brown Act Section 54956.9(a) and the Sunshine Ordinance Section 67.11)

1. Vote on whether or not to enter into close session with counsel
2. Vote on whether or not to disclose discussion held in closed session

13. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION

14. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b):

Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

15. RECOVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a).)

16. ADJOURNMENT

This meeting will be held at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800; San Francisco, CA 94102. Beginning January 28, 1999, all Commission meetings will be held in Room 408, City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, JANUARY 28, 1999

a:\agenda 1/14/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 12 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF JANUARY 14, 1999

Commission Chair Comer Marshall called the meeting to order at 4:40p.m. Commissioner Marshall welcomed everyone and thanked everyone for coming. He announced that he would be changing the order of the Agenda items.

Commission Vice Chair Saliba-Malouf requested if item #5, Consideration of the Survey, could be heard the same time as item #14 of the Agenda, which is under a closed session. Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel interjected that the two matters cannot be heard at the same time because the item on the Survey was not previously calendared for a closed session. Ms. Frankel suggested for Commissioners Marshall and Saliba-Malouf schedule a break to discuss the matter.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present:Comer Marshall, Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair; Youn Chey, Shirley Dimapilis, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, and Alan Watahara

Excused:Julia Globus-Sabori, Martha Knutzen and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

HRC Staff:

Present:Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin, Don Hesse, Mercy Gharechedaghy, Gail Roberts, Preston Tom and Kevin Williams

Guests:

Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Lori Aviles, Jerry Burt, Todd Clayter, Dawn Clements, Laura Desert Rain, Shahla Davoudi, Na'im Harrison, Bill Hedge, Betty Higgins, Linda Jofuku, Local 21; Masashi Katayama, Enrique Osorio, Ray Quesada, Willie Ratcliff, Patsy Reese, Roderick Roche, John Siracusa, Leuticia Stills, Corrine White, John Yee and Lawrence Yuen

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Commissioner Jaicks stated that, on page 12 of the minutes, where it read, "Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel...it would require 2/3 vote of the Body...under the Sunshine Ordinance," he requested adding the phrase, "that it would require 2/3 vote of the members of the Body present...under the Sunshine Ordinance." On page 13, regarding Joint Ventures, he asked the Director if the first statement on the paragraph was correct to which Director Bamba responded affirmatively. Commissioner Jaicks also had a question on page 14 regarding the Guidelines for Preventing and Addressing Gender Identity Discrimination, which was noted as being reagendized for the next meeting. Commissioner Marshall pointed out that he believes that the Guidelines was approved and voted on unanimously by the Commission. The minutes of the Commission meeting of December 10, 1998 were unanimously approved with the changes. ***Moved (Chey), Seconded (Herman).

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communications file was circulated.

SF GIANTS ANNUAL REPORT ON CONSTRUCTION OF
PACIFIC BELL PARK AND THE PROGRAM IN DIVERSITY

Mr. Preston Tom, HRC Contract Compliance Officer, explained that he had been assigned to monitor the Giants' Program in Diversity as it relates to the design, construction and operation of Pacific Bell Park. Mr. Tom gave a brief overview of the Giants Project. He stated that the Pacific Bell Park is being built on property leased by the City; however, the construction of the Park is being paid for from private funds. Mr. Tom related that the Giants have voluntarily agreed to adopt a diversity program to achieve the goals of the MBE/WBE/LBE Ordinance to increase opportunities for MBEs/WBEs. The Giants also made commitments for employment opportunities at the Ball Park for women, minorities and San Francisco residents. Mr. Tom noted that the Ball Park is a little over a year into the project. Mr. Tom pointed out that, from a compliance standpoint, the Giants have met the requirements and, in some instances, have exceeded their commitments. Mr. Tom stated that he was pleased with where the Project was headed. Mr. Tom introduced Mr. John Yee, Executive Vice President and Chief Financial Officer for the San Francisco Giants.

Mr. John Yee, Executive Vice President and Chief Financial Officer, stated that a year into the Project, he could report that the Giants have been successful in implementing the Program in Diversity, meeting the goals that they have established. Mr. Yee pointed out that the Project Team would present the status explaining that the Project is on target and the Giants are looking forward to the opening in April, 2000.

Mr. Yee highlighted some data information:

The Giants have achieved 40% MBE/WBE participation, representing over $35 million dollars of contracting for minority and women owned businesses in San Francisco
The Giants achieved 20% compared with the 10% goals in the design and engineering for MBEs. The Giants exceeded the 16% goals for WBEs
In the construction, the Giants achieved 30% for MBEs and 11% for WBEs
22% of the employment pool are San Francisco residents, 5% are women and 46% are minorities

Mr. Yee noted that the results came from the Giants' commitment, tenacity and creativity. He gave credit to the Project Team for their teamwork efforts.

Project Team
Mr. Bill Hedge is Construction Manager from Hubert, Hunt & Nichols the prime contractor for the Project. Mr. Hedge showed a video demonstrating what construction work and activities have taken place at the Ball Park. Mr. Hedge pointed out that at the start of the Project, there were 100 workers a day on site. Now, there are over 200 workers. Later there will be 450 workers each day on site. Mr. Hedge anticipates that the Ball Park would open on the targeted date of April, 2000.

Ms. Corinne White, Human Resource Manager from Hubert, Hunt & Nichols discussed MBE/WBE participation. She noted that the Giants have exceeded the 20% MBE and 10% WBE goals, achieving 30% MBE and 11% WBE. Ms. White related that 40 minority and women contractors, certified by the Human Rights Commission are on the Project. Ms. White pointed out that, as of September 1998, they were at $20.9 million MBE dollars, and $7.4 million WBE dollars. Ms. White stated that in their next quarterly report, the numbers would increase. As part of the Giants' monitoring program, they track all MBE/WBE contractors that are being used and actually receiving the dollars. Ms. White noted that there have been changes in the scope of work. She announced that the Giants are currently working on a joint venture to enhance the workforce. She noted that, in the next schedule, they would have a better opportunity to hire more San Francisco residents. Ms. White pointed out that she would be meeting with Employment Committee Commissioners and the Community Based Organizations (CBOs) on a periodic basis to provide a status report and update on the Project.

Mr. Rod Roche, Project Manager for China Basin Ball Park Company, gave an overview of their approach to the jobs program that was being implemented. Mr. Roche explained that $200,000 dollars was budgeted to ensure that the Project was a success, noting that they have worked with Potrero Hill Neighborhood House as the lead agency. The basic goal of the lead agency is to outreach to the community. As of September 1998, Potrero Hill Neighborhood House have screened over 670 participants and 416 of these have remained with the program. Mr. Roche noted that there are 311 trainees who are at different stages of job readiness. The Giants have entered into an agreement with Cypress Mandela Training Center in Oakland to conduct specific construction pre-apprenticeship training. As of September 1998, 47 workers out of the 311 trainees have been placed in various jobs in the City.

Mr. Dave Hathaway, Project Executive Urban Development, developers for the Pacific Bell Park presented four MBEs/WBEs that have been involved in building the Ball Park Project.

Mr. Zatish Famiti, Mechanical and Electrical Plumbing Engineers from San Francisco are assisting the architects. Mr. Famiti stated that the Pacific Bell Park Project was very unique participation to their company. Their experience in working with the Giants has been outstanding and they have benefited. Overall, Mr. Famiti observed that it has been a great opportunity working with the Giants.

Ms. Shahla Davoudi from Elite Reprographics reported that her experience in working with the Giants has also been wonderful. The Project Team is very supportive and has respected their Firm from the beginning.

Mr. Troy Reese, general contractor, informed the Commission that his experience with the Giants Project Team have also been wonderful. The Giants have given him great opportunities to be exposed to other projects around the City.

Ms. Pat Reese, a WBE sheet metal firm has done work valued at $1.3 million. Ms. Reese acknowledged and thanked Corinne White's efforts for ensuring WBE participation on the Project. Ms. Reese pointed out that her Firm was grateful for the opportunity to participate in the Project.

Mr. Hathaway reported on the Elevator Union issues. He thanked Jonnie Robinson from the Mayor's Office for her personal commitment in assisting minority and women. Ms. Robinson introduced him to LJ Dolan. With the help, guidance and training from Montgomery Kone, Ms. Dolan would be the first woman in Northern California to be classified as an elevator mechanic. Mr. Hathaway stated that the Giants are committed to continuing the Program. There are future opportunities for people who would like to enter the elevator field and he encouraged more women in particular.

Ms. Robinson observed that Mr. Hathaway and the Giants should be commended for their efforts and commitments. Ms. Robinson noted that she was pleased with the results.

Mr. John Yee gave the concluding remarks for the Giants Presentation. Mr. Yee stated that they have accomplished a lot; however, they know that they still have more work to do. He stated that the Giants would continue to be committed to the end of the Project.

Commission Chair Comer Marshall asked for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf thanked the Giants for their presentation. She pointed out that Commissioner Jaicks and her has met twice with Ms. White and Mr. Roche and will meet again. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf noted that the Project Team has been very accessible and helpful in the process. Commissioner Jaicks echoed Commissioner Saliba-Malouf's comments.

Betty Higgins, J. Higgins Trucking, stated that she has bided for work at the Pacific Bell Ballpark and was never offered any work. She is HRC certified; however, in her 10 years in the trucking business, she has never received a City contract.

Commissioner Watahara questioned how reports could be validated because these are actually self-reporting.

Mr. Tom stated that he validates the report by personally calling each firm that was listed. Director Bamba pointed out that HRC has been working very closely with the Giants. She stated that if there are issues that needs her immediate attention, she discusses them with Mr. Yee to resolve the matter. She has met previously with the Giants' Project Team. They are all committed to working together on issues that may arise. Director Bamba noted that she would have HRC staff looks into J. Higgins Trucking records.

Ms. Corinne White encouraged Ms. Higgins to call her at her office, so that she could give her more information about her bid and look into her records.

Ms. Dawn Clements questioned HRC's website.

Mr. Bill Greene questioned why the Giants did not hire African American pile crane drivers. Mr. Greene observed that there are experienced and qualified crane drivers who are minority and are looking for jobs.

Commissioner Marshall thanked the Giants for their presentation.

At 6:00 p.m., Commission Chair Marshall announced that the Commission would go into a Closed Session.

PUBLIC COMMENTS ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO
THE CLOSED SESSION

There were no public comments.

CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957
AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b).

Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

***Moved (Saliba-Malouf), Seconded (Herman) and was unanimously voted to go into a closed session.

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION

1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a).)

***Moved (Herman), Seconded (Dimapilis) and was unanimously voted not to discuss the closed session.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Lawrence Yuen related that the Commission had requested Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel to draft a follow-up letter on the American Airlines case. Ms. Frankel noted that she had been working with Kevin Williams, on the language in the letter. The letter would go out the following day.

Mr. Yuen inquired as to the process that Mr. Williams used to arrive at this finding.

Commissioner Marshall requested that Mr. Yuen contact Mr. Williams regarding the process. Director Bamba stated that she would meet with Mr. Yuen and discuss his issues.

Ms. Linda Jofuco, from Local 21 representing Contract Compliance Officers at HRC and other 3200 public employees, commented that she had comments on the minutes of December 10, 1998. She observed that the minutes did not reflect what has been discussed in the meeting. Ms. Jofuco requested a copy of the tape of the meeting.
Commissioner Herman noted that the minutes are a summation of what was taped and from hand written notes.

Ms. Jofuco gave an overview of her client's (Leutisha Stills) issue. She distributed a copy of the grievance that Ms. Stills filed. Ms. Jofuco questioned the process in the manner in which Ms. Stills was terminated, viewing the separation as retaliation. She observed that Ms. Stills should have been given a 30 days notification before she was separated. Ms. Jofuco noted that they are proceeding with the grievance. They view the separation as discrimination and that HRC did not follow the appropriate procedure.

Mr. Bill Greene informed the Commission that he came to follow-up on a complaint that he had filed with the HRC regarding the Tutor Saliba Construction Company. He stated that the method that HRC is handling his complaint would make his case lose. Mr. Greene explained that Ms. Mary Tramil, HRC staff, was handling his complaint; however, he requested that Mr. Williams be involved because of his experience in handling Airport matters and complaints. Mr. Greene was of the opinion that there are many others who are being discriminated against at the Airport by Tutor Saliba and the company needs to be investigated properly. He requested a stronger support from staff.

Kevin Williams agreed that there was a need to investigate, not only on his complaint, but for others as well. Mr. Williams stated that he met with Ms. Tramil and they discussed his complaint. Mr. Williams noted for the record, that although Ms. Tramil is "new" to HRC, she has a good deal of background and experience as a Job Union Referral person from Ella Hills Hutch Community Center. He also noted that Ms. Tramil is intuned and sensitive to the needs of the community. Mr. Williams assured Mr. Greene that he is well aware of what has

happened to him at the Airport and promised to do a thorough investigation. He informed Mr. Greene that the legal staff at the Airport was also involved in reviewing his complaint.

Director Bamba informed the Commission that Mr. Greene's request would be accommodated. Mr. Williams would attend the next meeting with Tutor Saliba.

Mr. Enrique Osorio spoke on behalf of the American Airlines complaint. Mr. Osorio explained that he was part of the group that was terminated by American Airlines. He requested the Commission to look further and reinvestigate the case. Commissioner Herman reiterated that the Commission had completed their investigation on this case and a follow up letter would be sent out by Ms. Frankel.

Commissioner Jaicks asked Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel if the Commission could draft a letter stating that, although the case is outside the Commission's jurisdiction, they were of the opinion that there has been wrongful action done by American Airlines against its employees. Ms. Frankel stated that the Commission could choose to draft the letter if they decide to. Commissioner Jaicks requested to refer the matter to the Employment Committee. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf suggested that an American Airlines representative to be invited to speak on the case.

Ms. Frankel requested that the Commission wait for her letter to be completed. If there were other information that the Commission would like to add, she would like to discuss it further. Ms. Frankel suggested holding off in a representative from American Airlines to come before the Employment Committee.

Jerry Burke informed the Commission that he had filed a complaint with HRC against New Leaf Services about a year and a half ago. A Director's finding would soon be released. He stated that he came to inform the Commission that his dealings with HRC have been very positive during the whole situation. Mr. Burke thanked Ms. Mary Gin Starkweather who have been assigned to the case. He stated that Ms. Starkweather was very thorough and compassionate to the case. Mr. Burke also thanked Director Bamba, Ms. Gail Roberts, Mr. Larry Brinkin, Interns Arturo Sanchez and Roell Villacarlos, and Nichole Truax. Mr. Burke pointed out that even though it has been a long process, he was very pleased with all the work that HRC have put into his case.

LaVaughan Moore informed the Commission that with all the pre construction meetings that HRC have held, she stated that her company, Double B&L Trucking has been omitted from the list from participating and attending the meeting because she is not certified with HRC. She confirmed that her firm was no longer certified with HRC; however, she does have a motor transportation permit, $5 million dollars worth of insurance from Lloyds of London and a 1999 San Francisco Business Certificate. Ms. Moore observed that out of town firms are brought in to work on City contracts, leaving no opportunities for local companies.

Mr. John Siracusa observed that, if they did not come to follow up on the letter, the letter would not be generated. Mr. Siracusa pleaded with the Commission to reopen the case because he believed that, under Chapter 12B, the Commission has jurisdiction.

Mr. Willie Ratcliff related that he had difficulty requesting copies of the Liberty Builders' files, having to call the Chair to get copies. Director Bamba pointed out that Mary Ratcliff had telephoned requesting copies. The Director had asked Mr. Williams to provide them to Ms. Ratcliff. Director Bamba stated that she would be meeting with Mr. Yuen and welcomed any Commissioners to attend the meeting. Mr. Herman thanked the Director and asked her to report back to the Commission on the outcome of the meeting.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

a) Individual Commissioners' Reports on their activities in the Community

There was no report from the Commissioners.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

Employment Assessment Programs
Director Bamba reported that the Employment Assessment Program is being launched. She has met with the SF Urban Institute to discuss the scope of work. Ms. Bamba stated that some research has been conducted. They are reviewing the statistical report that have been generated on employment, drawing upon the information on

hand. The HRC would be retaining the service of the SF Urban Institute, Leong Data Research and the pro bono attorneys. Director Bamba pointed out that they would meet with the Employment Committee as soon as they identify the people to be involved.

Contract Tracking System
Director Bamba reported that HRC was working with the Controller's Office on a contract tracking system that they are funding. She stated that a test run was conducted and was successful and accessible via the Internet under SFGov. She would plan on a future presentation to the Commission.

Muni
Director Bamba reported that Muni and the Philippine National Railway have signed off on a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) to work together in offering technical assistance through the Sister City relationship. Ms. Bamba stated that Mr. Charlie Boremeo have been appointed by the Philippine President Estrada to become the Chairman of the Philippine National Chairman. Director Bamba provided copies of the MOU to the Commissioners.

Budget
Director Bamba reminded the Commission that Budget preparation is here once again. She stated that she requested for the Chair to designate a Budget Committee to work with the managers who are involved with the Budget. Commissioner Marshall has designated Commissioners Jaicks and Herman to the Committee. The Director hopes to present a budget package by the end of January.

Complaint Log
Mr. Larry Brinkin reiterated that the complaint log is an interim report until a computer tracking system is in placed. He stated that the report gives an overview of the status of the complaint. Mr. Brinkin reported on complaints that were closed and had success stories behind it. He reported that a case opened six years ago received a settlement of $95,000.

Commissioner Herman asked what does "advance copy" that they have received mean. Director Bamba stated that the advance copy is provided to the Commissioners before the actual findings are distributed. Commissioner Herman requested to agendized for discussion and clarification on what is the role of the Commission when they receive advance copies of findings. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf concurred that she had also spoken to the Chair regarding the same issue. She asked if a memo could be drafted by the Director and Ms. Frankel to clarify how the Commission can properly address findings. Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel pointed out that if the Commission decided to hold an appeal hearing on any of the complaint, they may do so. Ms. Frankel noted that the Commission has broad power of inquiry.

Mr. Brinkin also reported on another success story negotiating a $10,000 settlement by Mr. Williams on behalf of a woman who was a victim of discrimination.

Commissioner Watahara suggested to change the language or term under the column, "Evidence without Merit", to "No Sufficient Evidence."

Director Bamba reported that a settlement agreement was signed on the Hamilton Family Center. She commended Deputy City Attorney John Kennedy for his work on his case. Mr. Williams also thanked Ms. Jennifer Small, Deputy City Attorney for her work on Hamilton Family Center in which he was the investigator on the case.

Mr. Willliams reported that a complaint was settled and was resolved with a $50,000 settlement award and the firm would continue to work on a minority business contract at the Airport.

Bank of America/NationsBank
Director Bamba reported that she attended a meeting on Monday, January 11, 1999 with Treasurer Susan Leal and Ms. Frankel on the investigation that HRC is conducting. She stated that Ms. Leal would support the HRC investigation and would update the Commission on any new information.

Commissioner Watahara asked what the timeline was on the investigation. Director Bamba assumed that it might take up to 30 to 60 days.

Disability Hearing
Director Bamba pointed out that she is working with the Mayor's Office Assistant Disability Coordinator, Mr. Jose Caedo, on the Disability Hearing. She noted that Assistant City Attorney Mr. Buck Deventhal would be drafting the

Ordinance after all the information is gathered.

Grant Application
Director Bamba reported that two grant applications, Equal Benefits and the Diversity Program, have been submitted to the Ford Foundation. They hope to get some response.

Director Bamba informed the Commission that HRC is conducting a thorough audit on Tutor Saliba and working closely with Airport staff.

Director Bamba introduced Ray Quesada, Project Manager at the Airport, specifically assigned to Hensel Phelps/Liberty Builders contract. Mr. Quesada briefly stated that he is working closely with Mr. Williams and encouraged the Commission to call upon him if they had any questions and/or if he can offer assistance that they may need.

Ms. Frankel stated that the appeal on the first Fnding on Liberty Builders against Hensel Phelps would be discussed at the next Commission meeting. Ms. Frankel reminded the Commissioners that the Commission has lost its quorum and should not be discussing any business item on the Agenda. Ms. Frankel pointed out that the Commission cannot act on any action items without a quorum. The Commission could adjourn the meeting and hear information informally and any information would not be part of the minutes. The alternative would be for the Commission to continue the remaining items to the next meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf adjourned the meeting at 8:10 p.m. due to the lack of a quorum. Any items not discussed would be tabled to the next HRC meeting.

NEXT MEETING

DATE:Thursday, January 28, 1998
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Mercy Gharechedaghy
Executive Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SF
180
1
1/28/99

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JAN 25 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THURSDAY, January 28, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Comer Marshall, Chair	Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Agar Jaicks
Shirley Dimapilis	Martha Knutzen
Julia Globus-Sabori	Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Stephen Herman	Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
Mercy Gharechedaghy
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART and Metro stations are the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48 hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   a. Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of January 14, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

4. DISCUSS THE MONITORING OF THE MBE/WBE/LBE PARTICIPATION BY THE SAN FRANCISCO EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM – Clare Murphy

5. GENERAL DISCUSSION REGARDING GRIEVANCE & CIVIL SERVICE PROCEDURES

6. PUBLIC COMMENTS

7. REPORT OF THE CHAIR
   a. Individual Commissioners Report on their activities in the Community

8. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a. HRC Program Unit Activities
   - Status of Bank America/NationsBank investigation

9. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Employment Committee

Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. Acceptance of Report: Reinforced Masonry Building Program & Seismic Safety Loan Program - Diana Rathbone, Business Analyst
2. Acceptance of Report: Workforce Analysis of Construction Workers in the Mayor's Office of Housing Projects – James Fields, Contract Compliance Officer
3. Report on the Employment Committee Retreat of January 7, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, February 4, 1999, at 12:00 Noon. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

b) Issues Committee

Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be held on Monday, February 1, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102*

80

c) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diane Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee meeting of January 21, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will be held on Thursday, February 18, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee meeting of January 19, 1999
2. Approval of Letter to American Psychiatric Association commending their position against reparative therapy to change sexual orientation

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will be held on Tuesday, February 16, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at The Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

e) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Comer Marshall, Chair
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee meetings of December 16, 1998 and of January 20, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will be held on Wednesday, February 17, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

10. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

11. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

12. CLOSED SESSION

Conference with Legal Counsel
Existing Litigation: ABB-Daimler Benz Transportation, Inc. v. City and County of San Francisco (pursuant to Brown Act Section 54956.9(a) and the Sunshine Ordinance Section 67.11)

1. Vote on whether or not to enter into close session with counsel
2. Vote on whether or not to disclose discussion held in closed session

13. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION

14. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b):

Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

15. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a).)

16. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102 unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 1999

a:\agenda 1/28/99

F.
80
2
8/99

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 12 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF JANUARY 28, 1999

Commission Chair Comer Marshall called the meeting to order at 4:36 p.m. Commissioner Marshall welcomed everyone to the Commission meeting and thanked everyone for coming to the new meeting location at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present:Comer Marshall, Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair; Youn Chey, Shirley Dimapilis, Julia Globus-Sabori, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, Martha Knutzen, Antonio Salazar-Hobson and Alan Watahara

HRC Staff
Present: Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin, Maria Cordero, Don Hesse, Mercy Gharechedaghy, Bernadette Montemayor, HRC Intern; Diana Rathbone, Gail Roberts and Nicole Truax

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Martin Gran, Deputy City Attorney; Dawn Clements, Reginald Forrest, Mario Gallardo, SFIA; Clare Murphy, Director – Employees' Retirement Systems and Kimberly Trumbull, Robert Van Securities

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of the Commission meeting of January 14, 1999 were unanimously approved. ***Moved (Chey), Seconded (Dimapilis).

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communications file was circulated.

DISCUSS THE MONITORING OF MBE/WBE/LBE PARTICIPATION
BY THE SAN FRANCISCO EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM

Commissioner Marshall reported that the MBE/WBE/LBE Committee has been discussing the issue of MBE/WBE/LBE participation in contracts awarded to the San Francisco Employees Retirement System. Dawn Clements, MBE/WBE Committee member was requested to present an overview of the issue.

Ms. Clements related that the issue is the independent monitoring of contracts awarded to the Employee Retirement System. The Employee Retirement System currently does their own internal monitoring; however, other City departments are monitored by the Human Rights Commission, with funding provided through a work order. Ms. Clements was of the opinion that monitoring should be done by a third party.

Commissioner Marshall introduced Clare Murphy, Executive Director of the San Francisco Employee Retirement System to report and to address the issue on independent monitoring.

Ms. Murphy stated that the Retirement Board is strongly committed to the use of minority and women owned businesses in all aspects of the Employee Retirement System's business. The Human Rights Commission has worked with the Employee Retirement System primarily in the area of brokerage for investment activities. At its

last Retirement Board budget review, the Board directed the Retirement System staff to prepare a quarterly review of the utilization of minority and women owned brokers. The Board also adopted a policy regarding sub contracting, joint venturing and supply purchasing by any vendor of the Retirement System. Ms. Murphy pointed out that the Retirement Board reviews the actual reports with regard to brokerage commissions on a quarterly basis. She noted that the reports are circulated to the investment companies who purchase the brokerage services and to minority and women owned brokerage firms. The report also shows which firms are receiving commission dollars. Ms. Murphy reassured the Commission that the Retirement Board is in touched with the firms. Ms. Murphy stated that no firms have contacted the Retirement System to inform them of dollar errors. She stated that the report had been a positive impact.

Ms. Murphy stated that the Retirement Board has directed staff members who have direct responsibility for investment of financial securities that as part of their pay-for-performance evaluation criteria is their commitment and the impact that they are having on the utilization of minority and women owned businesses. She noted that the trend has been positive. The Board has seen a change from approximately $300,000 to $500,000 in brokerage directed to minority and women owned businesses per year which is 5% of the entire brokerage incurred by the Retirement System in investment transactions.

Ms. Murphy stated that, beyond the utilization of minority and women owned brokers, the Board has coordinated with the Commission staff with regard to all bids and contract activities. She pointed out that it has resulted in investment requests for proposals with Aetna, the new deferred compensation and with other firms that the Retirement System is utilizing for communications contracts. Ms. Murphy reiterated that the Retirement Board is very much attuned to the issue and has been actively engage in ensuring that efforts are made to include as many qualified minority and women owned firms in all aspects of contracting at the Employees Retirement System.

In response to Commissioner Marshall's inquiry about monitoring by HRC, Ms.Murphy responded that, in its last Retirement Board budget meeting review, the Board decided that that the gathering and publication of information would be a Retirement System staff responsibility. The Board has instructed that the staff publish the data on a quarterly basis to all parties.

Commissioner Herman asked Ms. Murphy to explain the 5% commission and what percent are minority and women in a particular field. Ms. Murphy stated that the commission only applies to trades and that she is not aware of the brokerage percentage. She guessed that it could well be under 10%. Ms. Murphy pointed out that the Retirement staff has conducted outreach with the assistance of the HRC staff.

Commissioner Herman inquired if the brokers that the Retirement System use to make investments were making independent decisions or are the Retirement staff making the decisions regarding trades. Ms. Murphy stated that, in respect to the trades being managed internally, the Retirement System staff selects the brokerage agents. For externally employed managers who are managing the money on behalf of the Pension plan, they make their own decisions. The Retirement System advises and provides names of qualified firms and conducts financial qualifications, in addition to certification to ensure that the firms meet regulations.

Commissioner Marshall asked if the Retirement System would be internally conducting the monitoring. Ms. Murphy noted that the Retirement Board decided that the senior investment professionals would conduct the monitoring. She added that HRC is receiving their quarterly reports. Ms. Murphy would add the Commissioners to the mailing list and also send them the Retirement Board calendar.

Commissioner Marshall inquired if there was any plan in increasing the outreach to minority and women owned businesses. Ms. Murphy responded that there is a plan to continue to work with the firms that are currently on the list. She noted that there is a Board directive to increase the efforts to ensure that these firms are utilized.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf asked Ms. Murphy to elaborate on the Board's reasons for not outsourcing the monitoring function. Ms. Murphy responded that it required confidential materials to be provided to the Retirement Board. She added that the individuals who are in contact with the investment managers are in the position to oversee the Retirement Board's policy. Ms. Murphy reiterated that the Retirement Board made the decision.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf inquired if the Retirement System is now able to establish goals and determine the availability with respect to contracts. Ms. Murphy responded that, their Board ensures that every trade is executed at the least cost and best execution, and encourages the utilization of minority and women owned businesses; however, the Board has not established percentage goals.

Commissioner Knutzen inquired if the Retirement Board is getting the assistance they need from the Human Rights Commission. Ms. Murphy pointed out that the area that the Retirement Board and HRC could work more together effectively is on sub-contracting, joint venturing and supply purchasing. She would like the Retirement Board managers to work directly with HRC staff to identify local firms. Ms. Murphy pointed out that many of the Retirement Board managers are not physically located locally and that they are mostly on the East Coast. She added that some are not located in the United States because they invest in foreign countries on the Board's behalf. Ms. Murphy noted that the Retirement Board would be happy to work with the Director and her staff.

Commissioner Knutzen inquired if there was an HRC staff already assigned to the Employees Retirement System, and if not, could an HRC staff be assigned. Director Bamba responded that the outreach that HRC and the Employees Retirement System have conducted have been very useful and effective; however, HRC does not have the resources and not enough expertise on the issue. Director Bamba pointed out that she welcomed the closer relationship in working together with the Employee Retirement System.

Ms. Murphy requested that the San Francisco Employee Retirement System be made aware of all the MBE/WBE/LBE Committee Advisory meetings.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were no public comments.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR
a) Individual Commissioners' Reports on their activities in the Community

Commissioner Marshall stated that he attended the Director's management meeting on Wednesday, January 27, 1999 explaining that one of the issues discussed with him was use the committee structure more effectively. It was suggested that some public comments that are brought to the full Commission should be heard first at the committee level. Use of the consent calendar more often could expedite the Agenda process. Commissioner Marshall suggested that the Commission also need to discuss time limits for each Commission meetings.

Commissioner Marshall pointed out that he would put together a policy committee to look at what are the Commission's roles and objectives, and how the Commission can accomplish them. He stated that he would be meeting with Commissioner Saliba-Malouf, Commissioner Knutzen, Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel and Director Bamba to discuss the matter.

Commissioner Marshall reported that he would be meeting with the Airport Director and Commissioners along with HRC Commissioners Jaicks and Knutzen, and Director Bamba to discuss issues of how to communicate more effectively on matters between the two departments. He stated that the meetings would take place at least once a month, with the first meeting scheduled for February.

Commissioner Marshall announced that Gail Roberts, who has been with the Human Rights Commission for 31 years, would be retiring in April. He thanked Ms. Roberts for all her contribution to the Commission and that she would be truly missed. Director Bamba added that there would be a reception in honor of Ms. Roberts.

Commissioner Chey reported that she attended an outreach meeting for Asian community leaders that was organized by Governor Davis' office. She stated that it was very good to hear the Governor's priorities, the top one being education.

Commissioner Dimapilis reported that she attended a Redevelopment Agency meeting on behalf of the Filipino community, to discuss the building of an education and senior center for the Filipino community and as well as others in the South of Market area.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Status of Bank America/Nations Bank investigation
Director Bamba reported that she had met with Supervisors Katz and Yaki along with Steve Kava from the

Mayor's Office to discuss the investigation and to bring closure. She pointed out that when Hugh McCall met with Mayor Brown, he stated that he embraces diversity. Director Bamba noted that Supervisor Katz is assisting HRC in facilitating the response from BofA/Nations Bank.

Commissioner Knutzen inquired if HRC was utilizing the Commission on the Status of Women in assisting in the effort. She explained that the CEDAW Task Force focusing on the concept of gender parity for government institutions. She was of the opinion that it would be an opportunity to introduce the concepts to such corporation as Bank of America/Nations Bank. Director Bamba welcomed the opportunity. Ann Lehman, Commission on the Status of Women, will be the contact person for Virginia Harmon, HRC staff assigned to the investigation.

HRC Newsletter
Director Bamba mentioned that the first HRC newsletter is almost complete. The newsletter would be published on a quarterly basis.

Tracking System
Director Bamba reported that the contract tracking system is completed and that the database looked excellent and is available through the Internet. Departments will be trained on the new system. This is the only tracking system around in the country and she envisions selling the system to other agencies.

Budget
Director Bamba reported that she has been meeting with department heads to negotiate work orders for the coming fiscal year. She pointed out that the department heads have been asked to not increase their budgets and to stay within their baselines.

Commissioner Marshall inquired how many more staff was needed in the different units. Director Bamba responded that PUC would need three more staff. Once she meets with the Airport Director, she could determine the staffing needs of the Airport. Director Bamba mentioned that HRC would need an administrator to maintain computer hardware and software.

Director Bamba reported that she met with Supervisor Leland Yee and other department heads. He discussed his plans to have Budget hearings at the community level. She added that Supervisor Yee would be inquiring from each department as to their minority and women business participation.

Director Bamba pointed out that she would be presenting to the next Commission meeting, HRC Budget for the Commission to adopt. The Budget is due on February 17, 1999 at the Mayor's Office.

Director Bamba introduced Nicole Truax who is working as the legal intern/assistant for the Director. She stated that she worked on completing the grant application for the Ford Foundation. She is a graduate of McGeorge Law School. Commissioner Marshall welcomed Ms. Truax.

COMMITTEE REPORT

a) Employment Committee

1. Acceptance of Report:Reinforced Masonry Building Program and Seismic Safety Loan Program – Diana Rathbone

Diana Rathbone reported that the Unreinforced Masonry Building (UMB) Program is designed to assist owners of unreinforced brick buildings to retrofit their properties. All unreinforced structures that are most likely to suffer serious damage in a major earthquake are required by local law to undergo a seismic retrofit by the year 2006.

Ms. Rathbone stated that in November 1992, San Francisco voters approved the sale of $350 million in general obligation bonds. She pointed out that the funds were used to create a Seismic Safety Loan Program (SSLP) fund from which building owners could borrow to pay for the seismic retrofit of their buildings. The Board of Supervisors created the UMB Program in February 1994 to administer the loans.

Ms. Rathbone noted that the loans include several conditions relating to the employment of construction workers at UMB funded job sites. The HRC is designated as the agency to monitor compliance with these requirements. She stated that the contractor retained by the borrower is required to: 1. pay all workers on the payroll no less than $9 an hour, except on projects exceeding $750,000 where prevailing wage must be paid, 2. provide health

insurance to all workers on the payroll, and 3. hire economically disadvantaged workers to perform at least 25% the total project construction hours.

Ms. Rathbone stated that the Seismic Retrofit Employment Consortium (SREC) is a collaboration of community based agencies which was specifically created to find and refer disadvantaged workers to UMB job sites. The consortium employs one part time coordinator. Contractors submit worker request forms to the coordinator who then refers workers to the site from a database of available, eligible workers, submitted to the SREC on an ongoing basis by the member agencies.

Ms. Rathbone pointed out that to date, UMB has issued twelve loans, eight of which have been for over $200,000. Altogether, UMB has facilitated the renovation of 300 affordable housing units in San Francisco.

Ms. Rathbone stated that she works closely with the contractors, the SREC coordinator and the program manager, attending pre-construction conferences, investigating and mediating problems between all parties involved in the project. The program has been remarkably successful in the placements of disadvantaged workers. Recently, a previously drug addicted and homeless minority woman found permanent work as a laborer on a UMB project.

Ms. Rathbone concluded that over the next year, HRC anticipates streamlining the procedures for monitoring the wage and health benefit requirements, and to continue the cooperative relationship with UMB and SREC staff as the program gears up to address increased number of loan applications expected during the years leading up to the 2006 deadline. Ms. Rathbone pointed out that it has been a very rewarding program in which to work.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf stated that she and Commissioner Jaicks had an opportunity to meet the Program team and the relationship that Ms. Rathbone had with them added to the success of the Program. She thanked Ms. Rathbone for her thorough report.

2. Acceptance of Report: Workforce Analysis of Construction Workers in the Mayor's Office of Housing Projects – James Fields

To be reagendized for the next Commission meeting.

3. Report on the Employment Committee Retreat of January 7, 1999.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf reported that the Committee had their annual retreat on January 7, 1999 and was very successful. She pointed out that the first hour of the retreat was devoted to getting to know each other and it was very enriching. The next hour was spent brainstorming issues on which the Committee would like to work. At their next regular meeting, the Committee would prioritize and focus on specific issues.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf reported that she and Commissioner Jaicks had attended a meeting with the Giants to discuss the issue on hiring San Francisco residents at the Giants Projects. She said the meetings were positive and this would continue to meet with the Giants representatives on a bi-monthly basis.

b. Issue Committee

No report from the Committee.

Commissioner Jaicks noted that the Committee is recruiting for new members.

c. Youth and Education Committee

1. Report from the Committee meeting of January 21, 1999

Commissioner Chey reported that the Committee is currently seeking new membership for the Committee. She stated that the Committee was concerned about the recent article published in the San Francisco Chronicle regarding the issue in education and, in particular, on administrators and qualifications of teachers. She pointed out that some Committee members are interested in reviewing this issues further. Commissioner Chey stated that the Committee had a presentation by Ms. Webb from the Legal Aid Society regarding their new Employment Youth Law Project funded by Hillsbury, Madison and Sutro. She related that there were significant violations of child labor, especially in the areas of age, occupation, restrictions and basic work place regulations including sexual harassment and discrimination. Commissioner Chey noted that the violations mostly occur in the smaller

businesses and home based businesses because of the lack of knowledge and understanding of the law. She noted that many are not aware that a work permit specific to the employer must be obtained and signed by the parent to enable young people to work. The Legal Aid Society would be conducting an outreach to the community to educate them on the law. Commissioner Chey reported that a Committee member was concerned regarding a report on "Betraying the Young." She stated that the Youth Rights Task Force would look into the report further. She announced that the Youth Commission has agreed to co-sponsor the Task Force on Youth Violence. Commissioner Chey also reported that Gail Roberts would be staffing the Committee's March meeting.

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgendered Advisory Committee

1. Report from the Committee meeting of January 19, 1999
Commissioner Knutzen reported that the Committee heard a presentation from the Bisexual community. The presentation was very informative. The community believes that they are adequately represented with the support of HRC.

2. Approval of Letter to American Psychiatric Association commending their position against reparative therapy to change sexual orientation.
Commissioner Knutzen asked for approval of a letter to American Psychiatric Association (APA) for their opposition to a statement that homosexuality is a mental disorder. She stated that APA's action was particularly necessary and timely in light of the recent campaign by conservative religious and political groups falsely claiming that homosexuality is a treatable pathological behavior. Commissioner Knutzen pointed out that the APA is committed to the struggle for social justice and thanked them for this particular contribution to the mental health of Americans of all sexual orientations.

***Moved (Knutzen), Seconded (Saliba-Malouf), and was unanimously approved.

Commissioner Knutzen pointed out that the Committee would be recruiting for new members.

e) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

1. Report from the Committee meeting of December 16, 1998 and of January 20, 1999
Commissioner Dimapilis reported that on the December 16, 1998 meeting, the Committee heard a presentation from Veronica Ng on the new Chapter 12D Rules and Regulations. Ms. Ng highlighted the important changes to the Ordinance. Commissioner Dimapilis stated that change orders are also included in the new Ordinance to ensure that the Ordinance is not being circumvented. She pointed out that the Committee discussed the Citywide Tracking System proposed to oversee the new Ordinance. One Committee member requested a better tracking of Good Faith Efforts because it was believed that prime contractors circumvented the 12D Ordinance.
Commissioner Dimapilis stated that the Committee heard a presentation from Preston Tom on the Giants Ballpark Annual Report. She also noted that Romulus Asenloo presented an update on Certification.

Commissioner Dimapilis reported that on the January 20, 1999 meeting, the Committee Chair requested reports from the Task Forces. She noted that Todd Lewis reported on the Prompt Payment Task Force. She stated that the prompt payment issue at the Airport has become extremely difficult. Commissioner Dimapilis stated that Darlene Mar reported on the 12D Rules and Regulation Task Force. She stated that the Task Force would be discussing the rules and regulations page by page. She pointed out that the Committee would be holding a retreat to discuss goals for the upcoming year.

Commissioner Marshall pointed out that he would be discussing the issue of prompt payment when he meets with John Martin, Airport Director. Commissioner Marshall noted that he hope to work out a solution on the prompt payment issue after his meeting with Mr. Martin.

GENERAL DISCUSSION REGARDING GRIEVANCE
AND CIVIL SERVICE PROCEDURES

Director Bamba noted that HRC has relied on Deputy City Attorney Martin Gran's legal counsel and assistance.

Martin Gran pointed out that he would be providing a broad overview of the way labor relations work for the City and the relationship of labor contracts with the different unions. Mr. Gran noted that in the Charter, Section A 8.409-3, sets out a distinction between subjects and between the scope of representation that can be bargained with the union e.g., hours, wages, overtime provisions and other provisions. He stated that the same statute

restricts to the exclusive jurisdiction of the Civil Service Commission regarding appointments, development of the eligible list or/and merit system.

Mr. Gran pointed out that what the City Attorney's O addresses alleged violations of labor contract or the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), which are the contract negotiation with different unions. The general steps to the grievance process starts out at the employee/supervisors' level, then to the department head level and then goes to Employee Relations Department. If it goes further, the final step would be to go to the final and binding Arbitration. He stated that the grounds for appealing the case's decision at the Arbitration level is almost impossible.

Mr. Gran noted that in the process involving merit system, appointment system and/or eligible list, etc., complaints about discriminations in this process need to be directed to the Civil Service Commission and their designated agent and to Department of Human Resources (HRD) for investigation. He explained that DHR could appoint their own hearing officers at their discretion. He noted that there are different avenues for different grievance. Mr. Gran stated that as a litigator, he reviews the personnel action. In a disciplinary case, he would look at the evidence, what are the theory of the case, what are the contract violation, what is the bargaining history behind the provision and come up with the same analysis and conclusion. He added that he also looks at the timeliness of the grievance, who the witnesses are and how were the other employees were treated in the past. All the facts are analyze and decisions are made to settle or to go forward.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson commented that it was good to know that Mr. Gran's advice and counsel to the Director on different issues had been very helpful, and would like to continue his services. Commissioner Herman requested for clarity on the process for certification and eligible list. Commissioner Knutzen specifically asked to clarify the "Rule of the List." Mr. Gran stated that the department could choose to go to the Rule of the List when appointing eligible names; however, he requested that a representative of the Civil Service Commission present the process to the Commission or have the attorney assigned to the Civil Service Commission discuss the issue with the Commission.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

There was no unfinished business.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS
TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Marshall asked the other Commissioner to review the report prepared by Emil DeGuzman on the Glenridge Apartment involving a hangman's noose. He asked for this issue to be agendized for the next Commission meeting for discussion.

CLOSED SESSION

Closed session would be reagendized for the next HRC meeting.

Conference with Legal Counsel
Existing Litigation: ABB-Daimler Benz Transportation, Inc. v. City and County of San Francisco (pursuant to Brown Act Section 54956.9(a) and the Sunshine Ordinance Section 67.11)

1. Vote on whether or not to enter into closed session with counsel
2. Vote on whether or not to disclose discussion held in closed session

PUBLIC COMMENTS ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO
THE CLOSED SESSION

There were no public comments.

CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957

AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b).

Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

***Moved (Dimapilis), Seconded (Chey) and was unanimously voted to go into a closed session.

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION

1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a).)

***Moved (Marshall), Seconded (Saliba-Malouf) and was unanimously voted not to discuss the closed session.

ADJOURNMENT

Commission Chair Comer Marshall adjourned the meeting at 7:20 p.m. in honor of Rabbi Alvin Fine, who was one of the Bay Area's highly regarded clergymen and a former Human Rights Commissioner.

NEXT MEETING

DATE:Thursday, February 11, 1998
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Mercy Gharechedaghy
Executive Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

SFGOV san francisco GOVERNMENT
sfgov | citizen | business | government | visitor | online services | search
go !
Human Rights Commission >> Commission >> Meeting Information >> Archive Index >> Archive

City and County of San Francisco
Human Rights Commission

February 11, 1999

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Comer Marshall, Chair	Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Agar Jaicks
Shirley Dimapilis	Martha Knutzen
Julia Globus-Sabori	Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Stephen Herman	Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
Mercy Gharechedaghy
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS
The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART and Metro stations are the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48 hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2-508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE
Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist

to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

A G E N D A

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
a. Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of January 28, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

4. COALITION FOR ECONOMIC EQUITY REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION OF CHAPTER 12D - Aileen Hernandez

5. MUNICIPAL INVESTMENT PLAN - Kevin Williams

6. PUBLIC COMMENTS

7. REPORT OF THE CHAIR
a. Individual Commissioners Report on their activities in the Community

8. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR
a. HRC Program Unit Activities
1. Budget
2. Appeal Process
- Condon Johnson
- Liberty Builders
3. American Airlines Complaint Update

9. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Recommendation to adopt the Commission on the Status of Women's Report and recommendation on "Violence Against Women in Prostitution in San Francisco"
2. Report from the Committee meeting of February 1, 1999, including a status report on the Public Accommodations/Retail discrimination project including a public hearing

NOTE: The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be on March 1, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

b) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. Acceptance of Report: Workforce Analysis of Construction Workers in the Mayor's Office of Housing Projects - James Fields, Contract Compliance Officer
2. Adoption of Proposal for Expansion of Architecture & Engineering (A&E) Trainee Program
3. Report on the Employment Committee Meeting of February 4, 1999

NOTE: The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, March 4, 1999, at 12:00 Noon. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

c) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diane Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: The next meeting of the Youth and Education Commit-tee will be held on Thursday, February 18, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francis-co, CA 94102

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Commit-tee will be held on Tuesday, February 16, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at The Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francis-co, CA 94102.

e) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Comer Marshall, Chair
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will be held on Wednesday, February 17, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

10. UNFINISHED BUSINESS
1. Glenridge Apartment - Hangman's Noose Incident

11. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

12. CLOSED SESSION

Conference with Legal Counsel
Existing Litigation: ABB-Daimler Benz Transportation, Inc. v. City and County of San Francisco (pursuant to Brown Act Section 54956.9(a) and the Sunshine Ordinance Section 67.11)

1. Vote on whether or not to enter into close session with counsel
2. Vote on whether or not to disclose discussion held in closed session

13. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b):

Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

14. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a).)
2. Public comments pertaining to the closed sessions.

15. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 25, 1999

contact us | accessibility policy | disclaimer | privacy policy

Copyright © 2003 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

F.
80
2
/99

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 12 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF FEBRUARY 11, 1999

Commission Chair Comer Marshall called the meeting to order at 4:35p.m. Commissioner Marshall welcomed everyone to the Commission meeting and thanked everyone for coming.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present:Comer Marshall, Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair; Shirley Dimapilis, Julia Globus-Sabori, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, Martha Knutzen, Antonio Salazar-Hobson and Alan Watahara

Excused:Youn Chey

HRC Staff
Present:Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin, James Fields, Emil De Guzman, Don Hesse, Mercy Gharechedaghy, Gail Roberts, Melinda Wesley, HRC Intern and Kevin Williams

Guests
Present:John Kennedy, Deputy City Attorney; Kevin Buggy, Richard Koch, Lori Nainme, Ed Lee, Director – Purchasing; Laura Desert Rain, Chandra Redack, Nedra Ruiz, Oren Sellstrom, SF Lawyers' Committee on Civil Rights; John Siracusa, Reggie Smith, District Attorney's Office; Rachel West, US Prostitutes Collective; Harold Yee and Lawrence Yuen

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Commissioner Marshall noted that Commissioner Knutzen's name should be added to the committee that reviews the Human Rights Commission policies and procedures. The Committee members are Commissioners Marshall, Saliba-Malouf, Knutzen and Director Bamba. The minutes of the Commission meeting of January 28, 1999 were unanimously approved with the changes. ***Moved (Marshall), Seconded (Dimapilis).

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communications file was circulated.

COALITION FOR ECONOMIC EQUITY REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION OF CHAPTER 12D

Oren Sellstrom thanked the Commission for having the MBE/WBE/LBE Chapter 12D Ordinance reauthorized. Mr. Sellstrom related that he was speaking on the implementation of the Ordinance. He noted that the Coalition had proposed timelines to be incorporated into the Ordinance. He requested status report on what have occurred already according to the 12D Ordinance. As example, he cited data collecting from subcontractors with the Controller's Office withholding payment if appropriate data was not provided. Had the data has been collected and was Controller's Office doing its part? He suggested that a representative from the Controller's Office be invited to speak on the issue. Mr. Sellstrom observed that the Coalition had requested audits of seven joint ventures. The Commission is due to report to the Board of Supervisors, on March 1, 1999, the data that has been collected and their recommendations on what needs to be done. This report is essential for keeping the ordinance on track, will benefit the MBE/WBE and keep the Ordinance legally sound.

Director Bamba thanking Mr. Sellstrom for his input, agreed that it would be very challenging given the prior limitations with the data. Director Bamba pointed out that HRC is working on a citywide diversity tracking system. She noted that on the February 25, 1999, Commission meeting, she would be presenting a thorough report on the status of the Ordinance. She requested that the Coalition attend this meeting. Director Bamba stated that Zula Jones and Virginia Harmon, with DTIS have been training departments on the tracking system. Commissioner Knutzen requested that the presentation address all the issues that the Coalition raised.

Harold Yee observed that the new Ordinance was a vast improvement from the prior Ordinance, relating that all stakeholders have benefited. The new legislation involves the Commission in the appeals process and it calls for a committee to view and make judgment on set aside requests by departments. According to Mr. Yee, auditing is imperative to maintaining the integrity of the program and a fiscal requirement for measuring the dollars awarded, including auditing contractors to determine that the data was correct. The new Ordinance identifies who is responsible for departments reaching their goals. He urged that HRC take the lead until parity has been reached. Commissioner Knutzen reiterated that the presentation to the Commission should address these issues.

MUNICIPAL COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT PROGRAM

Kevin Williams gave a status report on the Municipal Community Reinvestment (CMR) Program. Mr. Williams introduced Melinda Wesley, a New College Law School intern, who gave the background of the Program. Purchaser Ed Lee, former HRC Director, was to present more information on the Program and would answer questions at the end of the presentation.

Ms. Wesley explained that the Municipal Community Reinvestment Program was adopted on June 16, 1997. Prior to that, HRC's MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee established a Task Force comprising of Dawn Clements, Chair; Darlene Mar and Tony Ruiz. Ms. Wesley expressed gratitude on behalf of the Commission, for the work of the Task Force, and in the Advisory Committee's diligent and history making efforts towards establishing a new Ordinance with a mission to eliminate discrimination and illuminate new growth potential for small businesses in San Francisco. Ms. Wesley related that the purpose of the Task Force was to review the draft proposal and make appropriate recommendations. MCR architects, Kevin Williams and Ed Lee incorporated the Task Force recommendations before being presented to the full Commission. She observed that recommendations made by Ms. Clements and Ms. Mar were as follows:

Proposing a collaboration with participant banks within San Francisco
Proposing three important elements:
1. creation of a way to get capital into the business community
2. creation of an effective monitoring element to ensure accountability of all interested parties of the loan
3. the need to create a multi-level program for credit expansion

Ms. Wesley related the Commission that a resolution is being considered for approval and recommendations to the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors, establishing a Municipal Community Reinvestment Ordinance to ensure that all citizens of the City and County of San Francisco are given equal business opportunities. Kevin Williams introduced Ed Lee, Director of Purchasing who has been instrumental in the effort and speaks on the main elements of the Municipal Community Reinvestment.

Ed Lee explained that one of the goals was to establish a simple plan with existing resources. The key was to take a look at the unmet needs of minority and women owned businesses and unfulfilled obligations, particularly with the financial institutions that have Community Reinvestment Act obligations. According to Mr. Lee a plan will fill in the existing gaps. The first step is establishing an adequate reporting mechanism and assisting participating banks in meeting the CRA responsibilities of federal regulators. The greatest challenge of the program is to have the MBE/WBE match with City projects for the City to act as an additional guarantor of the bank's money. Mr. Lee stated that the process is not different from the way the bond assistance program works.

Mr. Lee explained how the organizational chart was designed. The City's MCRA Loan Committee evaluates how the money is to be used. The Mayor and the Board of Supervisor's input are extremely important. Mr. Lee pointed out that the loan committee is most important because it is the ultimate decision-maker of how the money is going to be used, in partnership with City departments who have experience in lending money and whose public projects have the greatest opportunities.

In answering Commissioner Jaicks' question, Mr. Lee stated that in any particular project the loan committee would review the one with the greatest financial stake and would receive the loan. Commissioner Herman

questioned if the SF Community College District was represented on the Board because the College has many vendors and works with many businesses. Mr. Lee welcomed the inquiry. Commissioner Herman explained that the College is in the process of developing an MBE/WBE program. Commissioner Knutzen noted that the program is an opportunity to create new models for outreaching to different communities. She requested that outreach be passed on to the appropriate Commissions. According to Mr. Lee, the HRC would be reviewing the Program before it is adopted. Commissioner Jaicks asked if there was any opposition to the Program. Mr. Lee stated that there has been no opposition; however, he stated that there has been a question whether it can work and whether the financial institutions would buy into it.

Mr. Williams concluded that the resolution before the Commission was for their review and adoption at the next Commission meeting. Commission Chair Marshall thanked Mr. Williams for the presentation and commended the team for their efforts and dedication for the Program.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were no public comments. Commissioner Jaicks pointed out that there would be public comments under the Issues Committee report.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

a) Individual Commissioners' Reports on their activities in the Community
Commissioner Herman reported that he attended an art exhibit opening called, "Winter Expressionist", along with other Commissioners and Director Bamba. He stated that it was a wonderful exhibit and invited others to see it.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

Disability Awareness Day
Director Bamba reported that she was invited, along with ten other participants, to utilize a manual wheelchair for the day observing that it was an incredible experience. Supervisor Leno had observed that non-disabled people do not notice issues of access. Director Bamba related that they could not get into doors that were supposed to be accessible and they could not see signs at their wheelchair level. The Program was sponsored by the FDR Democratic Club and coordinated by August Longo and Jose Caedo. She commended Jose Caedo and the FDR Democratic Club for their efforts.

Tracking System
Director Bamba related that Zula Jones and Virginia Harmon have been training different departments on the tracking system. DTIS has been very helpful in technological issues. Director Bamba would be presenting the tracking system at the next Commission meeting.

Budget
Director Bamba reported that she met with Commissioners Herman and Jaicks and HRC staff Joyce Smith discussed the budget for the next fiscal year, reviewing the preliminary requests. They have not finish negotiating with other departments and are finalizing the work orders. The Director explained that, on February 19, 1999, she would have a final estimate as to how much HRC would be proposing for the budget. She highlighted some of the request:

Additional staff at PUC and at the Airport
Additional funds for staff training for career and staff development
Funds for the Quarterly Newsletter
Additional new equipment for upgrading the computers to accommodate the new system
Funds for the new diversity tracking system. DTIS have submitted their cost estimate to HRC
Funds to upgrade to a digital telephone system
To abolish one Coordinator positions and upgrade to a Sr. Contract Compliance Officer. This would be Larry Brinkin's position whose Unit and responsibilities have expanded.

Director Bamba reminded the Commission that the current baseline is 4 million dollars. The budget would be submitted to the Commission on February 25, 1999 for adoption.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf inquired if the citywide program for Architecture and Engineers were part of the proposal. It requires one additional HRC staff. Director Bamba stated that this has not been included, but she would follow up on this matter. The Director thanked Joyce Smith and Arcedo Brillantes for their work.

Appeal Process
Don Hesse gave an overview on the appeal process. The Commission Chair appoints the hearing officer who becomes the Commission's representative. Mr. Hesse noted that the hearing officer would act as a judge, call the parties together and facilitate negotiations when possible. The hearing officer could not engage in exparte communications and would conduct an impartial hearing. A written transcript would be made of he entire hearing by a stenographer and all of the testimony and exhibits would be collected to prepare the findings and recommendation. The findings and recommendation would then be sent out to all parties and forwarded to the Commission by the Hearing Officer. The Commission would be the final decision-maker after all documents and recommendations have been reviewed.

Commissioner Herman inquired on what limits the Commission has in upholding or denying a finding and determining the penalty. Director Bamba stated that part of it should be to discuss with the awarding authority what are the ramifications. Mr. Hesse noted that the Commission's decision is final, and appealable only through the courts. He pointed out that for purposes of an appeal, the Commission would be separate from the Director. Commissioner Knutzen requested to receive a comprehensive list of the procedure process and remedies. Commissioner Watahara requested for HRC staff to give notice to the public to educate them and address issues on public documents, press releases and procedures. Commissioner Marshall pointed out that the Liberty Builders and Condom Johnson appeal hearing is being scheduled.

American Airlines
Director Bamba reported that she met with Lawrence Yuen and Kevin Buggy to discuss their concerns. They provided her with more information on their case. She would have a staff in Larry Brinkin's Unit assist them in dealing with their issues. The Director related that they may mediate after she reviews the information and comes to a conclusion.

Mary Ratcliff stated that Liberty Builders have many questions regarding the appeal process. They are not aware of any details of the appeal and that they would like to prepare for it. She noted that Liberty Builders' case to the old Ordinance and encouraged the Commission to familiarize themselves with the specifics of their case. She expressed concern that some of the timelines were not being met by HRC. She requested that the Commission provide an attorney for Liberty Builders. Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel has rejected their request. Ms. Ratcliff related that they have not received all the documents that they have requested from HRC. Commissioner Marshall stated that he would look into it.

Lawrence Yuen related that he and Kevin Buggy met with the Director. He thanked the Director and the Commission for the time given to discuss their issue. Kevin Buggy requested a proper investigation of their case. John Siracusa requested that the investigator assigned to their case talk to them and to talk to American Airlines for information.

COMMITTEE REPORT

a) Issues Committee

1. Recommendation to adopt the Commission on the Status of Women's Report and recommendation on "Violence Against Women in Prostitution in San Francisco"

Commissioner Jaicks stated that the US Prostitutes Collective would be speaking on behalf of the action item being adopted before the Commission on violence against women in prostitution in San Francisco. He pointed out that Rachel West from the US Prostitutes Collective would speak on their issue. Rachel West related that they had come to the Issues Committee and the Commission for support for their petition. Ms. West noted that what was on the Agenda, was not what they came for, it is only part of the issue. She was of the opinion that the Issues Committee had bypassed their concerns. The US Prostitutes Collective support the report by the Commission on the Status of Women. Their specific concern was for the Commission to support their petition on the implementation of the recommendations of the Task Force on Prostitution. She related that the Issues Committee informed them that HRC cannot take a position on repressive laws. She requested that HRC should take a stand on repressive laws. Ms. West stated that the way the enforcement of the prostitution laws are being carried out violates people's life everyday, and that the women are not being protected from rape and violence. Ms. West

requested the Commission to take a lead in supporting decriminalization and an end to discriminatory laws.

Commissioner Jaicks stated that he strongly supports the decriminalization of prostitution; however, the petition calls for no restriction and ignores state laws. According to Commissioner Jaicks, the Commission on the Status of Women also support decriminalization and has written an addendum with an alternative to the petition. Commissioner Jaicks requested for the Commission to endorse the recommendations of the Commission on the Status of Women's report along with the addendum of decriminalization of prostitution.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson expressed concern about the addendum because he does not know exactly what it would do to the decriminalization of prostitution. He requested to abstain from the vote if both documents are included for adoption. He would like to review the addendum on decriminalization before he votes for it. Commissioner Knutzen inquired if the addendum was properly noticed. Commissioner Globus-Sabori stated that she was concerned about the miscommunication with the public and the Commission. She added that she was concerned because of the confusion amongst the Commissioners. She noted that the Commission should give respect to the issue on hand, like all issues that come before the Commission. Ms. West clarified that the addendum was not a separate report, it is a supplemental to the Task Force report on decriminalization of prostitution. The petition was launched by the US Prostitutes Collective to press for implementation of the City's Task Force recommendations. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson would like to have the chance to study the addendum before he votes on it and asked that it be brought back to the next meeting. Commissioner Jaicks withdrew his motion for approval of the addendum to the Status of Women report until the next Commission meeting ***Moved (Jaicks), Seconded (Saliba-Malouf).

Reginald Smith from the District Attorney's Office noted that they share Ms. West's concerns about sex workers being treated as second class citizens. He noted that Mr. Hallinan was the sponsor of the Task Force when he was a Supervisor. Mr. Hallinan is very concerned about the issue of prostitutes not being protected from rape and violence and which is a personal concern to him. The District Attorney's Office was willing to work with the US Prostitutes Collective and other groups supporting the issue.

Richard Koch represents the National Lawyers' Guild which was part of the Task Force particularly in the issues of juvenile, mental health and criminal courts. Mr. Koch pointed out that many of those arrested in San Francisco are under the Municipal Code and much can be done locally in terms of decriminalization. Mr. Koch noted that the National Lawyers' Guild firmly believes that the laws criminalizing prostitution violate basic civil and human rights. He requested the Commission to approve the original committee recommendations that endorses the petition of the US Prostitute Collective. He noted that this issue was an issue of violence which he sees in his daily practice of law.

Laura Desert Rain explained that she sees many prostitution activity in her neighborhood. The women are harassed, beaten and they cannot do anything. Ms. Desert Rain urged the Commission to endorse the report.

Lori Nainme related that she works for Wages for Lesbians who were very involved with the Task Force. Ms. Nainme informed the Commission that the report was brilliant and addresses the question of zoning. She urged the support for the petition.

Commissioner Herman thanked the speakers and noted that he may not be at the next meeting; however, he would like the Commission to know that he support the decriminalization of prostitution.

Chandra Redak commented on an article in the SF Weekly accusing Mr. Hallinan of collecting payments from prostitutes to keep their prostitution arrest from being prosecuted. Ms. Redak believesd that her human rights have been violated by the SF Police Department because she was proposition by a plain clothes police officer to engage in a sexual act of prostitution. Ms. Redak was of the opinion that people of color are particularly singled out for harassment and arrest.

Nedra Ruiz, a criminal law practitioneer from San Francisco, urged the Commission to adopt, support and endorse the recommendations of the SF Task Force on prostitution and the US Prostitution Collective petition. Ms. Ruiz pointed out that "respect for the rule of the law" in San Francisco is being degraded because of the corruption of police dealings with sex workers and prostitute women. Ms. Ruiz stressed that the police are prejudiced against sex workers and reports have shown that there are corruption, extortion and intimidation going on. She urged the Commission to adopt the reports before them.

2. Report from the Committee meeting of February 1, 1999, including a status report on the Public Accomodations/Retail discrimination project including a public hearing

Don Hesse related that he met with Eva Patterson from the Lawyer's Committee and concluded that there are serious discrimination problems in the public accommodations area that need to be addressed. Mr. Hesse stated that a Task Force was formed and has met four times to discuss the issues. The Task Force is made up of HRC, ACLU, Asian Law Caucus, the Employment Law Center and Private Bar Association. He noted that both District Attorney and City Attorney's Office have provided representatives and would provide resources to address the issue. Mr. Hesse related that a newly created organization doing testing on employment discrimination has agreed to add testing on public accommodations to their program. Mr. Hesse informed the Commission that the Issues Committee is planning to hold a public hearing on retail discrimination/public accommodation in San Francisco. He stated that one goal is the hearing would be to educate the public and retailers.

Commissioner Jaicks noted that Mr. Hesse was the initiator of this issue and comended him for all his work. Commissioner Knutzen inquired if there have been complaints received from women. Mr. Hesse stated that complaints received from women are usually based on race or national origin. Commissioner Knutzen would like Mr. Hesse to look further into the area and conduct outreach to gather information.

b. Employment Committee

1. Acceptance of Report: Workforce Analysis of Construction Workers in the Mayor's Office of Housing Projects – James Fields, Contract Compliance Officer

James Fields reported on the Mayor's Office of Housing projects. Mr. Fields stated that the MOH makes application for Federal Housing and Urban Development (HUD) funds. He stated that non-federal locally administered funds by MOH are tax increment funds and hotel tax fund. Mr. Fields related that construction workers on all MOH contracts must be paid according to federal or state prevailing wage requirements. HUD Section 3 hiring requirements are enforced on all MOH contracts over $2000,000. Mr. Fields stated hat the Geneva Towers Housing Project had been demolished and replaced by two $25 million dollar replacement construction projects. Aman Environmental Construction, who was awarded by HRC for "Best Performing Contractor", was awarded the demolition and was funded by HUD. The contract required 30% resident hiring. Aman Construction hired and trained former Geneva Towers' residents on the project.

2. Adoption of Proposal for Expansion of Architecture & Engineering (A&E) Trainee Program

Gail Roberts reported that the Employment Committee, at its meeting of February 4, 1999, approved, in principle, the proposal for expansion of the Architectural & Engineering Trainee Program. This proposal was presented by Panetta Scott and Gail Roberts. Changes suggested by Committee member Greg Marutani were incorporated into the proposal. Ms. Roberts noted that the Executive Director had suggested that members consider the expansion of the A&E Trainee Program beyond the SF International Airport to include other departments. The following are suggestions for the proposal.

It is proposed that the database that include all architectural and engineering contracts be identified by the contracting awarding department. The database maintained by PIC on all of the participants enrolled in any of its programs may be modified to accommodate the HRC data.

It is proposed tha a Skills Bank be established in consultation with the identified training institutions and PIC training programs. Under this proposal, the Contract Compliance Officer is to notify the A&E Trainee Program Representative when an A&E project is in the planning stages in order to coordinate with training programs to ensure the availability of trainees.

Ms. Roberts noted that currently HRC staff monitors the A&E Trainee Program at the SF International Airport. The two other departments that currently award a significant number of architectural and engineering contracts, are the Department of Public Works (DPW) and the Public Utilities Commission (PUC). The Port Commission A&E contracts are handled "in house." The current program at the SF International Airport would be incorporated into the overall program.

Ms. Roberts pointed out that copies of the A&E Training Guidelines are to be circlated to Community Based Organizations (CBOs) to enable them to recruit and identify potential trainees. HRC will identify the job categories most frequently used in order that PIC's training programs could be tailored to meet these needs. ***Moved (Saliba-Malouf), Seconded (Dimapilis), and the Proposal for expansion of the A&E Trainee Program was unanimously adopted.

3. Report on the Employment Committee Meeting of February 4, 1999

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf reported that, at the last Committee meeting, the Committee determined its projects and issues for the year and would be establishing task forces. The priorities identified are: 1. "The Unfinished Agenda", the Economic Status of African Americans in San Francisco issued by the Committee on African American Parity of the Human Rights Commission; 2. Airport; 3. Pacific Bell Ball Park construction; 4. Professional Services/A&E; and 5. First Source Hiring. Commissioner Saliba -Malouf stated that the Committee approved the proposal for expansion of the A&E Trainee Program citywide. The Committee heard a follow up report from Preston Tom on the Pacific Bell Ballpark Construction Project in Diversity. They would be meeting the representatives of the Ballpark and CBOs on March 8, 1999. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf pointed out that the Committee would hold a public hearing on updating goals for the A&E Program on March 4, 1999 meeting. The Committee will welcome Pansy Waller, who would be assuming Gail Roberts' responsibilities upon her retirement.

c. Youth and Education Committee

1. No Report from the Committee

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgendered Advisory Committee

1. No Report from the Committee

e) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

1. No Report from the Committee

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

1. Glenridge Apartment – Hangman's Noose Incident

Emil De Guzman reported on the Glenridge Apartment involving a hangman's noose. Mr. De Guzman related that the Glenridge Apartment complex is located in the Diamond Heights district in San Francisco, which is a cooperatively owned residence. A.H. Evans Company manages the property. Mr. De Guzman stated that since the November 24, 1998 SF Examiner article on the noose was written, a half dozen complaints by the resident-owners have been submitted to the Commission. The resident-owners and employees charge A.F. Evans Co. with unfair treatment and employment discrimination. Mr. De Guzman pointed out that the controversy began in February 1998, when a noose was hung from a ceiling and the management did not take any action to punish the person responsible for the action. He stated that two African American employees have filed a lawsuit with one Latina employee adding her name later in the year. She has also filed a complaint of racial discrimination and sexual harassment with the HRC. Mr. De Guzman related that he was working with HUD's Fair Housing unit and Asset Manager, plus the US Department of Justice (DOJ) regarding this matter. Discussions with the DOJ community relation official to jointly investigate and monitor the racial discrimination issues have begun. He noted that he would attempt to interview the two African American employees, one who has since left employment Mr. De Guzman pointed out that the investigation will be conducted by the HRC fair housing unit to focus on the racial discrimination issues at the Glenridge Apartments. When asked by the member of the commission about what is the objective of this complaint, he responded it is to look into the allegations of racial discrimination.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS
TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Knutzen stated that she would be bringing a letter to the Commission to approve regarding a recent derogatory ad from the 24 Hour Fitness regarding fat people. Commissioner Knutzen stated that the billboard has a picture of a space alien and states, "When we come, we'll eat the fat ones first." She requested that this issue be agendized for the next Commission meeting. Commissioner Herman reported that a manager harassed a gentleman who wanted to sell beer called "Q Beer" at a local Safeway on Market Street. He was informed that the store could not sell products that pertain to the "gay lifestyle." He believes that there may be other incidents of this type that have happened at this particular Safeway store. Commissioner Marshall suggested bringing this issue to the LGBT Committee to look into the matter further.

CLOSED SESSION

Conference with Legal Counsel
Existing Litigation: ABB-Daimler Benz Transportation, Inc. v. City and County of San Francisco (pursuant to Brown Act Section 54956.9(a) and the Sunshine Ordinance Section 67.11)

1. Vote on whether or not to enter into closed session with counsel
2. Vote on whether or not to disclose discussion held in closed session

A motion was approved to enter into a closed session. ***Moved (Saliba-Malouf), Seconded (Dimapilis), which was unanimously accepted.

CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957
AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b).

Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION

1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a).)

***Moved (Marshall), Seconded (Saliba-Malouf) and was unanimously voted not to discuss the closed session.

2. Public comments pertaining to the closed sessions.

There were no public comments.

ADJOURNMENT

Commission Chair Comer Marshall adjourned the meeting at 8:30 p.m

NEXT MEETING
TIME: 4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

DATE: Thursday, February 25, 1999

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Mercy Gharechedaghy
Executive Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

80
F
80
1
1/25/99

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

FEB 2 2 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 25, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Comer Marshall, Chair	Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Agar Jaicks
Shirley Dimapilis	Martha Knutzen
Julia Globus-Sabori	Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Stephen Herman	Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
Mercy Gharechedaghy
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART and Metro stations are the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48 hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.sfhumanrights.org.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   a. Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of February 11, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

4. LETTER TO 24 HR FITNESS AND BOARD OF SUPERVISORS RE: RECENT AD CAMPAIGN – Commissioner Knutzen

5. APPROVAL OF COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT RESOLUTION – Kevin Williams

6. PUBLIC COMMENTS

7. REPORT OF THE CHAIR
   a. Individual Commissioners Report on their activities in the Community

8. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a. HRC Program Unit Activities
   1. Approval of HRC Budget – FY 99-00
   2. Report on MBE/WBE Annual Report
   3. Report on Joint Venture
   4. Implementation and Status of 12D Ordinance
   5. Update on American Airlines complaint

9. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Youth and Education Committee

Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diane Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report on the Committee meeting of February 18, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will be held on Thursday, March 18, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee

Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee meeting of February 16, 1999
2. Approval of letter expressing concern regarding a recent event at The Stud/Trannyshack which has been alleged to be anti-Latino
3. Approval of letters to Supervisor Tom Ammiano, Juanita Owens and Lawrence Wong noting the historic occasion of the presidencies of three bodies in San Francisco held by members of the lesbian gay bisexual transgender communities
4. Approval of letter to Safeway expressing concern regarding alleged homophobia at the Market & Church store
5. Approval of letter commending the 95 United Methodist ministers who supported the lesbian union ceremony in Sacramento

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will be held on Tuesday, March 16, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at The Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

c) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

Commissioner Comer Marshall, Chair
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee meeting of February 17, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will be held on Wednesday, March 17, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

d) Issues Committee

Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be on March 1, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102*

e) Employment Committee

Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, March 4, 1999, at 12:00 Noon. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

10. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

11. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

12. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, MARCH 11, 1999

a:\agenda 2/25/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 1 2 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF FEBRUARY 25, 1999

Commission Chair Comer Marshall called the meeting to order at 4:38p.m. Commissioner Marshall welcomed everyone to the Commission meeting and thanked everyone for coming.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Present:Comer Marshall, Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair; Youn Chey, Shirley Dimapilis, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, Martha Knutzen, and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

Excused:Julia Globus-Sabori and Alan Watahara

HRC Staff
Present. Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Romulos Asenloo, Larry Brinkin, Mercy Gharechedaghy, Virginia Harmon, Don Hesse, Zula Jones, Veronica Ng, Gail Roberts, Joyce Smith and Kevin Williams

Guests
Present: Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Lori Aviles, Kevin Buggy, Stanley Chan, Robert Chou, Leo Choy, Florencia Clarke, Carole Cullum, Toby Edison, Toni Fazio, Bill Greene, Aileen Hernandez, Coalition for Economic Equity; Sam Kwong, Mike Leong, Oren Sellstrom, SF Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights; King Shen, Sondra Solovay, Marilyn Wann, Frances White, Edmond Yip and Lawrence Yuen

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Commissioner Jaicks charged that the Commission had
endorsed the recommendations of the Commission on the
Status of Women's Report. Further, the addendum to that Report was referred back to the Issues Committee for its consideration. The minutes of the Commission meeting of February 11, 1999 were unanimously approved with the changes. ***Moved (Jaicks), Seconded (Dimapilis).

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communications file was circulated.

LETTER TO 24 HR FITNESS AND BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
RE: RECENT AD CAMPAIGN

Commissioner Knutzen related that the letter to 24-Hour Fitness regarding fat people is before them for approval. The letter is regarding a recent derogatory ad on a billboard that has a picture of a space alien and states, When we come, we'll eat the fat ones first." Commissioner
Knutzen related that the billboard targeted people for their appearance. Members of the Commission approved the letter, which would be sent to the president of the 24-Hour Fitness and the Board of Supervisors.

In response to Commissioner Knutzen, Director Bamba stated that HRC is in receipt of a formal letter from Gloria Young, Clerk of the Board, asking HRC to determine whether it is appropriate or possible to include "weight" in definition of protective class. The Director added that Louise Renne, City Attorney, has also been asked to join

HRC in this effort. She noted that consistent with the process, a hearing would be held either under the full Commission or under the Issues Committee. Director Bamba requested to calendar the issue to a future Commission meeting.

Marilyn Wann stated that she was proud to be speaking to the Commission regarding the many stereotypes about fat people. Ms. Wann stated that she eats right, exercises with a personal trainer, has a normal blood pressure, and does not smoke; she believes that she is healthy. She pointed out that health is a 40 billion dollar a year industry. Health does not depend on the number on the scale, but how one lives. Ms. Wann stated that going to a gym is unwelcoming and scary for fat people. She pointed out that research done by the Cooper Institute for Aerobics Research found out that fat people who exercise are healthier and live longer than thin people who do not exercise. Ms. Wann stated that she was thrilled that the Human Rights Commission is taking an interest in this issue.

Frances White stated that she serves on the Board of the National Association to Advance Fat Acceptance. Ms. White related that, as a San Francisco resident, the billboard affected her personally. It is her opinion, the billboard is separating fat people from society based on appearance and suggests that it is okay that "they" disappear from the face of the earth. She noted that the environment is possible for hate crimes. Ms. White related that she was upset by the fact that people make assumptions about health based on appearance which she believes is discriminatory. Ms. White stated that she has lost jobs because of her weight. She informed the Commission that she was delighted to hear of the billboard's removal and also delighted with the idea of adding size to the protective class in the Ordinance.

Toby Edison pointed out that seeing the billboard appalled her. Ms. Edison stated that the primary target was to terrify fat woman, especially school age children. Ms. Edison noted that there is a constant obsession about size and weight. She was delighted that the Commission is taking the size discrimination issue into a larger hearing.

Toni Fazio related that her personal experience with discrimination is the stereotype that fat people are stupid. She pointed out that she lost a job in the medical field because of her body size. Ms. Fazio stated that as a mother, she would not want her daughters to go through what she has gone through.

Sondra Solovay stated that fat people suffer economically because of discrimination. Ms. Solovay showed an advertisement on a Blue Cross brochure/pamphlet for a special discount membership for 24-Hour Fitness to get shape and stay healthy program. She noted that a company who is hostile to fat people would not be able to offer the special discount to this class of people.

Carole Cullum stated that she is a fellow Commissioner serving the Board of Appeals as President. Ms. Cullum is also an attorney practicing in San Francisco specializing in family law. Ms. Cullum related that when she saw the billboard, it was clearly not to be tolerated. She pointed out that it was mean spirited and offensive. Ms. Cullum expressed that she was very glad to hear that the Human Rights Commission was writing the letter to the 24-Hour Fitness and that it was a good step in the direction of adding size discrimination to the Ordinance.

Commission Chair Marshall thanked all the speakers and reiterated that discrimination of any form cannot be condone. He stated that he was proud that Commissioner Knutzen brought the issue before the Commission for discussion. *** Moved (Knutzen), Seconded (Herman), and the letter was unanimously approved.

APPROVAL OF COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT RESOLUTION

Kevin Williams thanked the MBE Advisory Committee, and the support and active involvement that he received from HRC Director in moving the program forward. Mr. Williams thanked the Commissioners who gave their input and support in the Resolution. Commissioner Jaicks asked what would be the main source of the reinvestment. Mr. Williams explained that the sources already exist within the Mayor's Office of Community Development in collaboration with different banks. As Mr. Lee had informed the Commission, they do not want to "reinvent the wheel," the concept of connecting urban development through combining government resources with non-profit institutions. Commissioner Chey commented that the Program would certainly help the minority and the newly arrived immigrants who have difficulty in acquiring initial loans. She thanked Mr. Williams for a job well done. *** Moved (Chey), Seconded (Dimapilis), and was approved and accepted. Mr. Williams read the Resolution into the record. Commission Chair
Marshall thanked Mr. Williams for the presentation and commended the team for their efforts and dedication to Program.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Florencia Clarke related that she had personal concerns about her family. She believes that she has been discriminated in all aspects of her life and would like the Human Rights Commission to help her. Director Bamba requested that Don Hesse speak to Ms. Clarke.

Aileen Hernandez from the Coalition of Economic Equity requested that HRC look into the impact on the extension of the labor agreement with respect to Chapter 12D and 12B. Ms. Hernandez reminded the Commission of the problem that occurred at the Airport. She stated that the Coalition had predicted what would happen, noting that 90% of the workforce are non San Francisco residents. Ms. Hernandez related that the Coalition is concerned about the contracting procedures because the statistical data given to them are unclear statistics, and are without merit. Ms. Hernandez requested under the Ordinance, an analysis of the legislation and that it be presented publicly. Ms. Hernandez also requested a timeline of when the Coalition could get a response or a report. Director Bamba stated that the staff would provide the Coalition with recommendations on the issue and suggested discussing the matter further with the Employment Committee in order to obtain more testimonies. Ms. Hernandez made it clear that the Coalition is not opposing the organization of people into labor union.

Bill Greene reported back on the meeting he recently attended with Tutor Saliba. Mr. Greene informed the Commission that Mary Tramil attended the meeting with him; however, he was hoping to see Mr. Williams there as requested from the last time he spoke to the Commission. He informed the Commission that he was very upset because the meeting turned out to be what he expected, he stated that nothing was accomplished on the issues that he wanted to discuss with Tutor Saliba. Mr. Greene requested that the Mayor should address the Airport issues. Commissioner Marshall asked Mr. Williams to respond on the meeting that Mr. Greene attended.

Mr. Williams related that there was another meeting scheduled, which Tutor Saliba did not show up, noting that it had to be rescheduled. Mr. Williams informed the Commission that Ms. Tramil is doing an excellent job in Mr. Greene's case. Ms. Tramil has acquired some documents that are being investigated. He stated that his presence at the meeting would not have had any particular impact. Mr. Williams noted that Mr. Greene is now employed through Ms. Tramil's effort and they are working on getting Mr. Greene's back payments from the time he was let go from his contract to the present.

Commissioner Jaicks asked Mr. Greene if the Union was involved in his case. Mr. Greene stated that the Union was not involved because it was not in the Union's collective bargaining agreement to protect him from racism. He stated that the Union refused to represent him because it had no grounds to investigate. Commissioner Jaicks stated that the Commission has the subpoena power to bring all the parties together and bring closure to the issue.

Stanley Chan spoke on behalf of the Asian American Contractor Association (AACA) of the Labor Stabilization Agreement issue that would be passed to all the City Departments. He stated that his group is against it. Mr. related that they are in support of the decision of the Coalition for Economic Equity. He stated that if the Agreement passes, it would be detrimental to Asian and minority groups. Mr. Chan added that the passing would also impact the 12D Ordinance and would discourage many "mom and pops" contractors in San Francisco. Mr. Chan pointed out that the majority of their members are small contractors who would not have a chance to go into contracting. He asked for the record to show that there were twenty people present in opposition to the Labor Stabilization Agreement.

Lori Aviles informed the Commission that she is finally employed after she met with Jonnie Robinson and not after months of working with Mary Tramil, HRC Representative, at the Airport. She also noted that most of the workers at the Airport are not San Francisco residents.

Director Bamba clarified that HRC staff is not an employee referral service. There are community-based organizations (CBOs) that handles the job referrals and provide assistance.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

a) Individual Commissioners' Reports on their activities in the Community

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf reported that she attended the 26th Annual Arab Cultural Banquet, which was a success. She stated that Mayor Brown was also in attendance.

Commissioner Jaicks reported that the building of Mission Bay Campus' first building would begin in June, which is a $231 million dollar project. He stated that the University has designated an individual to sit on the Employment Committee and with the Chair's approval, the new member would be a voting member. Commissioner Jaicks stated that this particular member would be the liaison for HRC and the University's contract.

Commissioner Chey reported that she attended a Hoover Institution Breakfast Briefing Meeting. Nobel Laureati and Dr. Becker discussed the new and vital role that education is going to play in the twenty first century in an economy increasingly driven by human capital.

Commissioner Herman mentioned that on this particular evening the swearing in of Lawrence Wong, former HRC Commissioner and Dr. Anita Green, Vice President, Administrator of the SF Unified School District is being held the Community College.

Commissioner Marshall related that there have been numerous incidents of ethnic and sexual harassment and violence occurring in San Francisco. He asked the support of the other Commissioners to be more involved. He mentioned that Commissioner Jaicks is working on holding a hearing on this issue in conjunction with the school district and other agencies. Commissioner Marshall mentioned that he would like to hold a retreat for the Commissioners sometime in April.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

Implementation and Status of 12D Ordinance
Director Bamba presented a demonstration on the diversity tracking system, which is under the leadership of Zula Jones, Senior Contract Compliance Officer and Virginia Harmon, Contract Compliance Officer. She reported that the team has been conducting training for different departments and going over the new rules and regulations relative to the 12D Ordinance.

Director Bamba pointed out that the Supreme Court requires, as does 12D, that an evaluation take place on race and gender needs for the minority and women program. This is the reason why the diversity tracking system was designed. Ms. Jones and Ms. Harmon have been working with the Controller's Office and the Department of Telecommunications and Information Services (DTIS) in developing the citywide diversity tracking system. Director Bamba noted that Eva Bruce, Director from the Controller's Office, has been instrumental in helping HRC staff design the system. The Director pointed out that she has the ultimate responsibility for ensuring that the current and necessary data are collected and analyzed annually for minority and women businesses. She noted that each fiscal year before March 1st of each year, the Director must send a report to the Board of Supervisors proposing amendments that are deemed necessary to provide adequate remedies for identified discrimination in 12D. Director Bamba also noted that the Mayor has been more than helpful and supportive with respect to the Mayor's powers and duties in complying with the Ordinance.

Director Bamba noted that the diversity tracking system is precedent setting. She pointed out that the system has a way to provide the means and mechanism to allow the City to conduct a "check and balance" which is necessary for effective review of the Ordinance. The Director pointed out that the anticipated results would be to conduct disparity evaluations without retaining too many consultants, and also provide HRC with data to form the basis of the annual and quarterly reports.

Ms. Jones informed the Commission that her responsibility on the tracking system was to ensure that the disparity study for 1996-1997 provide the Board of Supervisors the information for adoption of the new amended 12D Ordinance (which was adopted on November 4, 1998). Ms. Jones stated that the tracking system is one of the first in the nation. The system is able to track dollars to prime contractors and subcontractors. Ms. Jones thanked Veronica Ng, Senior Contract Compliance Officer, for providing and assisting training; Maria Cordero for also assisting with the training. More importantly, she thanked Virginia Harmon, Contract Compliance Officer for her credibility. Ms. Harmon developed a system that worked under the 12D Ordinance. Ms. Jones stressed that the dedication that her staff had was committed to complete the tracking system.

Ms. Harmon gave an overview of the tracking system. She related that currently there are eight departments that are able to go on line and view their own contracting information. The HRC, Controller's Office, and the Mayor's Office are able to access all of the department's contracting information.

Ms. Jones noted that the citywide tracking system information comes from FAMIS, the City's accounting system, and ADPIC, which are all link together. Ms. Jones related that she hopes to give a complete tracking information for all departments by the June report. She pointed out that she is thrilled in putting the report out and is confident that the Mayor will be excited in seeing the project.

Director Bamba recognized Eva Bruce from the Controller's Office for her participation and her graciousness on the project The Director also thanked Ms. Bruce for having her department pay for the outside consultant. Director Bamba presented Ms. Bruce with an award for her efforts on the project. Commission Chair Marshall thanked Ms. Bruce on her participation on behalf of the Commission.

Commissioner Herman stated that the tracking system was a major step forward and congratulated the staff who was involved in the project. Commissioner Knutzen also congratulated and thanked Ms. Jones's staff on the efforts made on the tracking system. She noted that a project like the tracking system is what makes a difference for HRC in justifying and understanding the programs. Commissioner Knutzen asked, "How much information is available to the public?" Ms. Jones responded that access to the information was limited to City employees who have the certain need to know. Director Bamba stated that, some of the information has to be duly considered because of access and disclosures. Commissioner Knutzen suggested that information for the public should be put on a web page. Director Bamba related that she would discuss the issue with the appropriate people.

Commissioner Jaicks questioned what financial information is not being provided to the public. He believes that the public should get the information they need. Commissioner Jaicks asked what is private that does not belong to the public. Ms. Bruce explained that the Controller's Office is currently working on a special project to provide as much information to the general public. The project is called, "Executive Information System," and reports would be generated under the Sunshine Ordinance.

Veronica Ng reported that a new form would be designed to track the subcontractor's payment, which is related to the 12D Ordinance. Ms. Ng stated that a progress payment form tracks and identifies subcontractors, (i.e. who gets paid. She also pointed out that there is a form to track contractors or consultants who are paying the subs accordingly after 10 days after receipt of payment from the City.

Report on Joint Venture
Ms. Ng gave a brief update on the concerns regarding joint ventures.

LTM - Barnes Unified School, is a single prime and not a joint venture.

Scott – Norman, was resolved through mediation.

Nibbi – is a single prime and is not a joint venture.

Yick - Abbett Electric – is a single prime and is not a joint venture.

West Bay - Miller, Inc. – the Contract Compliance Officer is in the process of conducting a thorough investigation on West Bay Builders. An investigative report regarding West Bay 's joint venture subcontracting violation has been issued on two projects.

Miller Thompson – Dillingham – the Contract Compliance Officer is working with an independent auditor to audit the joint venture work and is still in progress.

JMV – Pavex – the Contract Compliance Officer is working with an independent auditor to audit the joint venture work and still in progress.

Report on MBE/WBE Annual Report
Director Bamba pointed out that the new Ordinance has two new groups that were added, the Arab Americans and the Native Americans. She noted that there is a complete list of ready, willing and able firms in the group. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf noted that a letter would be sent out to the Arab American community to outreach and inform them of the new Ordinance. Director Bamba reported that telecommunication is also a new sub category in the Ordinance.

Mike Leong gave an overview of the Annual Report. Mr. Leong stated that there are 796 contracts worth over 2 billion dollars that are currently on the system. He stated that the data is broken up into five industries for the large

departments that have been identified. He pointed out that the telecommunication industry would be identified under the Architecture and Engineering (A&E) category. Mr. Leong related that the area of construction for every certified group is underutilized for this category. Mr. Leong noted that since Arab Americans have not been certified, they are currently classified as non-minority; however, when they become certified, they would have their own designation. Mr. Leong related that the full Annual Report would be submitted on March 1, 1999.

Oren Sellstrom from the Lawyer's Committee spoke on behalf of the Coalition for Economic Equity and thanked the Commission and HRC staff for their report. Mr. Sellstrom stated that the reason that they required the updated is to make sure that the Ordinance is followed according to how it was written. Mr. Sellstrom asked the Commission to pay particular attention to the subcontracting data. He related that he was not clear if the Controller's Office is actually implementing the withholding of payment. Director Bamba informed Mr. Sellstrom that HRC is in discussion with the departments to ensure that all subcontracting data are entered in accurately and comprehensively.

Leo Choy, President of the Asian American Contract Association spoke on the Project Labor Agreement (PLA) issue. Mr. Choy related that their members mostly consist of small contractors (mom and pop). He pointed out that if the PLA passed, it would hurt members within the group. HRC would not be able to monitor the different ethnic groups. Mr. Choy requested the Commission to seriously go against the passing of PLA.

Commissioner Jaicks asked whether Mr. Choy believes that the MBE/WBE organizations have been cut out from participation on contracts. Mr. Choy answered affirmatively and stated that the Airport has close to 0% contracts for the Asian contractors. In answering Commissioner Jaicks, Mr. Choy related that the main reason for this is because not all their members are part of the union.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson asked if there was a project minimum before a Labor Agreement comes into effect. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson related that an evaluation of all information should be analyzed and the party for the PLA should have the opportunity to address its side. He stated that people have the right to choose or not to choose to be in a Union. Director Bamba stated that the Commission Chair would take the testimonies and HRC would transcribe the information for review. She urged the Commission to hold a hearing on the issue.

Commissioner Knutzen suggested that before a hearing is held, the Commission should formulate the advocacy items that Mr. Choy's members are requesting and provide a list on what the Labor Unions could do to assist. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson suggested that the PLA advocates should be brought in to address their issue how the agreement would work for the City.

Approval of HRC Budget FY 99-00
Director Bamba informed the Commission that the big-ticket items on the budget are the DTIS services for the maintenance of the diversity tracking system and request for new staff positions at PUC and at the Airport. Director Bamba noted that the funding for Intergroup Clearinghouse would be increased to $50,000. Diversity training and workshops would be added to the program.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson asked if three additional positions for the Airport are adequate. Director Bamba related that according to Mr. Williams, the three additional positions would allow him to monitor the existing contracts and would be monitored to determine the adequacy. Joyce Smith informed the Commission that last year's budget was $3.8 million. Director Bamba pointed out that most of the requests on the budget are being strongly considered by the Mayor's Office. Director Bamba requested that members of the Commission should consider talking with the Finance Committee regarding the proposed budget. Ms. Smith noted that all the increases are in the work order. Commissioner Herman asked where the college intern program belongs in the budget and who maintains and monitors the program? Director Bamba pointed out that Ms. Roberts is the Coordinator of the intern program. There are work-study programs that fund these areas. She also noted that HRC works with organizations to hire students. Commissioner Herman requested that City College to be part of the program.

Commissioner Chey asked what the percentage was on COLA. Ms. Smith answered, it was 4%.

Commissioner Jaicks asked if the budget included the engineering trainee program. Director Bamba noted that she would be including the trainee program. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson requested the Chair to set up a meeting with the Finance Committee to discuss the Budget Issue.

Commissioner Knutzen asked if the Employment Retirement System oversight issue was appropriate to add to the budget item. Director Bamba pointed out that she had discussed the issue with Ms. Murphy and at this point,

Ms. Murphy is not considering a work order agreement with HRC; however, she would fulfill the need of an independent monitor through her own budget.

Commission Chair Marshall commended the Director and Staff on the budget.
***Moved (Chey), Seconded (Dimapilis), and was unanimously approved.

Update on American Airlines
Larry Brinkin gave an update on the American Airlines issue, noting that, he is reviewing the American Airlines files along with his staff. He stated that he would be meeting with the Director after they review the files and will give a report on their findings. Mr. Brinkin related that they have received additional information from the complainants.

Kevin Buggy informed the Commission that he believes that the American Airlines case is coming to an end and has concerns on the case of moving forward. Lawrence Yuen spoke to say thank you to Larry Brinkin and the Director and stated that he has renewed hope on the case.

COMMITTEE REPORT

a) Youth and Education Committee

1. Report on the Committee meeting of February 18, 1999
Commissioner Chey reported that the Committee heard a report from the Recruitment Taskforce on the recruitment of new members. She related that at the next Commission meeting she would report back on a list of new members. Commissioner Chey also related that they heard a report on the Youth Violence Taskforce noting that the Committee needs to collaborate with the Youth Commission. There are fifteen recommendations that have been included in the report to ensure that it would be implemented. Commissioner Chey also pointed out that qualifications of teachers were discussed among the Committee. A presentation was made by Dianne Meltsen, Program Director of Professional Development of San Francisco Unified District, who pointed out that San Francisco teachers are responsible to meet the needs of various diverse population. She stated that there are 64,000 students, 35% are economically disadvantage youth, 32% are limited English proficient, 12% are gifted and talented, 9% are special education students, and 49% qualify for reduced free lunch. Commissioner Chey pointed out that a letter would be drafted for the Commission's approval and would be presented to the Superintendent of Education regarding concerns of teachers' qualifications. Commissioner Chey also reported that the Taskforce on the UN Convention of the Rights of the Child received a report on the local adoption noting that the Committee is strongly supporting this effort. At their next Committee meeting, they would come up with a revised proposal to present to the full Commission for adoption.

b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgendered Advisory Committee

1. Report from the Committee meeting of February 16, 1999
Commissioner Knutzen informed the Commission that she would be bringing a letter for the Commission's approval asking that when the City puts out health studies, it should include sexual orientation questions, so that data can be gathered. She pointed out that there are only a few studies on gay, lesbian and transgendered people.

2. Approval of letter expressing concern regarding a recent event at The Stud/Trannyshack which has been alleged to be anti-Latino.

Commissioner Knutzen related that the letter to The Stud/Trannyshack was to express concern with the "wetback" event that The Stud/Trannyshack sponsored on February 2, 1999. The event perpetuated a negative stereotype in the Latino community, because the term "wetback" is used to characterize and harass people from Mexico or of Mexican descent and people from other Latin American countries.

3. Approval of letters to Supervisor Tom Ammiano, Juanita Owens and Lawrence Wong noting the historic occasion of the presidencies of three bodies in San Francisco held by members of the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender communities.

Commissioner Herman pointed out that this occasion was an unprecedented in the nation and needs to be recognized Commissioner Herman related that the letter would be presented to Lawrence Wong at a public session of the Board of Trustees meeting at the Community College and would be read into the record.

4. Approval of letter to Safeway expressing concern regarding alleged homophobia at the Market & Church store

Commissioner Herman related that an alleged anti-gay policy at a Safeway store located at Market and Church Streets. He stated that this particular Safeway refused to carry a beer brand called Q Beer, that would be marketed to target the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgendered (LGBT) community. Safeway's decision not to carry this beer brand sends an anti-LGBT message to the community.

5. Approval of letter commending the 95 United Methodist ministers who supported the lesbian union ceremony in Sacramento.

Commissioner Herman stated that the letter is to recognize the 95 United Methodist ministers that put themselves on the line in face of criticism from their own church members and leaders. The individuals participated in a lesbian union ceremony in Sacramento. He pointed out that it would be important for the Human Rights Commission to commend them for their courage.

*** Moved (Herman), Seconded (Jaicks), and all four letters (items 2-5) were unanimously approved.

c) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

1. Report from the Committee meeting of February 17, 1999
Commissioner Dimapilis reported that the Committee is planning on a retreat to discuss the new Ordinance and issues at the Airport.

d) Issues Committee

1. No Report from the Committee

e) Employment Committee

1. No Report from the Committee

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Commissioner Herman requested to agendized and discuss at the next Commission meeting the duration of meeting time and how to deal with the issue.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS
TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

He also would like to discuss changing meeting days from the 2nd and 4th Thursdays to the 1st and 3rd Thursdays because every 4th Thursdays is the College Boards meeting. He requested to look at the different possibilities

Commissioner Dimapilis related that she would be bringing a letter to the next Commission meeting for Commission to approve regarding a case involving the Immigration and Naturalization Services (INS) agents who allegedly raided a home of an elderly 71 year old Filipino American woman and her family in Daly City. She stated that the alleged incident happened on February 12, 1999 at 7 a.m. Seven males and one female INS agents broke the front door lock and forcibly entered Mrs. Rosalina Montgomery's residence. Commissioner Dimapilis pointed out that this ordeal has left Mrs. Montgormery devastated who is under close medical supervision. Commissioner Dimapilis stated that the letter requests clarification on policy procedures and the status of Mrs. Montgomery's claims.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Knutzen related that Mr. Brinkin wrote a letter to the Chronicle regarding Tinky Winky. She pointed out that he brought out the fact that if Tinky Winky is gay, it was okay for kids to have a gay role model. Commissioner Knutzen stated that she was proud of Mr. Brinkin to raise consciousness around this particular issue.

Commission Chair Comer Marshall adjourned the meeting at 7:40 p.m.

NEXT MEETING

DATE:Thursday. March 11, 1999
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco. CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Mercy Gharechedaghy
Executive Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAR 0 2 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MONDAY, March 8, 1999

6:00 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Comer Marshall, Chair	Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Agar Jaicks
Shirley Dimapilis	Martha Knutzen
Julia Globus-Sabori	Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Stephen Herman	Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
Mercy Gharechedaghy
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are the 26, 42, and 71 and the Metro station at Van Ness and Market. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of 25 Van Ness Avenue. The following services are available upon request with 48 hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.sfhumanrights.org

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance.(SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510 fax (415) 703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

1. VOTE WHETHER TO ENTER INTO CLOSED SESSION

2. PUBLIC COMMENTS RELATED TO THE CLOSED SESSION

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

   CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957:

   Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

4 RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

   1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session

5. ADJOURNMENT

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

99

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAR 10 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THURSDAY, MARCH 11, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Comer Marshall, Chair	Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Agar Jaicks
Shirley Dimapilis	Martha Knutzen
Julia Globus-Sabori	Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Stephen Herman	Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
Mercy Gharechedaghy
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART and Metro stations are the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48 hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us
TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

80)

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   a. Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of February 25, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR
   a. Individual Commissioners Report on their activities in the Community
   b. Approval of Letter to INS Director Regarding an Agent who Allegedly Raided a Home of an Elderly 71 Year Old Filipino American Woman and Her Family in Daly City

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a. HRC Program Unit Activities
   1. MBE/WBE Annual Report
   2. Adoption of letter to the Board of Supervisors regarding 12D Recommendations
   3. Update on Employment Program Assessment
   4. Budget Update

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Issues Committee

Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee meeting of March 1, 1999
   a. Presentation by residents and supporters of the Housing Authority's North Beach Housing Development about the effect of the HOPE VI construction program on their tenancy and their negotiations with the Housing Authority.
   b. Survey of access to public services for persons who are not English proficient

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be on April 5, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102*

b) Employment Committee

Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. Adoption of Goals for Architecture and Engineering
2. Report from the Committee meeting of March 4, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, April 1, 1999, at 12:00 Noon. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

c) Youth and Education Committee

Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori; CoChair
Diane Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will be held on Thursday, March 18, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee

Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will be held on Tuesday, March 16, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at The Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

e) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

Commissioner Comer Marshall, Chair
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will be held on Wednesday, March 17, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS
   1. Discussion of the Duration of Meetings and Changing the Meeting Schedule to the 1st and 3rd Thursday of the Month Instead of the 2nd and 4th Thursday

9. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. VOTE WHETHER TO ENTER INTO CLOSED SESSION

11. PUBLIC COMMENTS RELATED TO THE CLOSED SESSION

12. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b):

    Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director, Marivic Bamba

13. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

    1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a).)

14. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, MARCH 25, 1999

a:\agenda 3/11/99

F.
50
2
1/99

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 12 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF MARCH 11, 1999

Commission Chair Comer Marshall called the meeting to order at 4:38p.m. Commissioner Marshall welcomed everyone to the Commission meeting and thanked everyone for coming.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present: Comer Marshall, Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair; Youn Chey, Shirley Dimapilis, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, Martha Knutzen, and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

Excused: Julia Globus-Sabori and Alan Watahara

HRC Staff
Present: Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Romulos Asenloo, Larry Brinkin, Mercy Gharechedaghy, Virginia Harmon, Don Hesse, Zula Jones, Veronica Ng, Gail Roberts and Carla Vaughn

Guests
Present: Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Kevin Buggy, Lawrence Yuen, John Siracusa, Enrique Osoris, Gregory Richardson, Connie Jacobs, David Hesbitt, Marguerite Sexton, James Tracy, Bea Harper, North Beach Housing and Eviction Defense Network

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of the Commission meeting of February 25, 1999 were unanimously approved with changes.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

There was no General Communications file circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

AMERICAN AIRLINES: Kevin Buggy requested an updated and said that he had received messages from Larry Brinkin advising that he would speak with the Director and she would initiate contact. He stated his concern. Director Bamba advised no formal decision has been made regarding the complaint, however HRC is working closely with the City Attorney on a particular issue and will render a formal decision within a week or so.

Commissioner Jaicks questioned the nature of the decision. Director Bamba advised it was related to whether or not the case would be reopened. Commissioner Jaicks wondered if it was in regard to the jurisdiction of the Commission. Director Bamba said partly, however a determination would be made as to whether any further action should be taken since the matter was closed based on the initial determination rendered by the Commission.

Deputy City Attorney Susan Frankel advised the matter was not on the agenda for discussion and only public comment should be made. Commissioner Jaicks asked to agendize the matter for the next meeting.

The Commission moved into closed session.***Moved(Jaicks)Seconded(Knutzen)

Commissioner Marshall called to vote whether to disclose any discussion held in closed session. Commissioner Herman moved not to disclose. Seconded(Knutzen)

SAN FRANCISCO HOUSING AUTHORITY ISSUE

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson thanked the San Francisco Housing Authority Tenants for attending the Issues Committee meeting and summarizing their housing history. He advised the Commission was prepared to hear a 30-minute presentation of their side of the story. He stated the Commission would not comment at this time, but would go to the Issues Committee and review the Housing Authority side. Based on hearing both sides a determination would be made.

Connie Jacobs, an organizer with the Eviction Defense network stated she assisted tenants for five years. She has worked in conjunction with Bernal Dwellings, Plaza East Hayes Valley, Valencia Gardens, and North Beach.

Marguerite Sexton, a longtime resident of North Beach expressed support for an exit contract.

September Rose, speaking on behalf of the youth, stated she hoped the decision would be quick so tenants could return home.

Thomas Toy, a liaison for Chinese speaking tenants, advised the Commission that fear is the biggest problem in the Asian community. The second biggest problem is lack of trust.

James Tracy of the Eviction Defense Network said the tenants were told they would be able to return to their units, however they were not able to.

Bethola Harper treasurer of the North Beach Tenants Association questioned MOU's that were agreed to and then changed by the Housing Authority. She went on to say that many of the older tenants were stressed because of the situation. She mentioned Ms. Lin, age 94, who had been hospitalized twice. She spoke of another tenant, Ms. Littlefield, who had lived there for 40 years and had no where to go.

Greg Richardson said he felt responsible for beginning the process with the Housing Authority and they had betrayed the trust of the tenants.

The final speaker David Hesbit, secretary of the North Beach Tenants Association, asked for the signing of the exit document.

All of the speakers expressed distrust of the Housing Authority based on past experiences. They stated they were told they could continue to live in their units while construction was under way. Recently they received official 90 - day notices to vacate the premises. The residents stated they were afraid of relocation and did not want to move outside of the current area.

Juan Monsanto Acting Manager for Planning and Program Development for the Housing Authority offered a response He stated that Ronnie Davis, Executive Director, was aware of the sensitive issues regarding Hope VI. He stated his commitment to the residents of public housing in San Francisco. He noted that several hundred people had relocated from various public housing areas. He said 84 of 85 residents returned to their original units.

Commissioner Jaicks asked if tenants were tracked after relocation. Mr. Monsanto replied they only keep contact with some households. Mr. Monsanto stated that of 295 residents removed from various sites, 195 returned. Commissioner Jaicks inquired about the other 100 residents and was told they were relocated throughout the city.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson inquired about the prerequisites for returning to the units, in particular maintaining a good credit record. Mr. Monsanto said that was correct. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson went on to say that a family trying to survive on minimum wage, thrown out of their home, and getting older, might incur some economic difficulties during the interim. If these difficult financial circumstances yielded a bad credit report these people would be locked out. Mr. Monsanto stated this was a possibility.

Mr. Monsanto offered an explanation stating that residents returning to the site would not be looked at any differently than the usual annual credit check that is conducted on all households.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson expressed concern regarding the barrier and requested further explanation.

Mr. Monsanto stated that as a point of clarification no resident would pay more than whatever they're paying now. He said they would continue to pay 30% of their rent.

Commissioner Herman asked if the Housing Authority helps with relocation. Mr. Monsanto advised that relocation staff is on site and can assist with case management. Commissioner Herman wondered how many tenants remained in the city. Mr. Monsanto advised 69% of household's stay in San Francisco, either in public housing or Section 8. Commissioner Herman wondered if tenants from the North Beach area would be able to stay there.

Commissioner Knutzen asked if there was an MOU that the Housing Authority was presently agreeing to and could he give a summary as to what guarantees were being provided.

Mr. Monsanto advised that in October 1998 Mr. Thomas Toy, who spoke earlier, submitted to the residents What he called an exit contract, which was a series of concerns that the residents wanted the Housing Authority to meet through the relocation process. Two meetings were held, the Eviction Defense Network, Commissioner Knutzen asked if there was an MOU that the Housing Authority was presently agreeing to and could he give a summary as to what guarantees were being provided.

Mr. Monsanto advised that in October 1998 Mr. Thomas Toy who spoke earlier submitted to the residents and members from the Coalition of Low Income Housing through the month of December. There were two meetings which some members attended and we had about 20 to 40 residents at one point or another. At that point we looked at the concerns they had and I took those to legal council at the Housing Authority. We utilized basically the same concerns except we had to change the language for legal concerns. We developed an MOU, which was later signed by Mr. Davis and one member of the board who is not here, who is the president of the tenants association

Commissioner Knutzen asked that he tell the Commissioners what it is that is guaranteed.

Mr. Monsanto stated that there is an assurance that all agreements between the Housing Authority and the tenants shall be in writing. That there is a fair screening criteria when residents return to the site, one like the annual review of the household presently performed by the Authority as mentioned to Commissioner Salazar-Hobson, and that a screening criteria will be developed with the North Beach tenants association according to HUD guidelines. That there is a one for one replacement of the 229 public housing units which is something that has not happened before due to lower density requirements, and that these public housing units are built as soon as possible as requested by the residents. There is a two-phase demolition and new construction. Commissioner Knutzen asked what that meant.

Mr. Monsanto stated that the site was comprised of two blocks with approximately 140 units on one site and about 90 units on the other site. The idea is to relocate all of the residents from one site, either on one site by attrition or relocating them elsewhere throughout the city, or elsewhere and demolishing one site and then rebuilding it and then moving the residents back. Up to 80% of the total population could move into that site that is going to be built first because we're building more units than we are demolishing. We're building in addition to the 229 units, 131 additional units for affordable income households. Continuing with the items, That as many residents as possible have the option to remain on site during demolition or new construction, or receive Section 8 vouchers. That all relocated residents who remain in good standing are eligible to return to the new North Beach. Good standing before I get that question means staying according to their lease, abiding by their lease, paying their rent, and not having a conviction for felony while they are relocated, that's a requirement. Another item, continuing with the items, That any mechanism to increase or decrease the number of units or public housing units may be brought for review and comment to the residents of North Beach and the North Beach tenants association prior to taking action.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf referred back to the reference to being in good standing and not having a conviction or felony. She asked if that language was directly in the MOU because the list she was looking at said criminal activity and that was pretty vague. Mr. Monsanto stated that it was part of the relocation plan. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf stated that more specific wording in that respect would be a concern of the Commission and that an actual conviction not just a broad statement of criminal activity. Commissioner Herman asked if the definition of good standing was in or not in the MOU? Mr. Monsanto said it was not and Commissioner Herman asked if there was a reason for that? Mr. Monsanto said it absolutely should be and they could do an amendment to the MOU to that affect.

Commissioner Jaicks stated that an allegation had been made earlier by one of the tenants that they were guaranteed the right to stay if they choose. Mr. Monsanto was asked to comment on that. He stated that when the development process started they had talked about different phasing stages on the project. They talked about phases, three phases, two phases, and then one phase which would mean doing exactly the same as we had done at Bernal Plaza which is relocate everybody and demolish the whole site and then bring the residents back. When the developers completed their financing for the project they indicated to us that two phase development of the project would be more feasible, financially speaking, if it's divided into any smaller chunks, the sites that is, it would be a lot more expensive due to environmental costs, due to mechanical equipment being on site, and it would be a lot more detrimental in terms of health and safety issues for the residents to stay in a block where there's actual demolition and construction happening right next to them.

Commissioner Jaicks asked if that was something that could have been anticipated before the promise was made to the tenants that they could stay. Mr. Monsanto stated that was a possibility and he was not involved in the original process and he would answer that questions more specifically when they go to the Issues Committee, he would make a note of that.

Commissioner Jaicks also asked if he thought his credibility on the other promises made were at stake, also if he made one and reneged on it. Mr. Monsanto stated that was very possible and he would like to address that to the Issues Committee. Commissioner Jaicks asked the chair of the Issues Committee and the Director if Mr. Davis would be available to come to the Issues Committee next meeting. Through the chair the Director advised with all due respect to the previous speakers, the Housing Authority, as was mentioned earlier we should appropriately digest this within the Issues Committee so as to afford each party with the relevant amount of time to respond to any other questions that you might have, but I think for the moment the suggestions that you've raised should be taken into account by both the Chair and the Vice-Chair of the Issues Committee.

Commissioner Jaicks asked if that could be agendized. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson said that the issue could be agendized and that he was very interested in getting a full fledged response by the Housing Authority and he was pleased that Mr. Monsanto would be coming along with other representatives and Mr. Davis to the next Issues Committee. He suggested that the 3-page outline presented by the tenants association should be answered to bring the issue to closure. He admonished the representatives of the tenants association and the Issues Committee that the Commission was not taking sides here. We are at this point learning about the and we have not yet determined whether it's been handled properly. We are very open to hearing the concerns from both sides so we invite you to write full responses and we've heard that possibly tenants might be asked to move in the immediate future, so we want to make sure that there are no delays in terms of getting full and complete answers to our concerns here as Commissioners.

Mr. Monsanto stated that Mr. Davis asked him to convey that he was very much willing to come back to the Committee and address those issues personally. Thank you.

Commissioner Jaicks stated that he recognized there was a time problem also because the evictions would take place in June and that would be taken into consideration. However, we should hear from the Director of the Housing Authority.

LANGUAGE BARRIER ISSUE

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson stated that Mr. Hesse would make a very quick report on the language barrier issue. Mr. Hesse stated that one of the other major points discussed at the Issues Committee on the 1st was a request by the staff of Chinese for Affirmative Action who was representing some other community organizations asking the Issues Committee or specifically the Human Rights Commission staff to conduct a survey of specified city departments, to determine how accessible they are for persons who are not proficient in English. It was frankly quite surprising to me to discover that the 1990 census indicated that there were totally 290,000 residents of San Francisco well over a third, 290,000 residents above the age of 5 for whom English was not their first language.
And while that does not indicate that all of them are necessarily not proficient in English, certainly the fact that it is at least their second language would indicate that there may be some lack of proficiency. So they indicated that one of the big concerns they have from their constituents at these organizations are people that have trouble dealing with the city government because they can't access the information, because it isn't available in their languages. They've asked us to do a survey and we're not going to do every city department. We're going to identify approximately a dozen city departments, prepare a written survey and ask them for information, collect some written materials if they have those available in different languages and then the community organizations

are going to conduct a test for some city departments too, and have people call up and see what kind of services they get if they don't speak English. We do want to emphasize that it is State Law that State Agencies are required to provide services in peoples languages when that population reaches a significant amount, which I believe is 5% of the client base. For that reason certain city agencies such as the Department of Human Services, do in fact actually meet these standards when it comes to programs that are funded by State money. But, that's not true for all city departments and it certainly is a standard that city departments should be striving for since all of these people are tax payers who really need access to these services. So it's a project we're going to take on over the next few months and we'll be coming back to you with regular reports on that.

Commissioner Chey clarified that the 1980 census count of the limited English speaking population is tremendously undercounted. She stated that had to be taken into consideration so the count was even higher than Mr. Hesse reported.

Commissioner Jaicks stated the Mr. Hesse had discussions with the Commission on the Status of Women and they would be invited to participate in implementing their report itself. He stated that maybe we should talk later about it and he would like to see it go forward as soon as possible. That concluded the report.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

a) Individual Commissioners' Reports on their activities in the Community
LETTER FROM THE GREEN PARTY

Commissioner Knutzen stated that she had received a letter complimenting the Commissioners on a letter they wrote about an anti-discrimination law based on weight and appearance, from the Green Party, stating they appreciated our efforts on that behalf. She also reported that she has been attending the CEDA subcommittee task force and has been reporting regularly on that. Just to note that we're actually meeting two or three times a month now and really moving ahead with what's going to be an analysis of a couple of city departments on some ways the whole city can come into compliance with CEDA, which is a way of analyzing things according to gender disparity and then coming up with really kind of holistic and innovative approaches to providing fairer services to women in general, both as employees and recipients of city services. That committee is continuing to meet, and I'm continuing to participate in it and it's moving ahead so I just wanted to let you to know that. They wanted me to convey, and I'll just pass this around, that April 22nd is Take Our Daughters to WorkDay. They are also beginning to promote just as a task force some of the various issues that focus particularly on women.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

Director Bamba stated that items under her report, including the Annual Report were mailed to the Commissioners on March 1st, as well as delivered to the members of the Board of Supervisors. She said she hoped they had a chance to review the report prepared by Zula Jones and Virginia Harmon. Highlights were provided regarding the Tracking System. At the last meeting Director Bamba reported that the Tracking System had been implemented, however, the data was not complete. Page 13 of the report showed various departments. While making a diligent effort to enter as much information as possible, some information was still lacking from a few departments, including purchasing. She noted most of the contracts were not entered. The purchasing information was extracted from the controller's office and some information from 96-97 was extracted from ad picks. She stated this hadn't changed since the first disparity study, and because of the small sample of information the statistician was reluctant to conduct a test. However, for informational purposes a column called Disparity Ratio had been included. Given the threshold of 1.65, the ratio tends to be below 1.00, which means it's not statistically significant. In any event, she noted that the under-utilization of each group had been looked at and there was significant under-utilization. For example, under construction for the calendar years 96 through 98 all ethnic groups receiving less than what was expected are reflected in column 6, which is called Dollars Lost. She pointed out that certified African Americans were expected to receive an available percentage of $56,500,000. The amount actually received was $9 500,000. This is an under-utilization of $46.9 million

Commissioner Herman stated he wasn't clear on how the disparity ratio was formulated. Director Bamba advised that the formula is based on total availability and total dollars, plus total contracts. She went on to say that from the number of contracts and dollars a formula is derived and the threshold established is 1.65. So, anything above or below 1.65 as an absolute number is statistically significant. Commissioner Herman asked what that meant and the Director advised that in the view of the Commission if minority businesses were being utilized 1.65 or above, that would be great. However, if it's above 1.65 they're over-utilized. Commissioner Herman stated that in fact the

data showed just the opposite and the Director concurred.

It was concluded that no conclusion would be drawn from the report until additional information could be made available. Director Bamba stated that she would have Mr. Leong, the statistician, provide further explanation. She also noted that a letter had been drafted for the Commissioners to be signed by the Chair and Director to the Board of Supervisors President, Tom Ammiano, indicating their recommendation. It was unanimously approved.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Nichole Truax, Special Assistant to the Director read a statement from James Brody of Telecom. He thanked the Commission for issuing the first annual report and he noted glaring problems in the report based on the data collected. He also thanked Director Bamba and her staff for their tireless efforts bringing forth the report. He stated his shock at the rate of activity by non-certified firms in the city, which he believes makes the program ineffective. However, with the Tracking System in place Department Heads can be held accountable. He stated that the HRC must work closely with the Department heads to insure participation by MWLBE'S. His final point was he believes the Director needs more staff to make this happen.

Commissioner Marshall called for a vote and the motion was carried.

EMPLOYMENT STUDY
Director Bamba stated that at previous meetings she reported that meetings were held with the San Francisco Urban Institute to go over the Employment Study. A meeting was also held with Buck Devonthal. She advised there were 3 law firms involved in the 12D study. She said an assessment would be made to determine the participation of minorities and women on construction contracts at the Airport and other departments. In particular the Department of Public Works and the PUC. Director Bamba invited the Commissioners to the meeting and also the Employment Committee.

BUDGET
Director Bamba commended Joyce Smith for her hard work on the budget. She stated that the PUC had requested an increase. She advised Andy Moran to put that in writing. She noted that finalization would continue, working closely with the Mayor's office.

EMPLOYMENT COMMITTEE
Commissioner Jaicks spoke on behalf of the Chair stating the Goals for Architecture and Engineering had been adopted at the March 4 meeting. He asked for comments from Gail Roberts who advised that Task Forces had been established to focus on specific issues. She went on to say that each member of the Committee was asked to volunteer for one or more Task Force.

Commissioner Jaicks added that the meeting with the CBO's and Karen White of the Giants Ballpark had been very productive Ms Roberts noted that the communication was improved.

Director Bamba commented that when first assigned to staff the Committee meeting Ms. Roberts brought to her attention the fact that Architectural & engineering goals had not been established. Director Bamba stated that through the diligence and efforts of ms. Roberts there was now an updated census analysis, as well as goals that have just been adopted Director Bamba commended Ms. Roberts for all of her efforts.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Commissioner Marshall stated there was discussion of changing the meeting schedule to the 1st and 3rd Thursday of the month instead of the 2nd & 4th Thursday.

Commissioner Herman suggested a number of options be explored. Director Bamba and Commissioner Marshall agreed to continue to look into this.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Director Bamba advised she would place the Disparity Study item under her report for clarification at the next meeting. The Director also noted that a letter would be forwarded to the Chair regarding dates she would not be present, from March 16 through March 26. In her absence Acting Directors would be Larry Brinkin & Veronica Ng.

Commissioner Herman mentioned another item for possible agendizing would be information regarding the

Budget. Director Bamba advised it would be in her report and Ms. Joyce Smith would provide the presentation.

ADJOURNMENT

Commission Chair Comer Marshall adjourned the meeting at 7:15 p.m.

NEXT MEETING

DATE:Thursday, March 11, 1999
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

Carla Vaughn
Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAR 2 2 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, MARCH 25, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Comer Marshall, Chair	Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Agar Jaicks
Shirley Dimapilis	Martha Knutzen
Julia Globus-Sabori	Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Stephen Herman	Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART and Metro stations are the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of March 11, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Budget Update – Joyce Smith
2. Citywide Diversity Tracking System / Public Accessibility – Larry Brinkin
3. American Airlines Update – Larry Brinkin
4. Resolution for Gail Roberts / Retiring – Larry Brinkin
5. Resolution for Benson Hattem / Retiring – Larry Brinkin

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Youth and Education Committee

Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee
2. Approval of a Letter to Dr. Waldemar Rojas, Superintendent of Schools, San Francisco Unified School District, Regarding the Importance of Including, and also of Carefully Scheduling, Teacher Professional Development Days during the School Year

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will be held on Thursday, April 15, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

b) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

Commissioner Comer Marshall, Chair
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee Meeting of March 17, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, April 21, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

c) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee

Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee Meeting of March 16, 1999
2. Approval of Letter to the Department of Public Health encouraging the inclusion of Lesbian , Bisexual, and the Transgender Community's health issues in research projects

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will be held on Tuesday, April 20, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at The Human Rights commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

d) Issues Committee

Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee.

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be on April 5, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102*

e) Employment Committee

Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, April 1, 1999, at 12:00 Noon. At the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

9. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. ADJOURNMENT IN MEMORY OF FORMER HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSIONER VIVIAN HALLINAN

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, APRIL 8, 1999

A:\agenda 3/25/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.
APR 12 2002
SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF MARCH 25, 1999

Commission Acting- Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf called the meeting to order at 4:45 p.m. and welcomed everyone to the meeting.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Present:Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Acting-Chair; Youn Chey, Shirley Dimapilis, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, Martha Knutzen, Antonio Salazar-Hobson, and Alan Watahara

Excused: Julia Globus-Sabori

HRC Staff
Present:Larry Brinkin, Acting Executive Director; Diana Rathbone, Gail Roberts, Joyce Smith, and Carla Vaughn

Guests
Present: Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; and Lawrence Yuen

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
The minutes of the Commission meeting of March 11, 1999 were agendized.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS
There was no General Communications file circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS
None.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

a) Individual Commissioners' Reports on their activities in the Community

Acting Chair Saliba-Malouf formally notified all present, with regret, of the resignation of Commissioner Comer Marshall. She stated she enjoyed serving as his Vice Chair. Prior to his 3 years on the Commission he had on the MBE/WBE Committee. She stated he brought much knowledge and expertise to the Commission in those areas. She went on to ask Mr. Brinkin, Acting Director, to prepare a resolution to commend Commissioner Marshall for exceptional service to the Commission. The Commissioners were given an opportunity to comment and unanimously echoed the Acting Chair, citing Commissioner Marshall's exceptional work as a Commissioner of the People She stated he tried to balance all sides of an issue. By unanimous acclamation, the attributes used to describe Commissioner Marshall were courageous, a community role model, and overwhelmingly compassionate.

Commissioner Herman encouraged the Commissioners to urge Commissioner Marshall to continue to serve the City. Commissioner Jaicks indicated that the support from the Commission for Commissioner Marshall was marvelous. However, Commissioner Jaicks stated that Commissioner Marshall had not died and would go on to bigger and better things and the resolution should reflect that.

Gail Roberts noted that she screened and interviewed Commissioner Marshall for the MBE/WBE Committee. She echoed the Commissioners opinions and stated that as a staff person she felt he was supportive of staff and

provided leadership.

Acting Chair Saliba-Malouf announced the Mayor's appointment to the Commission, Judge Harry Low, who would attend the next meeting. The election of Chair and Vice Chair was agendized for the April 8 meeting.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

LEGISLATION TO PROTECT THE OVER-WEIGHT
Larry Brinkin provided an update on the idea of legislation to protect people that are over-weight. In an earlier meeting that day with the City Attorney, a community representative, and an aide of Supervisor Ammiano's, Mr. Brinkin discussed strategies and implementation of such legislation.

He stated Supervisor Ammiano would review the best strategic move and possibly go ahead with the legislation and have a hearing soon before the Board of Supervisors.
Mr. Brinkin stated that it might not be necessary for this body to duplicate the process. However, if the community did not feel that way the Commission could be asked to hold a hearing on the topic. He stated that if a hearing is not held, the testimony previously received could be enough to generate a letter voicing the Commission's opinion of the proposed legislation. He suggested this could be sent to the Supervisors at a future time and the Commission will be advised as to whether a separate hearing will be desired.

Commissioner Knutzen supported making the process as efficient as possible. Acting Chair Saliba-Malouf wondered if a resolution would be appropriate as an endorsement to move the legislation along.

Mr. Brinkin suggested the Commission find out whether or not a hearing should be recommended first. After the hearing, a report would be prepared summarizing the testimony with Commission recommendations. This could include a recommendation for legislation. Otherwise, Mr. Brinkin offered to bring a letter or resolution to express opinions on the proposal. He also noted that staff could testify at the Supervisors' hearing.

BUDGET
Joyce Smith reported that the Mayor's office was reviewing the budget and HRC is responding to their requests. Currently a performance measures section is being created by HRC and will be delivered to the Controllers office on March 26. She informed the Commission that negotiations had not begun between HRC and the Mayor's office.

Commissioner Jaicks inquired if the budget included something the Mayor had not agreed to. Ms. Smith advised that the budget had been submitted and meetings had been held with the Mayor's office. However, the budget was not identical to the previous budget year, so negotiations were an expected normal procedure.

Mr. Brinkin added that the baseline budget was verbally approved at the first meeting. However, new positions were requested and work order funding was being considered for some departments. He noted that no problems were anticipated

PUBLIC ACCESSIBILITY OF CITYWIDE DIVERSITY TRACKING SYSTEM
Mr. Brinkin addressed the question as to what type of information might be available to the public (i.e. the Internet). He said the preliminary answer is any information in the contracts that is proprietary. Social security numbers, tax ID numbers, or the home address of business owners would not be publicly accessible. Mr. Brinkin stated that as HRC continues to develop the system, the City Attorney will be asked to advise HRC on a regular basis as to what information is available to the public. He noted this would be no different than documents that are now available to the public. Mr. Brinkin went on to state that the goal of the system is to be as publicly accessible as possible. He said that the Director and the Controller, on the advice of the City Attorney's office, would determine what would be made available to the public.

Commissioner Jaicks suggested that parameters be set regarding information that might be embarrassing to HRC staff.

Commissioner Herman commented on the difference between public information, and information gathered by the Commission that would not be available to the public. He stated that clarification was needed to determine what information would be public.

Commissioner Jaicks wanted the staff and Director to know that it cuts both ways; he stated that the Commission wants to be able to protect the staff whenever possible. Also, when there is something wrong the Commission wants it corrected.

Commissioner Herman requested a report of what would be placed on the Internet prior to making it available to the public.

Acting Director, Larry Brinkin suggested that three categories be used:
What's on the Internet
What's available to the Public
What's never available to the Public

AMERICAN AIRLINES
Mr. Brinkin stated that the legal research requested from the City Attorney's office had not been received, but was expected as soon as the following week. He stated the complainants would be notified as soon as a decision was made.

Commissioner Knutzen suggested a training program be made available to staff in order to deter similar situations in the future. Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney, stated that one positive result of this issue is that a number of inadequacies in the ordinances had been discovered, such as protections for people based on their association with protected classes, as well as retaliation. She noted Mr. Brinkin had made a recommendation to Supervisor Ammiano about things that should be in the ordinances. Thus, the ordinances may be expanded which is for the better.

Commissioner Herman wondered if a gap was found, and the additional language was added or corrected, would the changes be retroactive. Attorney Frankel replied no.

Mr. Brinkin stated new guidelines were being developed for staff in relation to handling complaints.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Lawrence Yuen commented regarding a previous rental ordinance that went into affect retroactively for cases that were ongoing. He wondered why this would not apply to his case, since it was also ongoing.

Acting Chair Saliba-Malouf asked Attorney Frankel to look into it and advised Mr. Yuen that if it were permissible and appropriate under the circumstances, a recommendation would be made to Supervisor Ammiano.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

RESOLUTION FOR GAIL ROBERTS
Mr. Brinkin tabled the resolution for Gail Roberts until the next meeting. He reminded the Commissioners to RSVP for the April 12 dinner in her honor. Mr. Brinkin introduced the resolution for Ben Hattem, which was adopted after comments from Acting Chair Saliba-Malouf. She indicated the resolution reflected Mr. Hattem's tremendous contributions. The passage of the resolution was moved by Commissioner Herman and seconded by Commissioner Chey.

YOUTH AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE
Commissioner Chey reported on the March 18 meeting. She said the newly appointed members were present at the last meeting, which was staffed by Gail Roberts. Ms. Thompson of Amnesty International provided a presentation on the Juvenile justice recommendations contained in Betraying the Young report. She indicated its relevance to the local adoption of the Articles of the U.N. Convention on The Rights of the Child. (CRC) Commissioner Chey reported that Amnesty International was trying to locate local partners and that last year it worked with the Commission on the Status of Women, with HRC participation, to implement a local version of the U.N. Convention on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women. She went on to state that Ms. Thompson mentioned that the fundamental issues are to protect children and women. She advised the that Amnesty International is committed to support the Youth and Education Committee's efforts to move forward with the local adoption of CRC.

Commissioner Chey advised that a Task Force had been formed and the City Attorney would join the next meeting. She said an ordinance would be shaped and a public hearing held to move on to the adoption of the ordinance. She noted the Youth Violence Task Force reported 15 recommendations and a concept paper was

drafted. The Youth Commission has agreed to get involved at the beginning of the next fall school year. Commissioner Chey asked for approval of a letter recommended by the Committee to SFUSD Superintendent, Dr. Waldeman Rojas. While the Commissioners reviewed the letter, Diana Rathbone was invited to comment on the 31-year participation of Gail Roberts at the HRC, and in particular her tenure as a dedicated staff person to the Youth & Education Committee. Ms. Rathbone provided highlights of the remarks made by Gail Roberts at the March 18 meeting. Ms. Rathbone stated that the flowers presented to Ms. Roberts at the meeting seemed a small thing to do in recognition of her hard work and dedication over the years. Commissioner Chey added that Ms. Roberts had been invited to return to the Committee as a member upon her retirement. She then asked for approval of the letter pending grammatical corrections.***Moved(Herman)Seconded(Jaicks).

Commissioner Jaicks expressed pleasure in the fact that the School board had embraced the report provided by the HRC. He called for recognition of the efforts of Janine Shigoya, a primary participant in the writing of the report.

Commissioner Herman requested that Commissioners be listed on HRC letterhead, thereby providing recognition of their approval of letters sent. Commissioner Watahara suggested a template be used for easy addition or deletion of Commissioner names. The Commissioners unanimously agreed.

MBE/WBE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Dimapilis advised that 2 representatives provided a presentation from the Federal Small Business Commission. Members of the Committee were invited to participate as well. There was a presentation by Mr. Tom, of the Giants, who stated that bids are still available to anyone who would like to participate in the process.

LGBT ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Herman reported that one of the major issues covered was the "Wetback" issue at the Stud Trannyshack. Some community members and the owner of the Stud revisited the issue. The positive outcome was that representatives from the Latino community and the owner of the Stud started dialog and were open to mediation. The Committee directed Larry Brinkin to help set up mediation. Hopefully this issue will be worked out by the owner, the people that put on the event and representatives from the Latino community, who brought the painful issue forward. Commissioner Herman stated there was discussion about Gay Pride activities and how the Committee will participate this year. Instead of a booth, participants will walk with the Mayor's contingent. Larry Brinkin invited staff, Committee members, and Commissioners to participate.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson reported that when he left the Commission hearing two weeks ago, he went to the bathroom and the racial slur "F---ALL WETBACKS" was written on the wall. He said he was stunned as were other Commissioners. He commended the City Attorney who called the next morning and had city employees clean the area by 10:00 am. He also received a letter of apology. He further stated that the problem is pervasive, and although we are approaching the end of the century, he is pleased that the HRC is following its mandate to and stop this type of environment.

Commissioner Herman spoke on the importance of the Commissioners serving the communities that are represented

Commissioner Knutzen requested approval of a letter to the Department of Public Health. The letter urges the department to support further research on Lesbians, Bisexual Women, and the Transgender community's health. It was moved by Commissioner Herman and seconded by Commissioner Jaicks.

Commissioner Herman mentioned a retreat that would include new Committee members. He stated the names had been forwarded to Commissioner Marshall. Larry Brinkin indicated the letters had been signed so the new members were appointed.

Commissioner Herman related an incident of vandalism to a mural at City College. He stated someone tried to erase the faces of a lesbian couple depicted in the mural. No other part of the mural was defaced. He requested a letter be drafted to the students and staff supporting their efforts for approving the mural and condemning the individuals who defaced the images of lesbians. He requested the letter be addressed to the President of the Associated Students with copies to the Chancellor and the Board of Trustees.

Commissioner Knutzen suggested the letter also be sent to the press. Commissioner Jaicks asked if the origin of the letter would be from the LGBT Committee. Acting Chair Saliba-Malouf responded it would be a Commission action.

Commissioner Herman suggested the Mayor be commended for his courage in officiating the Lesbian and Gay unions. Commissioner Jaicks suggested commending the participating Supervisors as well. The item was agendized.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson asked Attorney Frankel to do whatever needs to be done to preserve the right of the Commission to return to closed sessions and complete the topics discussed at previous meetings.

Commissioner Jaicks urged the Commission to remember the closed sessions were confidential and should not be discussed in the press. Attorney Frankel added that advice was good. Commissioner Watahara wondered what the protocol was regarding the press.

Commissioner Knutzen suggested Kandace Bender of the Mayor's office be given a heads-up regarding articles that might appear in the press. There was a consensus and Larry Brinkin advised he would contact her.

ADJOURNMENT

Acting Chair Saliba-Malouf moved for adjournment in memory of Vivian Hallinan, former HRC Commissioner, who served as Chair of the Youth and Education Committee. She was an activist and well known in the community.

Commissioner Jaicks shared fond memories of Mrs. Hallinan along with Larry Brinkin. Commissioner Jaicks suggested the adjournment in her honor be sent to her family.

The adjournment was moved by Commissioner Knutzen and seconded by Commissioner Dimapilis. The time was 6:00 PM.

NEXT MEETING
DATE: Thursday, April 8, 1999
TIME: 4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Carla Vaughn
Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 0 5 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, APRIL 8, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Julia Globus-Sabori
Stephen Herman
Agar Jaicks
Martha Knutzen
Harry Low
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART and Metro stations are the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that

other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of March 11, 1999
   b) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of March 25, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Nomination and Election of Chair and Vice Chair
   b) Approval of Resolution Honoring Gail P. Roberts/Retirement
   c) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Schindler Elevator Company v. City and County
   Update on Hearing

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will be held on Thursday, April 15, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

b) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, April 21, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

c) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Commendation To Mayor Brown For Officiating at the Domestic Partner Ceremony

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will be held on Tuesday, April 20, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at The Human Rights commission office, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

d) Issues Committee

Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee Meeting of April 5, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be on May 3, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102*

e) Employment Committee

Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee Meeting of April 1, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, May 6, 1999, at 12:00 Noon. At the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS
   1. Discussion of the duration of Meetings and Changing the Meeting Schedule to the 1st and 3rd Thursday of the Month instead of the 2nd and 4th Thursday
   2. Approval of letter to the Associated Students of City College praising the installation on campus of a mural illustrating diversity, and condemning the mural's recent homophobic defacement.

9. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. ADJOURNMENT IN HONOR OF GAIL P. ROBERTS ON THE OCCASION OF HER RETIREMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, APRIL 22, 1999

A:\agenda 4/8/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 12 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF APRIL 8, 1999

Commission Acting Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf called the meeting to order at 4:45 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present:Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Acting-Chair; Youn Chey, Shirley Dimapilis, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, Martha Knutzen, Harry Low, and Alan Watahara

Excused: Julia Globus-Sabori and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

HRC Staff
Present:Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin, Virginia Harmon, Zula Jones, Veronica Ng, Diana Rathbone, Gail Roberts, Joyce Smith, Nichole Truax and Carla Vaughn

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Lawrence Yuen, Kevin Buggy and John Siracusa

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
A motion was made to table approval of the March 11, & March 25, 1999 minutes until the next meeting. (Jaicks) Seconded (Herman)

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

Acting Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf called for the nomination and election of the Chair and Vice Chair respectively.

Commissioner Jaicks addressed the Commission stating that he had known the nominee longer than any of the other Commissioners and with great pleasure nominated Justice Harry Low. He said that Justice Low brings a wealth of credentials and noted the prestige that such a man brings to the organization. Commissioner Jaicks said Justice Low worked very hard to achieve his education and his position in life. He stated Justice Low was an activist in the Asian community as well as the larger community. Commissioner Jaicks commented on the reputation of Justice Low as a Jurist and his previous work as the Chair of the Police Commission. He ended by stating he was honored to place his name in nomination.

Acting Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf called for public comment. There was none. The nomination was moved by Commissioner Jaicks and seconded by Commissioner Chey. The vote was unanimous. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf turned the meeting over to newly elected Commission Chair Harry Low and welcomed him on board. Commission Chair Harry Low thanked Commissioner Saliba-Malouf and said he was pleased to have the opportunity to serve on the Commission. He remembered the first Commission and the Director, Bill Becker. Chair Harry Low said he served on an advisory committee in the Asian community for a number of years in the 60's. He stated that he had watched the organization closely and admired the important and fine work. Chair Low mentioned he was pleased to have the opportunity to work with colleagues he has known for many years,

specifically his former research clerk, Alan Watahara and Youn-Chey. He said it was nice to be back in a familiar courtroom that held much history for him.

Commission Chair Low called for nominations for Vice Chair. Commissioner Knutzen nominated Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf and thanked her for her work as Acting Chair. The nomination was seconded by Commissioners Dimapilis and Herman. Commission Chair Low called for Public Comment. There was no public comment and the motion was carried unanimously.

APPROVAL OF THE RESOLUTION HONORING GAIL P. ROBERTS RETIREMENT
Commission Chair Low commented on the many accomplishments of Gail Roberts during her 31 years of service at the Human Rights Commission. He mentioned specifically her contribution to a number of youth projects and her ability to get others involved. Chair Low said it was a tremendous loss to the Commission, but wished her success, happiness, and thanked her again for her dedicated service.

REPORT ON LATINO CASE MANAGEMENT
Commissioner Herman reported that a meeting with the Mayor's office was productive in identifying $30,000 for Latino Case Management that targeted the Latino HIV
community. He thanked staff member Larry Brinkin and said that the $30,000 would be work ordered to a Latino agency to restore a full time position that had been cut from Case Management Services.

Commissioner Herman said that Larry Brinkin successfully mediated a productive meeting with people from the Latino community, owners and production people that put
on the "WETBACK NIGHT" at the Stud. He stated that tensions were raised in the community because of the event. Commissioner Herman went on to say that due to the success of the mediation facilitated by Larry Brinkin the community activist were planning a fund raiser with the club owner to raise money for the Latino community.

After calling for reports from other Commissioners and having none, Chair Low returned to the Gail Roberts Resolution for adoption. He directed the secretary to prepare a more complete Resolution.

Commissioner Jaicks spoke to the Resolution adding to the words of the Chair. He said he worked on two committees with Ms. Roberts and commented on the historical perspective she brought to those committees. Commissioner Jaicks stated her work ethic and knowledge were deeply appreciated and would be missed. Commission Vice Chair Saliba-Malouf and Commissioners Knutzen and Dimapilis made similar comments. There were no public comments. Commission Chair Low accepted the motion.***Moved (Chey) Seconded (Herman). The resolution was unanimously approved.

Director Bamba said she was reserving her comments in regard to Ms. Roberts' retirement for the April 12 dinner at the Cliff House.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a)HRC Program Unit Activities

VETERANS EQUITY ACT
The Director commented on the Conference she attended as a panelist discussing discrimination issues. She stated that she would present at the next meeting, along with Commissioner Dimapilis, issues for approval regarding the Veterans Equity Act. Director Bamba noted discussion by the National Filipino Federation and asked for the Commissions consideration. The Director asked that the issue be agendized for the next meeting.

SCHINDLER ELEVATOR CO. VS. THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
Director Bamba reported that on April 5th at 1:30 p.m. she attended the oral argument hearing regarding the The panel consisted of three judges: Strickman; Swagger; and Marchiano. Schindler's lawyers argued that the bid was rejected based on 209 issues and they felt the 12D Ordinance was unconstitutional. The Justices questioned whether the issue of 12D was brought up before the Airport Commission or at the trial court level. The Director said there was no adequate answer. She further commented that the City lawyers argued that the bid submitted by Schindler was deficient, had blank pages, and was a conditional bid which asked that the equal benefits ordinance be waived for them. Director Bamba said that a decision would be rendered soon.

BUDGET
Joyce Smith reported that negotiations with the Mayor's office are ongoing. Ms. Smith presented items for the 1999-2000 budget. She stated there was a status given for each item and said some items had been reduced due

to negotiations. Ms. Smith announced the HRC budget would go before the Finance and Labor Committee on Thursday, June 17th at 1:00 p.m., in City Hall, Room 263.

Director Bamba said any request to members of the Finance and Labor Committee, asking for support of the budget, would be appreciated.

Commissioner Jaicks wondered if the $51,262 reduction would cause a hardship. The Director said no because the larger proportion of the amount was due to revised estimates for computers and DTIS charges for the maintenance of the Tracking System.

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
Director Bamba reported a letter was received from Andy Moran committing to the balance of the work order request for three additional positions, which is contingent upon the approval and award of the program management contract. She said copies of the letter would be provided to the Commissioners.

Director Bamba said that at the next meeting she would present a report on Complaint Settlements. She stated there were many significant settlements this past week through the work of Mary Gin Starkweather, Gail Roberts, Larry Brinkin, Kevin Williams, and Zula Jones.

Commissioner Herman suggested not responding to the hate letter from the National Rifle Association, which was addressed to the Commissioners and mailed to the Human Rights Commission office. Commissioner Knutzen requested that these types of letters be distributed through the General Communication file.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

YOUTH AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE
No report

MBE/WBE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
No report

LGBT ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Knutzen moved to send a commendation to Mayor Brown for officiating at the Domestic Partner Ceremony. She said this was very important, since this is the only official government entity that actually provides a ceremony for domestic partners. Commissioner Knutzen said when the Mayor and all of the Supervisors officiate at a ceremony like this it is extremely important in terms of honoring our relationships, and it is also extremely unique. She noted the Mayor is taking a very courageous stand in doing this sort of thing. She suggested we send him a letter of appreciation.***Seconded (Saliba-Malouf)

Commissioner Herman stated he assumed the request for letterhead indicating the names of the Commissioners was communicated to the Director for letters such as this.

The motion was unanimously approved

ISSUES COMMITTEE
Filling in for the Chair of the Issues Committee, Commissioner Jaicks said the meeting held Monday evening was spirited. He stated there were two issues that came before the Committee. One issue was Same-Sex Rape in Prison and the other dealt with the Residents of the North Beach Housing Project. Commissioner Jaicks said this was the second meeting held regarding Same-Sex Rape. The first meeting was with the Assistant Sheriff of San Francisco who brought a positive report on the conditions at the San Francisco jail. Commissioner Jaicks said the critical aspect of the situation is that there are only seven or eight rapes reported with the Sheriff. He stated, " Witnesses that come before the Committee maintain that this is just the tip of the iceberg, because prisoners who are raped do not report it." Commissioner Jaicks also noted that most organizations and individuals that are concerned about same-sex rape in prisons feel that San Francisco is a model for the rest of the country. Commissioner Jaicks said a gentleman attended the meeting last Monday who represented an organization that was nationwide This gentleman indicated that same-sex rape is a crisis nationwide. Commissioner Jaicks said the problem is that there is not enough statistical evidence to support what has been reported. Commissioner Jaicks stated that emotional trauma caused by same-sex rape is enormously traumatic. He went on to say there anecdotal evidence that victims of same-sex rape, like abused children, often commit same-sex rape later on, becoming the abuser rather than the victim. Commissioner Jaicks said prisoners often become so emotionally unstable that they create violent acts, both within the prison system and when they are released. It is an

enormous problem

According to Commissioner Jaicks the gentleman that attended the Monday meeting had been raped and kept as a slave for 6 or 7 months Commissioner Jaicks said some of this abuse goes on for years and the individual is literally destroyed.

Commissioner Jaicks stated it was difficult to know precisely what to do. He said the committee decided to continue the research, and invite people from the State prison facilities as well as the guard unions. Commissioner Jaicks noted that the guards are often part of the problem and that is where the problem stands.

Commission Chair Harry Low inquired as to whether or not the Juvenile facilities were included in the 7 statistics reported. Commissioner Jaicks replied that same-sex rape does go on in juvenile facilities. Chair Harry Low commented that this is an area that deserves examination. He said that from his criminal justice experience just recognizing that there could be a problem is probably as important a thing as you can do to bring it to the attention of people and tell the Sheriff that we are concerned. Commissioner Jaicks stated that another interesting fact that he failed to mention was that same-sex rape was quite small among women. However, heterosexual guards usually rape the women. This is a significant problem that seems to continue.

Commissioner Watahara suggested inviting the Issues Committee to write policy recommendations, in addition to providing statistical information. He said this would give the Commission a foundation from which action could be taken. Commissioner Jaicks said he would do that and bring it up at the next Issues Committee meeting.

NORTH BEACH HOUSING RESIDENTS
Commissioner Jaicks said a delegation of 20 to 30 residents came before the Issue Committee represented by Mr. Richardson, whose letters were provided in the General Communications file. Their main thrust is that they have been lied to about what would happen to them as the deconstruction takes place. The Commissioner stated that some of the residents feel they are not assured they will be able to come back. He said that the HOPE VI Project is unique in that there is no guarantee that the same number of units destroyed will be rebuilt. Commissioner Jaicks said it was obvious that the same number of people that are there will not be able to come back. Commissioner Jaicks stated that with North Beach there is a promise that there will be 229 units to come back to, and that each person will be allowed to come back if they have accumulated no felonies at that time. He also said that there is great skepticism among the tenants that the Housing Authority will not live up to its pledges, because they have not done so in the past. He stated that even at North Beach they were promised that the destruction would be phased, and a certain number of residents, perhaps those with the most seniority, would be able to stay in the North Beach Project while one section is being constructed and move into the new section. That promise, which is in writing, has been reneged. The housing authority says the reason they did that is because there has been a cut in the amount of money available for them to do so. Therefore, they had to destroy all the housing at once. There is no guarantee, as they pointed out at the start, that someone will come along and say, "Well there is not enough money for the 229 units".

Commissioner Jaicks stated that another problem with the Hope VI project is that it is often a program in which they upscale the residents. The surrounding residents of the area are participants in the decision as to what happens in HOPE VI Programs. So now you have very affluent people who surround the project and they have say into what
happens in the project. It's a catch 22. The Commissioner stated that the HRC Commission would help facilitate an exit program. Commissioner Jaicks deferred to Director Bamba who had talked with Ronnie Davis of the Housing Authority.

Director Bamba said that Ronnie Davis indicated that he was interested in any suggestions that the Commissioners might have. She said that he was willing to go over the suggestions. Commissioner Jaicks said that he would continue to follow up because this is a major problem. He noted that when the upscale process set in place, the objective in about 5 to 10 years would be market value. Commissioner Jaicks said those tenants would not be able to afford market value. The Housing Authority maintained that none of them would be removed, however, no one believes that so it's a very difficult problem. Commissioner Jaicks concluded his report by stating that the Committee would see what it could do.

EMPLOYMENT COMMITTEE
Vice Chair Saliba-Malouf said the meeting was dynamic. She asked Ms. Gail Roberts to give what would be her final report. Ms. Roberts echoed Commissioner Malouf stating the meeting was productive and she pointed out the diversity of the committee. She said the individuals involved represented the San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council, an officer of the Laborers Union, private employers, and community based

organizations. These were people with background in the issue of the project stabilization agreement at the Airport and the proposed project labor agreement. She said it was a very lively discussion. Ms. Roberts stated that Eileen Hernandez, representing the Coalition for Economic Equity, had come before the Commission at a previous meeting and had requested that the HRC do an analysis of the issue. She said the Union representatives felt that the reason they needed a project labor agreement was because they believed that existing federal and state statutes were not being enforced and monitored. The conclusion and recommendation to the Commission was that the MBE/WBE Committee hold a series of workshops to get people together and examine the issues. Ms. Roberts stated that the Committee played a good role on the Pacific Bell construction project to help facilitate communications. She said there were some situations between the prime contractors and community based organizations where there were differences among the representatives on the facts. Ms. Roberts stated that the next committee meeting would be May 6. She said the committee would be looking at the living wage ordinance. Ms. Roberts stated there was also legislation at the State level and the committee would look at that as well. In closing she stated the Commission had been a real part of her life.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS
Commission Chair Low asked if there was a desire to move the meetings to another date. Commissioner Herman said that on the 4th Thursday of every month the College holds a board meeting and he needs to attend. It was determined that if the HRC meetings moved along there would be no need to change the meeting dates. Commission Chair Low stated that the Mayor had asked him to review the process, therefore, allowing the request to be deferred until such time to determine if rescheduling was in fact necessary.

APPROVAL OF LETTER TO THE STUDENTS AT CITY COLLEGE
Commissioner Herman reported that the mural at City College which reflected diversity had been defaced, specifically the faces of two women kissing. Commissioner Herman stated that he spoke at a press conference commending the students for their courage in designing a mural of diversity. He went on to say that he had requested and received a letter, written by the HRC staff commending the students and staff of City College and a motion was made to approve the letter. Commissioner Knutzen echoed his remarks and seconded the motion. The letter was unanimously approved. Commissioner Herman requested that new letterhead reflecting the names of all of the Commissioners be used on this and all letters from the Commission.

Commissioner Herman stated that at the last meeting the Commission was unanimous in requesting staff to draft a letter commending the work of a former Commissioner and former Chair of the Commission. He noted that it was not in the packet and he asked that the letter come forward at the next meeting to be approved and sent to former Commissioner Comer Marshall.

Commission Chair Low stated that as Chair he could grant that the letter to Comer Marshall be approved and forwarded. Chair Low requested a draft be in the packet and taken up at the next meeting.

Commissioner Jaicks made a suggestion to table the request until clarification could be made regarding comments in the Examiner.

Commission Chair Low said there could be a drafted item that could be tabled at the next meeting, or adopted, or voted down.

Commissioner Knutzen asked to bring up a procedural point. She said she thought that at the last meeting a motion had been passed and she noticed in the minutes there was no mention of that. Commissioner Knutzen said that Commissioner Saliba-Malouf moved and it was seconded, and all the Commissioners made comments of appreciation for Comer's work. She went on to say the Commission had a motion that passed, and Commissioner Herman said it should be honored.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf said that she recalled the discussion, but did not recall specifically if a vote was taken. However she stated she did recall that staff had been instructed to prepare a resolution.

Commissioner Knutzen said staff had been instructed and the Commissioners wanted the letter on the agenda. She stated she noticed it was not in the minutes.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf said it was appropriate that something come forward. She stated she did not know who would draft it, perhaps someone on the Commission. Commissioner Knutzen said a very simple thank you letter should be written, and it was a very standard thing to do for all the Commissioners who work so hard and volunteer their time.

Commission Chair Low suggested with those general comments in mind, staff should prepare a draft.

PUBLIC COMMENT

AMERICAN AIRLINES
Lawrence Yuen stated that he had attended the previous meeting and wanted to know what the update was on the situation and on the research into the retroactive issue. He said he understood that Attorney Susan Frankel found numerous inadequacies in the 12B Ordinance and that there may be some issues that may be expanded to cover them. He said he asked if the coverage would be retroactive and was told no. However, there was precedence. Last year, a rental ordinance was held retroactive. He said there was to be some research to find out what the situation is and he wanted to know what the progress was.

Director Bamba replied that she was not aware of Mr. Yuen's conversation regarding retroactive requests. She stated she had received some information yesterday afternoon from Deputy City Attorney Frankel and she would like to discuss with her in detail some of the issues arising from the research that was done. She stated that it was a little more complicated and she would be issuing a letter to Mr. Yuen and the Commissioners by Wednesday of next week.

Kevin Buggy addressed the Commission stating that he was drained and tired. He said they needed to get their jobs back. He stated that he and his colleagues were fired for nothing and their families are falling apart. He requested help.

Mr. John Siracusa echoed Mr.Buggy and Mr. Yuen. He asked the Commission to not forget them.

Commission Chair Low replied they would not be forgotten and a response would be provided by the following week or so.

Commissioner Herman addressed the Chair stating that the item had been going on for a while. He wondered if there was any way that a speedy answer could be facilitated since these gentlemen had come before the Commission a number of times in a very respectful manner.

Director Bamba said that it was because the gentlemen had come before the Commission so many times that we are not hastily making a decision on this matter. She stated that she deliberately asked her staff to assist the City Attorney to conduct the research. She advised that it was not as easy and straightforward as they thought. She said she would like to make a careful decision and it will be done by Wednesday of next week.

Commission Chair Low commented that he had talked to the Executive Director and they hoped to devise an information sheet that would explain the jurisdiction of the HRC. He advised that although the answer may not be the one that was wanted, we can at least inform you of the timetable, and refer you to the appropriate jurisdiction that can provide you with relief. He stated that once guidelines were in place they would be helpful in future complaints.

Senior Compliance Officer Zula Jones addressed the Chair welcoming him, and introducing her staff , which consisted of Veronica Ng and Virginia Harmon. She said they looked forward to seeing him at the MWB Advisory Committee.

NEW BUSINESS
Commissioner Chey commented on the senseless murder of the Korean shop owner in Visitation Valley. She wondered if it was another hate crime. She suggested issuing a letter to the Police Department to find out what happened.

Director Bamba suggested a resolution be adopted for the family, and Commission Chair Low said the Commission should work closely with the hate crime unit of the Police Department.

Commissioner Watahara had questions regarding the letter from the Coalition for Economic Equity, which was addressed to Director Bamba

Director Bamba replied that a response was being prepared and would be under her report at the next Commission meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned in honor of Gail Roberts who introduced her husband, Chuck Roberts, to the Commission. The time was 6:40 P.M.

NEXT MEETING
DATE: Thursday, May 13, 1999
TIME: 4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

"Amended"

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, APRIL 22, 1999

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 2 2 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Julia Globus-Sabori
Stephen Herman
Agar Jaicks
Martha Knutzen
Harry Low
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Alan Watahara

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 2 2 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART and Metro stations are the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Gail P. Roberts 252-2508 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AMENDED AGENDA #2

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of March 11, 1999
   b) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of March 25, 1999
   c) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of April 8, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community
   b) Approval of letter to Mayor Brown & Board of Supervisors supporting the request of the HIV Mental Health Work Group that funds be provided to the Department of Public Health for HIV-related mental health services

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Report on Complaint Settlements
2. American Airlines Research Issues/Letter
3. Response to Letter from Coalition on Economic Equity
4. Approval of Letter to Police Department Regarding Slain Visitation Valley Small Business Owner

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee Meeting of April 21, 1999

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, May 19, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report from the Committee Meeting of April 15, 1999

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, May 20, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

c) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Policy recommendations regarding same-sex rape among prisoners
2. Follow-up on the Hope VI Project

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will Be held on May 3, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, May 18, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Gail Roberts, Committee Staff

1. No Report from the Committee

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, May 6, 1999, at 12:00 noon at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS
1. Discussion of the duration of Meetings and Changing the meeting Schedule to the 1st and 3rd Thursday of the Month instead of the 2nd and 4th Thursday/Room availability (Deferred until further request)
2. Approval of Resolution/Consideration Letter to Comer Marshall

9. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. VOTE WHETHER TO ENTER INTO CLOSED/EXECUTIVE SESSION

11. PUBLIC COMMENTS RELATED TO THE CLOSED/EXECUTIVE SESSION

12. CLOSED/EXECUTIVE SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B)
    1. Public Employee Performance Evaluation: Executive Director (Time Certain 5:30 P.M.) Goals and Objectives with Executive Director

13. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:
    1. Vote on whether to disclose any discussion held in the closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.14(a)).

14. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, MAY 6, 1999

A:\agenda 4/22/99

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

DOCUMENTS DEPT.
APR 12 2002
SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF APRIL 22, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 4:48 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Present:Harry Low Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf Vice Chair; Youn Chey, Shirley Dimapilis, Stephen Herman, Agar Jaicks, Martha Knutzen, Leslie Littleton, and Alan Watahara

Excused: Julia Globus-Sabori and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

HRC Staff
Present: Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin, Virginia Harmon, Zula Jones, Nichole Truax and Carla Vaughn

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Harry Jamerson, Jamerson Construction; Millard Larkin, Charlie Walker and Lawrence Yuen

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made to approve the March 11, & March 25, minutes with changes, and to table approval of the April 8, 1999 minutes until the next meeting. ***Moved(Herman) Seconded (Knutzen)

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Commissioner Harry Low, Chair, called for Public Comments on any matters that should be on the agenda. There were none.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

Commissioner Harry Low, Chair, called for reports or comments from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Jaicks reported Representative Nancy Pelosi held a town meeting on environmental health. He said it was a remarkable meeting that consisted of the following five member panel: Dr. Richard Jackson, Director National Center for Environmental Health at the Center of Disease Control; Michael Lerner President, Founder of the Common Wheel; Linda Richardson Operation Director at the Southwest Alliance for Environmental Justice; Andrea Martin Founder, Executive Director at the Bronx Cancer Fund; and Gina Solomon, Senior Scientist at the National Resource Defense Council. Commissioner Jaicks reported that it was clear that those present felt that environmental health would be the issue of the 21st century. He noted that lead poisoning, scrubbing toxic materials in research labs, tobacco, and other sources are a major concern for the health of children. Commissioner Jaicks said that he was reminded of the times the Commission had heard and said various things about the BayView Hunters Point and what is happening there with the health of the children and the community. He suggested that the Commission have one of the committees take another look at this issue. Commissioner Jaicks said that he found this to be an extraordinarily important issue that should be researched at the local level. He concluded by noting that the panel felt that the increase in asthma and learning disabilities were related to this issue.

Commissioner Chey reported that she attended a CALWorks showcase that was organized by the Department of Human Services in conjunction with the Private Industry Council. She said she was pleased to see that the City is making a tremendous effort to reduce the number of welfare recipients. Commissioner Chey said that programs were also organized to assist limited English proficient welfare recipients. She concluded by saying she was encouraged by the efforts.

Commissioner Herman reported that he attended a lunch by the Jewish Vocational Services. He said that the three recipients of awards were outstanding individuals. Two were immigrants from Russia and Vietnam, and the third was an African-American student. Commissioner Herman concluded by stating that the lunch was wonderful and presented an opportunity to meet people that are working in the CALWorks vocational area.

Commissioner Dimapilis reported that she represented the community attending parent meetings at Thurgood Marshall and Philip and Sala Burton schools. She said that she also attended the Finance Committee meeting.

Commissioner Herman summarized a letter to the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors, which supported the request of the HIV Mental Health Work Group to provide funding to the Department of Public Health for HIV-related mental health services. He advised the LGBT committee had approved the cover letter. Commissioner Herman said the letter was to be forwarded to the Mayor and Board of Supervisors.

Director Bamba suggested that the item be continued after copies of the cover letter were provided to the Commissioners

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a)HRC Program Unit Activities

AMERICAN AIRLINES
Director Bamba reported that extensive research had been done and a letter had been issued to Mr. Buggy, Mr. Yuen, and Mr. Siracusa. She said the findings indicated that the Human Rights Commission did not have jurisdiction over the areas in which they alleged they had been discriminated. Director Bamba noted that an option had been provided to invite American Airlines to participate in mediation and the complainants responded affirmatively asking the Commission to forward a letter to American Airlines inviting them to participate in the mediation process.

Commissioner Jaicks mentioned receiving a fax that said a Mr. Whitmore was recently fired.

Mr. Yuen, one of the complainants, stated that the fax was from Mr.Siracusa. He also said that a lawsuit was pending against American Airlines. Mr. Yuen said that Mr. Whitmore was terminated the same time American Airlines was served in the lawsuit. Mr. Yuen said avoiding a lawsuit would be beneficial to everyone. Mr. Yuen said he was satisfied with the Commission and thanked the staff and Director for their efforts. He concluded by thanking the Commissioners for their compassion throughout the ordeal.

Commissioner Knutzen followed up by requesting a recommendation to change the law
to allow the Commission jurisdiction over the areas in question with regard to the 12B ordinance. She suggested changes in training so that the process can take less time.

Mr. Yuen commented that Director Bamba was looking into broadening the 12B ordinance to increase effectiveness.

Director Bamba added that revised procedures regarding complaints would be forwarded to the Commissioners at a future meeting. The Director said that Deputy City Attorney, Susan Frankel, would be adding her legal opinion on the matter. She went on to say that President Ammiano was willing to amend 12B to include association.

Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney, stated that Supervisor Ammiano assigned the matter to her. She said the legislation was pending to amend not only 12B but Article 33 of the Police Code and other sections to include 'preventing discrimination on the basis of association with protected classes, or retaliation for complaints made about discrimination against protected classes. Ms. Frankel stated this legislation would help in the future in similar situations

Commissioner Low, Chair, advised that he had asked Director Bamba to look into writing procedures for various

complaints and the re-examination of matters that come before the staff, and suggest methods for re-examination that will help to guide those that are faced with a complaint.

REPORT ON COMPLAINT SETTLEMENTS
Director Bamba provided a presentation that showcased recent successes in complaint settlements. She noted that most often mediation is used to resolve complaints and not penalization. The Director reported 3 complaints regarding sexual orientation, age, and national origin and religion were settled for a total of $80,000. She stated that 2 other complaints in the employment area regarding sexual orientation, gender identity and HIV status amassed a settlement of $105,000. Director Bamba reported that a contracting complaint regarding failure to pay, a partnership agreement that was not followed, and a payment dispute settled in a total amount of $1.1 million. Ms. Bamba mentioned the successful mediation regarding the "Wetback Night" that was held at the Stud Bar. In closing the Director mentioned several other success stories with regard to the mediation process and advised Commission that a complaint tracking system would be implemented.

Commissioner Jaicks congratulated the Director and her staff for their achievements and asked that the staff persons involved be named and received recognition from the Commission.

RESPONSE TO LETTER FROM THE COALITION ON ECONOMIC EQUITY
Director Bamba reported that the Coalition had been advised that the HRC was aware that the report was incomplete and that more data was being compiled from the various department heads.

APPROVAL OF LETTER TO POLICE DEPARTMENT REGARDING SLAIN VISITATION VALLEY SMALL BUSINESS OWNER
Director Bamba invited Commissioner Chey to read the letter to the Commissioners that expressed the concern of the Commission regarding the crime against Suzy Kim and the loss to her family. Commissioner Chey moved to adopt the letter and Commissioner Dimapilis seconded it.

Commissioner Herman suggested that the resolution accompanying the letter should be adopted with changes. The resolution was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Chey asked that the family be invited to attend the next meeting and receive the resolution from the commission

Commissioner Chey questioned a letter from the PUC that allocated $379,000 to hire contract compliance officers. She wondered why the PUC allocated the funds that provided HRC staff to monitor the PUC. Director Bamba reported that an agreement was reached with Mr. Moran regarding the funding of staff to monitor PUC. The Director reported that this is the current funding system, known as a work-order. Commissioner Chey suggested a better mechanism should be found. Director Bamba advised that the Mayor had the same idea and there should be a predetermined allocation instead of negotiating with departments that were also being monitored by the HRC.

Commissioners Herman and Chey had questions regarding the request for letterhead which would include the Commissioners names and the Youth and Education Committee. Director Bamba advised that it was forthcoming.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

MBE/WBE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Dimapilis reported that Zula Jones, Senior Compliance Officer provided insight into the New CityWide Diversity Tracking System. She said Dawn Clements regarding the Employee Retirement System, is on going, also provided a report.

YOUTH AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE
Commissioner Chey advised that a presentation was provided by the Mayor's Office of Children, Youth, & Families. She said the committee was advised that $14.5 million was allocated by MOCYF to serve 55,000 children. Commissioner Chey stated that for the current fiscal year there were 4 priorities: creating safe environments, positive alternatives for children and youth, job training, childcare and family support. Commissioner Chey reported that for period 1999-2000 the fund increased to $16.68 million. She noted, however that this included money set aside at the request of Supervisor Mabel Teng to improve high quality child-care services. She reported that that a new RFP would not be created, but rather the current funded programs would receive the rollover funding. Commissioner Chey reported that the current legislation for MOCYF funding would

end in 2001 therefore the emphasis is on evaluation and accountability. She noted the importance of documenting the impact of the funding on children. She said a publication was created to compile the data. The publication is called "Children's Voices". She stated that the committee would look into that report.

Commissioner Chey reported another item discussed was the current Fact Sheet on the Youth & Education committee. She said some agenda items had been revised and would be adopted at the next meeting. Commissioner Chey stated that the Youth and Education committee decided to support and participate in the Youth Empowerment Conference. She reported the conference is solely organized by youth and supported by the Youth Commission and MOCYF. Commissioner Chey said the committee would assist in outreach and have a table for sharing information on the Youth & Education committee of the Human Rights Commission. She noted that at the next meeting reports would be provided from two Task Forces, the Convention on the Rights of Children and the Youth Violence Task Force. Commissioner Chey said that the Youth Violence Task Force will look at the recommendation more seriously in view of the horrors in Colorado.

ISSUES COMMITTEE

POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING SAME-SEX RAPE AMONG PRISONERS
Commissioner Jaicks reported that there had not been any further progress regarding a policy recommendation for same-sex rape. He asked Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney, if the subpoena power of the Human Rights Commission extended to the committee level. Commissioner Jaicks said there was a problem getting the guards to the meetings.

Susan Frankel responded stating that the Commission has subpoena power and in order for it to be properly asserted the committee would need to ask the Commission to issue the subpoenas.

Commissioner Jaicks said the committee would pass on the policy recommendation for now.

FOLLOW-UP ON THE HOPE VI PROJECT
Commissioner Jaicks reported the follow-up on the Hope VI Project would be provided after a meeting between Director Bamba and Ronnie Davis, the Director of the Housing Authority.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

DISCUSSION OF THE DURATION OF MEETINGS AND CHANGING THE MEETING SCHEDULE TO THE 1ST AND 3RD THURSDAY OF THE MONTH INSTEAD OF THE 2ND AND 4TH THURSDAY/ROOM AVAILABILITY
Commissioner Herman removed the item regarding changing the meeting schedule.

APPROVAL OF RESOLUTION/CONSIDERATION LETTER TO COMER MARSHALL
Commissioner Knutzen said Comer Marshall should be thanked as Chair of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee. She said he should be recognized in the letter for his service on the committee for two years. Commissioner Littleton suggested some success stories be mentioned. Commissioner Knutzen said that the accomplishments of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee reflected such successes. Commissioner Herman moved to accept the letter with the additions and read the letter for public record.

Commissioner Jaicks suggested the letter be tabled until further discussion based on the recent developments in the press regarding confidential matters that were disclosed. Commissioner Dimapilis echoed Commissioner Jaicks.

Commissioner Herman said the letter was a reflection of Mr. Marshall's service to the Commission and his activities should be recognized. Commissioner Littleton and Commissioner Chey echoed Commissioner Herman. Commissioner Chey requested that copies be sent to the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors. She requested that the "Sook Kim" letter be forwarded to the Mayor and Board of Supervisors also.

Commissioner Jaicks stated that there were some important issues before the Commission and they all were sworn to confidentiality. He said that no one had a right to violate confidentiality.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Charlie Walker, representing the African-American Truckers and some contractors in the BayView Hunters Point area, stated that he had observed that every community was represented on the Commission except the African-

American community. He said there was a meeting in his office and many people from the community were opposed to the commendation letter. He noted that although the African-American community had created the agency there was no representation for them there, so they decided to petition the City to form an African-American Human Rights Committee. He said that Comer Marshall was not a representative of the African-American community.

Millard Larkin echoed Mr. Walker's comments, adding that every Commissioner should look out for every citizen.

Mr. Harry Jamerson of Jamerson Construction said Mr. Marshall was a dedicated worker. Mr. Jamerson expressed concern regarding the lack of representation for the African-American community.

Commissioner Watahara motioned to table the issue. The motion was rejected. The main motion to accept and send the commendation letter to Comer Marshall was approved.

CLOSED EXECUTIVE SESSION
Commissioner Herman moved to enter closed executive session. Commissioner Dimapilis seconded it.

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION
Commissioner Harry Low, Chair requested staff provide meeting materials earlier.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 6:43.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, May 13, 1999
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

Amended Agenda

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, MAY 13, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

Fax Copy 1st Posted 5/10/99 pc

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAY 13 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Mary Gin Starkweather 252-2527 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us
TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AMENDED AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of April 8, 1999
   b) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of April 22, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community
   b) Assignment of Commissioner Leslie Littleton to the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

6. WHA SOOK KIM RESOLUTION AND LETTER TO POLICE CHIEF

a) Presentation of Commission Resolution to the Kim Family
b) Report on status of investigation by Police

7. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Employment Assessment Update
2. Report on Staff Sessions
3. Activities/Discussions with local Universities/Colleges:
   City College
   S.F. State University – Forum on civil partnerships
4. Schindler vs. City and County of San Francisco update
5. Resolution supporting the First Annual Asian Pacific Heritage Month

8. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
   Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
   Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
   Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report on the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee meeting of April 21, 1999.

   a) Follow-up on the Employee Retirement System presentation to the Commission.

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, May 19, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Report on the Issues Committee meeting of May 3, 1999.

   a) Request for the City to endorse and support State Senate Bill 78, the California Traffic Stops Statistics Act a copy of which is attached.
   b) Letter thanking the Chief of Police for agreeing to begin voluntarily collecting data on traffic stops to determine whether racial profiling is occurring in San Francisco.

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will
Be held on June 7, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

c) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will
Be held on Thursday, May 20, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE: *The next meeting of the*
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will
Be held on Tuesday, May 18, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, June 3, 1999, at 12:00 noon at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

9. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

10. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

11. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, MAY 13, 1999

A:\agenda 5/13/99

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

7/99
cted

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

Agenda

THURSDAY, MAY 27, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Choy	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAY 25 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

99-05-25A11:12 RCVD

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Mary Gin Starkweather 252-2527 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us
TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of May 13, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

6. Approval of Resolutions Supporting Filipino Veterans

   a) Resolution Supporting Filipino Veteran Equity Center (***)
   b) Resolution Supporting Federal Legislation for Filipino Veterans (***)

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Presentation on "Victims of Crime Program" by District Attorney's Office (*)
2. Fair Housing Program Unit Presentation/Report (*)
3. Update on Taber vs. City and County of San Francisco (*)
4. Update on Status of 12D Annual Report
   (a) Review/Approval of Recommendations

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
   Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
   Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
   Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
   Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of May 18, 1999 (*)
2. Report of the Annual Retreat held May 22, 1999 (*)
3. Approval of letter to Secretary of State Madeleine Albright expressing concern about anti-gay violence in Mexico (**)

NOTE: *The next meeting of the*
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will
Be held on Tuesday, June 15, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Issues Committee
   Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
   Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
   Dom Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will
Be held on June 7, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

c) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Yoom-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, June 17, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

d) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1 No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, June 16, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Sahba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pamsy Waller, Committee Staff

1 No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, June 3, 1999, at 12:00 noon at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

9. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10 ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, JUNE 10, 1999

A:\agenda 5/27/99

LEGEND	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 19 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF MAY 27, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present: Harry Low Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf Vice Chair; Shirley Dimapilis; Stephen Herman; Agar Jaicks; Martha Knutzen; Leslie Littleton; Antonio Salazar-Hobson; and Alan Watahara

Excused: Julia Globus-Sabori

HRC Staff
Present: Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin; Emil DeGuzman; Virginia Harmon; Don Hesse; Ed Ilumin; Zula Jones; Nichole Truax; Carla Vaughn; and Pansy Waller

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Supporters of the Filipino Veteran Equity Center; Trisha Stapleton District Attorney's Office; and Oli Sadler Chief of Financial Systems of the Department of Telecommunications

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
A motion was made to table the May 13 minutes until the next meeting. ***Moved (Herman) Seconded (Knutzen)

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.
PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were none.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

Resolutions supporting the Filipino Veteran Equity Center and Federal legislation for Filipino Veterans were unanimously approved.***Moved (Chey)***Seconded(Jaicks).

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a)HRC Program Unit Activities

VICTIMS OF CRIME PROGRAM
Trisha Stapleton of the District Attorney's Office provided a presentation on the "Victims of Crime Program."
FAIR HOUSING PROGRAM UNIT
Director Bamba introduced Don Hesse, HRC staff person, who provided a presentation from the Fair Housing Program Unit.

Mr. Hesse, coordinator of the Dispute Resolution Unit provided a report with emphasis on the Fair Housing work, which he stated, was the primary focus and area of activity. Mr. Hesse informed the Commission that the Dispute Resolution Unit covered a variety of other issues such as Public Accommodations, Hate Crimes, and Immigration

Issues. Mr. Hesse stated that two committees operate under the Dispute Resolution Unit and they are the Issues Committee and the Youth and Education Committee.

Mr. Hesse stated that the City laws prohibit discrimination based on race, religion, age, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity, disability, and source of income with respect to Fair Housing. Mr. Hesse mentioned that City laws also prohibit discrimination based on the number of people in a family.

Mr. Hesse was joined by HRC staffers Ed Ilumin and Emil DeGuzman who commented further on the laws, the enforcement of them, as well as specific complaints.

Mr. Hesse reported on the City laws regarding Public Accommodations and noted that the remedy was mediation. He stated that a coalition had been set up and a lot of people were being brought together to work in this area. Hesse informed the Commission that businesses would be educated to understand that they had a responsibility in their treatment of the public.

Mr. Hesse stated that the third area was Hate Violence and the Intergroup Clearinghouse (IC), which was created at the request of the Human Rights Commission. IC handles the hate crime complaints and monitors the City's response.

In closing Mr. Hesse mentioned the City of Refuge Ordinance, which prohibits any city employee from assisting in the enforcement of federal immigration laws or inquiring about the immigration status of people in San Francisco.

Commissioner's Jaicks and Herman had questions regarding the function of the Intergroup Clearinghouse. Mr. Hesse advised that the Intergroup Clearinghouse is involved with the San Francisco Police Department, the District Attorney's Office and a variety of community organizations concerned with prejudice-based violence and Intergroup conflict.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson reported a personal incident involving a hate crime and noted that the Human Rights Commission put him in touch with the Intergroup Clearinghouse, which was very helpful. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson congratulated Mr. Hesse and his staff for their victories and encouraged him to keep the Commission informed of future activities.

Commissioner Knutzen expressed an interest in knowing if there were any plans to include women in the statistical count.

Commissioner Watahara asked that race and ethnicity be added to the next statistical count.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf had questions regarding language barriers. Mr. Hesse reported that the unit heard from many students that were handling issues for non-English speaking parents who were often frustrated with the process. He concluded that there was still a lot of work to do.

Commissioner Herman had questions regarding age discrimination in housing.

UPDATE ON STATUS OF CITYWIDE DIVERSITY TRACKING SYSTEM
Oli Sadler, Chief of Financial Systems of the Department of Telecommunications provided a report on the technical aspects of the Tracking System. Ms. Sadler stated that with the help of Ms. Zula Jones and Ms. Virginia Harmon the Tracking System had been implemented after some minor modifications. Ms. Sadler informed the Commission that Mr. John Waite, a staff person from her department, had been sent to the HRC offices to make sure the HRC staff was comfortable with the system and understood how to use it.

Director Bamba thanked Ms. Sadler, Ms. Jones, & Ms. Harmon for their efforts.

Ms. Virginia Harmon, Contract Compliance Officer, advised the Commission that her department was in the process of analyzing the data that had been extracted. She stated that a report would be issued on June 1 which would contain a disparity analysis of citywide contracting on the prime level and the sub-contracting level.
Ms. Harmon reported that she and John Waite had begun the process to train new departments.
Ms. Harmon also noted that the Board of Supervisors had been asked to adopt a recommendation to assist in the implementation of the Diversity Tracking System and to date has not done so.

UPDATE ON TABER VS. CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
Director Bamba reported that the City Attorney's office informed her that the City had prevailed in this particular

situation. She requested that a future briefing be provided by the City Attorney's office in regard to this lawsuit and others.

Larry Brinkin, HRC staff person, stated that the details would be forth coming in regard to the current victory.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

LGBT ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Herman reported that the May 18 meeting was good and new members were introduced. He stated that the retreat had been a success. He noted that one of the issues brought up by the committee members was the structure of the meetings.

Commissioner Knutzen commented on the role of the Commissioners and their duties within the committees.

Commissioner Herman asked that staff look at the guidelines for committee members. He also advised that two task forces had been created to address specific goals within the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender community. Commissioner Herman stated that one was the
Economic Development Task Force and the other was the Diana Jaicks Anti-Racism Task Force which was named in honor of Commissioner Jaick's wife for all of her work in that area.

Mr. Larry Brinkin stated that the Diana Jaicks Anti-Racism Task Force is going to be working on two projects continuing from the previous year. He said that a piece of literature was being developed to coincide with the Pride Day Parade. Mr. Brinkin said that the literature asked the LGBT Community to honestly look at the issue of racism within their community. He reported that the Task Force would be organizing a day of observation in the year 2000 where committee members and other people in the community will spend a certain number of hours looking strictly at racism. Mr. Brinkin concluded this part of his report by stating that the Economic Development Task Force would be preparing a public forum on economic issues in the community, especially focusing on housing.

Commissioner Jaicks commented on the retreat and echoed the feelings of Commissioner Knutzen regarding guidelines for committee members.

Commissioner Herman moved to approve a letter to Secretary of State Madeleine Albright expressing concern about anti-gay violence in Mexico. ***Seconded (Dimapilis). The letter was unanimously approved.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS
Director Bamba invited Mr. Hesse, HRC staff person to comment on a letter regarding racial profiling that had been mentioned at the previous meeting. Mr. Hesse stated that a letter would be forwarded to the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Littleton mentioned there would be a report from the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee at the next meeting. She also requested that an update be provided on the racial profiling issue.

Commissioner Dimapilis mentioned the Clare Murphy letter and Director Bamba said she had some suggestions for the Commissioners participation.

Commissioner Watahara questioned the feasibility of holding the Commission meetings in the community.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson noted he would be in negotiations with the Governor's office until June on behalf of California Indians.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 6:43 P.M.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, June 10, 1999
TIME: 4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

: Agenda

REGULAR MEETING

Fax Copy 1st Posted 6/7/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUN 08 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THURSDAY, JUNE 10, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

06-08-99P02:52 RCVD

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available npon reqnest with 48-homr advance notice: American Sign Langnage interpreters, nse of a reader dnring a meeting or sonnd enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Mary Gin Starkweather 252-2527 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, mnltiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at pnblic meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.sfhumanrights.org.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA DRAFT

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of May 13, 1999
   b) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of May 27, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

   a) Approval of Resolution encouraging Board of Supervisors to add "Body Size" as a Protected Category in San Francisco's Anti-Discrimination Ordinances.

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Review of 12D Annual Report
2. FY 1999-2000 Budget Update

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, CoChair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of May 20, 1999 (*)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, June 17, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of June 3, 1999 (*)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, July 1, 1999, at 12:00 noon at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

c) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, June 16, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, June 15, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

e) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will Be held on July 5, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

9. NEW BUSINESS - REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, JUNE 24, 1999

A:\agenda 6/10/99

LEGEND:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 19 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

/99 MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF JUNE 10, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Present: Harry Low Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf Vice Chair; Youn-Cha Shin Chey; Shirley Dimapilis; Agar Jaicks; Leslie Littleton; and Alan Watahara

Excused: Julia Globus-Sabori; Stephen Herman; Martha Knutzen; Antonio Salazar-Hobson

HRC Staff
Present: Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin; Virginia Harmon; Don Hesse; Nichole Truax; Kevin Williams; Carla Vaughn; and Joyce Smith

Guests
Present: Jackie Minor, Deputy City Attorney; Louis Calabro, Marilyn Wann, Carol Volansky, Arthur Jackson, Frances White, Joanne Ikeda, Margarita Rossi, Laurie Edison, Pat Lyons, Carol Collum, Mara Math, Sondra Solovay, Tom Geller, and Tomas Lee

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approval of the May 13 minutes, and the May 27 minutes were deferred to the end of the meeting.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Following a call for public comments from Commission Chair Harry Low, Mr. Louis Calabro, President of the European American Issues Forum addressed the Commission. Mr. Calabro stated that his organization was a rights group of volunteers. He stated that he did not know where to begin and that there seemed to be a systemic problem within the City dealing with his organization. He said there has always been some problems in dealing with the bureaucratic system, but filed complaints were treated seriously and with great respect. Mr. Calabro said that things seem different today. He continued, "There does not seem to be any regard or respect for the process that is in place for pursuing a grievance. We have filed complaints with this Commission and other City Departments about issues that concern members of our organization. They just seem to be ignored or treated in a cavalier way." Mr. Calabro said that the Commissions basic mandate is to be a vanguard against all forms of discrimination. He stated that it seems to do that, if other than European Americans are involved. Mr. Calabro ended by stating that his organization was clearly frustrated. He asked, "Is there a member of this Commission who is willing to meet with us and discuss these complaints, some of which are quite serious?"

Commission Chair Harry Low responded assuring Mr. Calabro that the Commission was designed to look out for the Human Rights of everyone. Commission Chair Low said that he pledged himself to follow that mandate and he invited Mr. Calabro to write out an agenda if he had items or specific complaints that needed attention, or investigation. Commission Chair Low concluded stating that the whole goal of Human Rights was human rights everyone.

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTION ENCOURAGING BOARD OF SUPERVISORS TO ADD "BODY SIZE" AS A PROTECTED CATEGORY IN SAN FRANCISCO'S ANTI-DISCRIMINATION ORDINANCES

In the absence of Commissioner Knutzen, Larry Brinkin, HRC Staff Person, introduced the Resolution and welcomed Tomas Lee from Supervisor Ammiano's office. Mr. Brinkin said that Commissioner Knutzen wanted to convey her appreciation to Supervisor Ammiano for introducing this legislation at the Board level. He stated that the Human Rights Commission, especially under Mayor Brown, has been very aggressive about assuring that all classes of people who face discrimination in San Francisco are protected. Mr. Brinkin said that at the request of Commission Knutzen the Commission wrote to 24 Hr. Fitness, Inc. a couple of months ago to protest the advertising campaign which unfairly targeted fat people. Mr. Brinkin stated that due to the publicity surrounding this letter Commissioner Knutzen was pleased to get a lot of support for our efforts. He continued, "People really responded on this issue as one of fairness to all people and were pleased the City and the Commission were finally speaking up for people of all body sizes."
"As you will hear from today's testimonies Commissioners," he continued, "body size discrimination is very real and very intentional." Mr. Brinkin said that testimony would show that it results in talented people being turned down for jobs without regard to their qualifications. He continued, "They are unable to find and keep housing and are intentionally mistreated by businesses and agencies based only on body size. Bias based on body size also has serious social ramifications in which people deemed to be too fat, or too thin, too short, or too tall, or not proportioned correctly, are taunted, laughed at, ignored, judged, scorned, and attacked verbally and physically." Mr. Brinkin stated, "Bias based on body size often targets its victims at an early age causing low self esteem in children, adolesence, and adults. This results in depression, eating disorders, and suicide. Commissioner herself faced this discrimination asa young girl and she can attest to everyone of these results in her young life. We will hear today about the discrimination young people face, including how they are denied equal education and often treated as though they are mentally deficient, often being placed in remedial education classes. Bias based on body size results from the ignorance of our society which seeks scapegoats, and which makes incorrect assumptions about peoples health, abilities, and worth. We will hear today from those who will describe the barberic methods often suggested for imp[roving body size, which could have fatal results on peoples health, and Commissioners this is a very historic hearing today. It's always historic when we talk about extending Human Rights to any group of people. Once again, San Francisco though not the first city in the country, is certainly leading the way in showing the rest of the.country that we respect and value all people." Mr. Brinkin stated that at the conclusion of the hearing a draft resolution would be presented to vote on and send to the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor. Mr. Brinkin introduced Tomas lee from Supervisor Ammiano's office.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

Resolutions supporting the Filipino Veteran Equity Center and Federal legislation for Filipino Veterans were unanimously approved.***Moved (Chey)***Seconded(Jaicks).

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a)HRC Program Unit Activities

VICTIMS OF CRIME PROGRAM
Trisha Stapleton of the District Attorney's Office provided a presentation on the "Victims of Crime Program."

FAIR HOUSING PROGRAM UNIT
Director Bamba introduced Don Hesse, HRC staff person, who provided a presentation from the Fair Housing Program Unit.

Mr. Hesse, coordinator of the Dispute Resolution Unit provided a report with emphasis on the Fair Housing work, which he stated, was the primary focus and area of activity. Mr. Hesse informed the Commission that the Dispute Resolution Unit covered a variety of other issues such as Public Accommodations, Hate Crimes, and Immigration Issues. Mr. Hesse stated that two committees operate under the Dispute Resolution Unit and they are the Issues Committee and the Youth and Education Committee.

Mr. Hesse stated that the City laws prohibit discrimination based on race, religion, age, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity, disability, and source of income with respect to Fair Housing. Mr. Hesse mentioned that City laws also prohibit discrimination based on the number of people in a family.

Mr. Hesse was joined by HRC staffers Ed Ilumin and Emil DeGuzman who commented further on the laws, the

enforcement of them, as well as specific complaints.

Mr. Hesse reported on the City laws regarding Public Accommodations and noted that the remedy was mediation. He stated that a coalition had been set up and a lot of people were being brought together to work in this area. Hesse informed the Commission that businesses would be educated to understand that they had a responsibility in their treatment of the public.

Mr. Hesse stated that the third area was Hate Violence and the Intergroup Clearinghouse (IC), which was created at the request of the Human Rights Commission. IC handles the hate crime complaints and monitors the City's response.

In closing Mr. Hesse mentioned the City of Refuge Ordinance, which prohibits any city employee from assisting in the enforcement of federal immigration laws or inquiring about the immigration status of people in San Francisco.

Commissioner's Jaicks and Herman had questions regarding the function of the Intergroup Clearinghouse. Mr. Hesse advised that the Intergroup Clearinghouse is involved with the San Francisco Police Department, the District Attorney's Office and a variety of community organizations concerned with prejudice-based violence and Intergroup conflict.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson reported a personal incident involving a hate crime and noted that the Human Rights Commission put him in touch with the Intergroup Clearinghouse, which was very helpful. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson congratulated Mr. Hesse and his staff for their victories and encouraged him to keep the Commission informed of future activities.

Commissioner Knutzen expressed an interest in knowing if there were any plans to include women in the statistical count.

Commissioner Watahara asked that race and ethnicity be added to the next statistical count.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf had questions regarding language barriers. Mr. Hesse reported that the unit heard from many students that were handling issues for non-English speaking parents who were often frustrated with the process. He concluded that there was still a lot of work to do.

Commissioner Herman had questions regarding age discrimination in housing.

UPDATE ON STATUS OF CITYWIDE DIVERSITY TRACKING SYSTEM
Oli Sadler, Chief of Financial Systems of the Department of Telecommunications provided a report on the technical aspects of the Tracking System. Ms. Sadler stated that with the help of Ms. Zula Jones and Ms. Virginia Harmon the Tracking System had been implemented after some minor modifications. Ms. Sadler informed the Commission that Mr. John Waite, a staff person from her department, had been sent to the HRC offices to make sure the HRC staff was comfortable with the system and understood how to use it.

Director Bamba thanked Ms. Sadler, Ms. Jones, & Ms. Harmon for their efforts.

Ms. Virginia Harmon, Contract Compliance Officer, advised the Commission that her department was in the process of analyzing the data that had been extracted. She stated that a report would be issued on June 1 which would contain a disparity analysis of citywide contracting on the prime level and the sub-contracting level.
Ms. Harmon reported that she and John Waite had begun the process to train new departments.
Ms. Harmon also noted that the Board of Supervisors had been asked to adopt a recommendation to assist in the implementation of the Diversity Tracking System and to date has not done so.

UPDATE ON TABER VS. CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
Director Bamba reported that the City Attorney's office informed her that the City had prevailed in this particular situation. She requested that a future briefing be provided by the City Attorney's office in regard to this lawsuit and others.

Larry Brinkin, HRC staff person, stated that the details would be forth coming in regard to the current victory.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

LGBT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Commissioner Herman reported that the May 18 meeting was good and new members were introduced. He stated that the retreat had been a success. He noted that one of the issues brought up by the committee members was the structure of the meetings.

Commissioner Knutzen commented on the role of the Commissioners and their duties within the committees.

Commissioner Herman asked that staff look at the guidelines for committee members. He also advised that two task forces had been created to address specific goals within the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender community. Commissioner Herman stated that one was the
Economic Development Task Force and the other was the Diana Jaicks Anti-Racism Task Force which was named in honor of Commissioner Jaick's wife for all of her work in that area.

Mr. Larry Brinkin stated that the Diana Jaicks Anti-Racism Task Force is going to be working on two projects continuing from the previous year. He said that a piece of literature was being developed to coincide with the Pride Day Parade. Mr. Brinkin said that the literature asked the LGBT Community to honestly look at the issue of racism within their community. He reported that the Task Force would be organizing a day of observation in the year 2000 where committee members and other people in the community will spend a certain number of hours looking strictly at racism. Mr. Brinkin concluded this part of his report by stating that the Economic Development Task Force would be preparing a public forum on economic issues in the community, especially focusing on housing.

Commissioner Jaicks commented on the retreat and echoed the feelings of Commissioner Knutzen regarding guidelines for committee members.

Commissioner Herman moved to approve a letter to Secretary of State Madeleine Albright expressing concern about anti-gay violence in Mexico. ***Seconded (Dimapilis). The letter was unanimously approved.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS
Director Bamba invited Mr. Hesse, HRC staff person to comment on a letter regarding racial profiling that had been mentioned at the previous meeting. Mr. Hesse stated that a letter would be forwarded to the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Littleton mentioned there would be a report from the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee at the next meeting. She also requested that an update be provided on the racial profiling issue.

Commissioner Dimapilis mentioned the Clare Murphy letter and Director Bamba said she had some suggestions for the Commissioners participation.

Commissioner Watahara questioned the feasibility of holding the Commission meetings in the community.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson noted he would be in negotiations with the Governor's office until June on behalf of California Indians.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 6:43 P.M.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, June 10, 1999
TIME: 4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

F
80
1
124/99

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

5 09/11
faxed copy on 6/21/99
DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUN 2 9 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

06-29-99P12:39 RCVD

THURSDAY, JUNE 24, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Mary Gin Starkweather 252-2527 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of June 10, 1999 (***)

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

   a) HRC Program Unit Activities

   1. Update on Complaint Procedures
   2. Update on Meeting regarding San Francisco Employees Retirement System
   3. Presentation on Community Based Organization Analysis (**)

7. RESOLUTION SUPPORTING SURVIVORS INTERNATIONALS WORK & EVENTS HELD ON JUNE 26

8. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, July 15, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of June 3, 1999

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, July 1, 1999, at 12:00 noon at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

c) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report from Commissioner Littleton

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, July 21, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

12. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

1. Possible report on action taken in closed session (Govt. Code section 54957.1(a) (2) and SF Admin Code section 67.14 (b) (2).)
2. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions held in closed session (SF Admin Code section 67.14 (a).)

13. PUBLIC COMMENT RELATED TO THE 2ND CLOSED SESSION(agenda item #15)

14. VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION TO CONFER WITH LEGAL COUNSEL. (SF ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.11(A).)

15. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54956.9 AND SF ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.11(B).

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – EXISTING LITIGATION

1. Airline Transport Association v. city and County of San Francisco
2. S.D. Meyers v. City and County of San Francisco

16. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

1. Possible report on action taken in closed session (Govt. Code section 54957.1 (a) (2) and SF Admin Code section 67.14 (b) (2).)
2. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions held in closed session (SF Admin Code section 67.14 (a).)

17. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

18. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

19. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, JULY 8, 1999

A:\agenda 6/24/99

LEGEND: (*) = Oral Report No Attachment
(**) = Attachment Provided
(***) = To be distributed at Commission Meeting

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of June 15, 1999

NOTE: *The next meeting of the*
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will
Be held on Tuesday, July 20, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

e) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of June 7, 1999

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will
Be held on July 5, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

9. PUBLIC COMMENT RELATED TO THE CLOSED SESSION(agenda item #11)

10. VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION TO CONFER WITH LEGAL COUNSEL. (SF ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.11(A).)

11. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54956.9(c) ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.11(b).

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – ANTICIPATED LITIGATION

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 19 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

/99 MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF JUNE 24, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present: Harry Low Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf Vice Chair; Shirley Dimapilis; Agar Jaicks; Leslie Littleton; and Alan Watahara

Excused: Youn-Cha Shin Chey; Julia Globus-Sabori; Stephen Herman; and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

HRC Staff
Present: Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin; Don Hesse; Mary Tramil; Nichole Truax; Carla Vaughn; and Pansy Waller

Guests
Present: Jackie Minor, Deputy City Attorney; Spike Kahn; and Marcello Estrada

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approval of the June 10 Commission Meeting Minutes were deferred.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

UC STANFORD HEALTHCARE LAYOFF
Spike Kahn, a union representative, spoke on behalf of 2,500 workers. She stated that many workers at Mt. Zion Hospital, a facility serving a large minority community, were facing the loss of employment due to a decision to cut costs by releasing food and laundry workers who are primarily minorities. Ms. Kahn stated that the CEO, makes $450,000 yearly and his salary was not cut for the sake of the budget.

Commission Chair Harry Low inquired as to whether Ms. Kahn had lodged the complaint with any other branch of the city government.

Ms. Kahn stated that she had filed the complaint with the Office of Fair Contract Compliance and was scheduled to interview with them on June 25. However, she noted that the process was slow, and the OFCC was only concerned with the impact on Title 7. Ms. Kahn said this was an issue for the Human Rights Commission to protect not only the people being laid off, but also the community, which was served.

Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf suggested that the Employment Committee take up the issue.

Ms. Kahn invited the Commissioners to attend public meetings, which would be held on July 23rd, and 29th.

Regarding the closure of emergency rooms Commissioner Jaicks reported that he had attended a meeting at Mt.

Zion Hospital. He asked if Kaiser or St. Mary's Hospital had any bearing on the issue.

Ms. Kahn stated that the emergency room doctors had issued a report saying that ambulances do not go to Kaiser if you are not a Kaiser patient.

Commissioner Jaicks asked if it would be appropriate to move to hold a hearing at a full commission meeting.

Commission Chair Harry Low suggested staff research the issue and determine jurisdiction.

Director Bamba spoke with Pansy Waller, Employment Committee staff person and announced that the issue would be agendized for the next Employment Committee Meeting.

Ms. Kahn noted that UCSF has a large contract with The City. She added that UC Stanford Healthcare has a City contract specifically for industrial injuries of city employees. She stated that instead of going to San Francisco General after hours, they were directed to the Mt. Zion emergency room.

Ms. Kahn said they were to be seen within 15 - 30 minutes. However, due to the lay off of all the admitting workers, that time was now doubled.

Commissioner Littleton asked for a review of the timeline and where the meeting would be held.

Ms. Kahn said the public June 29 meeting would be at 12 noon in room 263 at City Hall, and the community meeting would be Tuesday, July 16, from 7pm to 9pm at Mt. Zion Hospital on the second floor.(Located at 1600 Divisadero Street) Ms. Kahn reported that the Regents of California were putting it on the agenda of their Wednesday Regents Meeting where the Health Service Committee would be hearing testimony on July 14. She noted there would be hearings on the state level and she would get back with those dates.

Commission Chair Low encouraged Ms. Kahn to discuss the issue with the HRC staff, specifically Ms. Pansy Waller.

Commissioner Littleton had questions regarding the actual closing date.

Ms. Kahn responded that 11:30 am, July 23rd was when the UC Stanford Healthcare Board of Directors will meet. In closing Ms. Kahn stated that Mt. Zion would either be closed completely, or made into an outpatient clinic with no more than 3-day stays. Other options were a cancer center, or children's hospital as in the past.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

UPDATE ON COMPLAINT INVESTIGATIONS
Director Bamba reported that the investigation was continuing regarding the termination of Mr. Green, and if in fact discrimination played a role. Commissioner Jaicks thanked the Director for continuing the investigation. Director Bamba reported that an investigation being conducted regarding the Port was relative to a joint venture that had utilized a minority business inappropriately. She stated that a third investigation was relative to a Finding she had provided last December. The Director reported that the advice of the City Attorney had been followed.

UPDATE ON COMPLAINT PROCEDURES
Director Bamba reported that HRC staff members Larry Brinkin, Mary Gin Starkweather, Virginia Harmon, and Nichole Truax have been diligently involved in creating a manual for complaint handling. She stated that there are many rules and regulations for mandates that the Commission has adopted, and they have to be cleaned up.

Director Bamba and Staff offered an alternative to requesting approval of each rule and regulation for each ordinance and article. Their recommendation is to create one Rules and Regulations for the Human Rights Commission to cover all mandates. Director Bamba suggested that two sections be created to detail procedures for handling complaints and appeals. Larry Brinkin, staff person, who confirmed that current rules and procedures are being looked at carefully, joined the Director. Mr. Brinkin stated that staff was also looking ordinance by ordinance to make sure that there is nothing in the ordinance that is not reflected correctly in the rules.

Mr. Brinkin said that one document containing all of the rules and procedures would make more sense to the public and to the staff that has to work on complaints. Mr. Brinkin continued stating that two sections in the document would provide distinction between Ordinance 12D and all other Ordinances.

Commission Chair Harry Low asked for a target completion date. Mr. Brinkin responded that the document would be provided at the August 12 Commission Meeting. Director Bamba added that the two products provided would be (1) a Human Rights Commission Rules and Regulations, and (2) the Procedures Manual for staff.

Commissioner Knutzen requested an Executive Summary for the Commissioners and the public. Director Bamba advised that an Executive Summary could be provided for the Commissioners along with a handout for the public. Commissioner Knutzen commended the Director and her staff.

UPDATE ON BUDGET
Director Bamba reported that the budget was intact and all requests had been approved. In conclusion the Director acknowledged the hard work of Joyce Smith, staff person.

UPDATE ON MEETING REGARDING THE SAN FRANCISCO EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM
Director Bamba reported meeting with Commissioner Littleton and Clare Murphy of the Retirement System. She said the meeting was productive and Commissioner Littleton would provide a report to her committee and Ms. Murphy would be providing a response to some of the inquiries made before the Commission. Director Bamba noted that Clare Murphy had advised that included in her upcoming budget would be an amount for a consulting contract that would be used to monitor the Retirement System. She concluded adding that Commissioner Littleton would be involved in the process.

Commission Chair Harry Low asked for a date when the issue would be resolved. He continued stating that it would be helpful to learn what cannot be disclosed. He suggested a second opinion be obtained from the City Attorney. Commissioner Littleton responded that several attorneys might be consulted due to the nature of the issue.

UPDATE ON PLANS REGARDING GAY PRIDE PARADE
Director Bamba reminded the Commission of the upcoming event and invited Larry Brinkin, staff person to more information. Mr. Brinkin said he hoped everyone would participate and he provided copies of the literature that would be handed out at the parade. The literature included a special pamphlet on racism that was designed by Tamara Winchester, staff person.

Commissioner Jaicks commended the LGBTH Committee for the pamphlet on racism, which was dedicated to his wife and family.

PRESENTATION ON COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATION ANALYSIS
Director Bamba introduced Mary Tramil, staff person, who was hired to oversee some of the employment activities because of her expertise in the recruitment process. Ms. Tramil said she had provided an assessment of community based organizations and what they were doing regarding employment in San Francisco, and especially in regard to construction employment. Ms. Tramil provided the names of 12 hands-on construction programs.
Ms. Tramil stated that the programs are funded in several ways. (1) Federal Agencies (2) Local and City Agencies (3) Private Funds. Ms. Tramil continued that the hard part starts after graduating, when placement is needed. Ms. Tramil provided an overview of the manual she created, at the suggestion of Kevin Williams, HRC Airport staff manager.

Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf commended Ms. Tramil for her work and the report. Regarding advocacy, Commissioner Saliba-Malouf requested suggestions to increase apprenticeship, and minorities/women on the jobs. Ms. Tramil suggested that after job developers are trained they should be invited to pre-construction meetings from all the departments.

Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf asked who decided if job developers would be invited to pre-construction meetings. Ms. Tramil responded that any compliance officer could make the decision.

Commissioner Jaicks questioned how discrimination affected the issue. Ms. Tramil responded that knowing it existed was no reason to allow oneself to be held back.

Commissioner Dimapilis thanked Ms. Tramil stating that the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee had been asking for a document like this one at their last meeting.

Commissioner Littleton invited Ms. Tramil to provide her presentation at the next MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee meeting.

Commissioner Knutzen asked for a one page handout or brochure that could be used to provide outreach to the communities. Ms. Tramil advised that a brochure would be created.

RESOLUTION SUPPORTING UN INTERNATIONAL DAY IN SUPPORT OF TORTURE VICTIMS
Marcello Estrada of the Survivors International Agency, stated that there are many victims and survivors of torture in the City. Mr. Estrada thanked the Commissioners for hearing him and noted that June 26 was recognized by the United Nations as a special day in memory and support of torture victims throughout the world.

Commissioner Dimapilis thanked Mr. Estrada and read the Resolution which was adopted by the Commission.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

MBE/WBE/LBE ADVISORY COMITTEE
Commissioner Littleton reported that Zula Jones, HRC staff person provided a presentation at the May 19th meeting. She said the presentation summarized all the
Amendments regarding the 12D Ordinance that had taken place since November. Commissioner Littleton stated that community outreach was also discussed and guidelines would be set at the upcoming retreat. Regarding the June 16th meeting, she stated housekeeping issues such as the retreat were discussed. She noted that attendance issues were reviewed and it was discovered that there are openings on the committee. Commissioner Littleton stated that new committee members would be solicited. Commissioner Littleton reported that a presentation had been made from the public regarding Project Labor Agreements and that a Task Force was being developed.

Commissioner Dimapilis reported that a presentation was made by Preston Tom on the Pac Bell Development that questioned the Apprenticeship Program.

Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf suggested that the creation of the Project Agreement Task Force a joint effort. Commissioner Shirley Dimapilas agreed.

Commissioner Dimapilis added that there was also a presentation by Preston Tom, Port staff person, regarding the Pac Bell Development. She said the need for an Apprentice Program was mentioned at that time.

Commissioner Littleton stated that plans were in the preliminary stages.

Commissioner Watahara reported that at the May 19th meeting there were two administrative questions raised. (1) The Advisory Committee members want to receive Commission minutes. (2) The revision of general guidelines for committees.

Commissioner Littleton stated that the guidelines would be addressed at the retreat. Commissioner Watahara added that there were general guidelines for all committee members. He continued that the committee had specific changes that would impact the entire committee structure. Commissioner Littleton said that the City Attorney's office should be addressed. Commission Chair Harry Low added that staff also had input that should be included in the discussions. Director Bamba noted that in conversations with Larry Brinkin, staff person, it was indicated that in the LGBTH Advisory Committee similar requests were made and staff could look at those requests and make recommendations. Commission Chair Low stated that the independence of each committee is a desirable element for the commission. Commissioner Dimapilis added that there were 3 openings on the committee.

LESBIAN GAY BISEXUAL TRANSGENDER ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Knutzen noted that during the Proposition 209 campaign the committee came up with a brochure about racism in the community, and affirmative action in general. She stated that the brochures had an overwhelming impact on the vote in the community against Proposition 209. She said that these kinds of brochures are very effective in the community and she reported that the committee would go to many of their organizations and place the brochures in the waiting rooms where people could read them. She concluded by commending Tamara Winchester , HRC staff person, specifically, and also Yosenio Lewis, Jennifer Rakowski, Shadow Morten and all of the Task Force and Advisory Committee Members who participated. Commissioner Knutzen stated that the work towards economic empowerment was continuing. She stated that as a result of the last retreat it had been requested that the committee find out what is done at each Commission Meeting.

Commissioner Knutzen said she provided a more in depth report on what takes place at the Commission Meeting. She stated that she would provide a summary of Mary Tramil's report to the LGBTA committee. She concluded by stating that she hoped to integrate outreach programs to the LGBT community and invited everyone to participate in the Mayor's Contingent at the Gay Pride Parade.

Mr. Larry Brinkin, HRC staff person added that the T-shirts were provided by the Friends of the HRC.

ISSUES COMMITTEE
Commissioner Jaicks that the Committee Chair, Commissioner Salazar-Hobson, and Don Hesse, HRC staff person, met recently to prioritize some matters. He said that Commissioner Dimapilis suggested that they focus on the census. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson added that a list had been created of projects that were considered on an ongoing basis. He said that in the following week the issue that would be taken back to the committee would be a review of what the initial priorities are for the remainder of the year. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson mentioned North Beach Housing, language barriers, and public services as just a few of the issues on their table. He noted that new members would be joining the committee.

VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION
Commissioner Jaicks asked to return to the issue regarding the closing of Mt. Zion Hospital Emergency Room. He said that at the meeting he attended the reasons for closing the facility were spelled out, however, he said it should not deter the Commission from urging the City to prioritize the health care needs of the community. Commission Chair Harry Low agreed.

Commissioner Knutzen advised that she would leave the closed session because working for the Attorney General's office might jeopardize the case.

Commissioner Littleton moved to go into closed session and Commissioner Dimapilis seconded.

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION
The HRC reconvened in open session and voted to not disclose discussions held in closed session. Commissioner Dimapilis motioned and Commissioner Vice Chair Ghada Saliba -Malouf seconded.

VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION
Moved by Commissioner Dimapilis. Seconded by Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba -Malouf.

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION
Motion to not disclose discussions held in closed session was made by Commissioner Salazar -Hobson, and seconded by Commissioner Watahara

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

(Inaudible)

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 6:44 P.M.
NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, August 12, 1999
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By:Carla Vaughn

Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, JULY 8, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

Fax Copy 1st Posted 7/6/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUL 07 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

07-07-99A10:52 RCVD

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Mary Gin Starkweather 252-2527 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
http://www.sfhumanrights.org.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA DRAFT

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of June 24, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Pacific Bell Park/Giants Update
2. Update on Appeal to ATA decision re: Equal Benefits
3. Report of Gay Pride Parade Day
4. Discussion regarding Off-site Meetings

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report on the Committee Meeting of June 17, 1999 (*)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, July 15, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, August 5, 1999, at 12:00 noon at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

c) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, July 21, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

d) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, July 20, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

e) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will Be held on August 2, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

9. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, AUGUST 12, 1999

A:\agenda 7/8/99

LEGEND:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 19 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF JULY 8, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Present:Harry Low Chair; Ghada Saliba-Malouf Vice Chair; Youn-Cha Shin Chey; Shirley Dimapilis; Stephen Herman; Antonio Salazar-Hobson; Leslie Littleton; and Alan Watahara

Excused:Agar Jaicks; Martha Knutzen; and Julia Globus-Sabori

HRC Staff
Present:Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin; Virginia Harmon; Don Hesse; Nichole Truax; Pansy Waller; and Carla Vaughn;

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; and Rod Roche

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
The minutes of the June 24 Commission Meeting were approved.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS
The General Communication file was circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS
There were no public comments.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR
CERTIFICATION UNIT PROCEDURES
Commission Chair Harry Low discussed the certification procedures and stated that the progress of pending cases had been reviewed. Chair Low advised that the review process would be moving quickly and the City Attorney was asked to look at the possibility of issuing the recommended penalty once a finding was established by staff.

Commissioner Herman requested quarterly reports for informational purposes only to determine who has been certified and what is pending with regard to minority business status. Director Bamba advised that she would look into the request. She stated that the Certification Unit reports to the Minority Business/Women Business/Local Business Advisory Committee on a regular basis. Director Bamba suggested that Romulus Asenloo, of the Certification Unit, provide a general orientation to the Commissioners.

Commissioner Dimapilis suggested that additional copies of the reports provided at the MBE/WBE/LBE meetings be given to the Commissioners. Commissioner Littleton requested that the report include an update of businesses that had been recently certified.

Commissioner Chey reported attending an international conference on education in Vienna. She reported that technology is becoming an essential tool for global learning and subsequently the Human Rights Commission must ensure that access to technology has no discrimination. Commissioner Chey stated that the world wide education community is addressing the matter with development in Africa and South America.

Commissioner Littleton reported that Stanford Hospital is interested in setting up a medical mobile van to provide services to disadvantaged children in the community. She stated that she had been contacted by the hospital regarding possible locations. Commissioner Littleton invited Commissioner Chey as Chair of the Youth and Education Committee, to assist in the process and stated that someone from the hospital would attend a future Commission Meeting and provide more information.

Commissioner Littleton provided a biography of a potential appointee to the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee for Commission approval. Commission Chair Harry Low advised that approval of Committee members will be left to the Committee Chair.

Commissioner Dimapilis stated that she would like to be involved in finding a location for the Stanford Hospital Medical Van. Commission Chair Harry Low suggested contacting Dr. Ed Chow of the Health Commission. Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf reported attending events for La Raza Centro Legal and the 25th Anniversary of Equal Rights Advocates. Both organizations provide legal services to women and minority communities.

Director Bamba reported that Commissioner Dimapilis had assisted in mediation with the San Francisco Unified School District regarding allegations of mistreatment against Filipino-American faculty and staff. She stated that meetings would continue with Trustee Frank Chong and Trustee Eddy Chin. Director Bamba reported that a resolve was anticipated.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR
WHITE HOUSE INITIATIVE ON DIVERSITY
Director Bamba reported receiving an invitation from Ben Johnson, special assistant to President Clinton, to participate in a round table discussion regarding diversity in America on July 21 at the White House.

PACIFIC BELL PARK/GIANTS UPDATE
Rod Roche reported that the park was in the 19 month of a 28-month schedule. He reported that the construction team was in compliance with their diversity program. Mr. Roche stated that there was 40% participation of minority and women businesses due in part to the closely related work of HRC staff person Preston Tom.

The percentages of participation were stated as follows:
Pre-Construction
Women Businesses 17% Minority Businesses 19%

Construction - 42% of entire project
(Committed Contracts) $13 Million $26 Million

Mr. Roche reported that in keeping with their commitment to the City the Jobs Program in conjunction with the Potrero Hill Neighborhood House to date had provided 106 jobs onsite. Regarding the construction schedule Mr. Roche reported that a transition from exterior to interior construction was about to take place.

Regarding employment opportunities Mr. Roche reported that Corinne White would make a presentation to the Employment Committee later in the month. Mr. Roche concluded by stating that the Jefferson Company would be involved in the next phase, which is operation of the BallPark. Commission Vice Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf thanked Mr. Roche for his report and requested a break down of the 42% on construction. Mr. Roche responded that there were a total of 72 bid packages at this time. He stated that $26 Million was contracted to San Francisco MBE participating HRC certified firms. He concluded by stating that $13 Million had been committed to WBE certified firms. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf inquired as to whether or not there was improvement on the employment side since the last report. Mr. Roche advised that there was improvement and Corinne White would provide more detail later this month. Commissioner Herman had a question regarding an exhibit letter in the packet and asked if a staff person was identified to evaluate employment compliance with respect to the diversity program. Mr. Roche reported that he was not sure if someone had been appointed to the task. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf deferred to the Director who responded that the issue was whether or not Mr. Tom, HRC staff person, would be able to perform duties related to employment after completing his tasks with regard to contract compliance. Director Bamba advised that negotiations with the Port were ongoing regarding this matter and Mr. Tom was the main staff person available. Mr. Roche advised that Corinne White of Huber, Hunt & Nichols was providing assistance and information as needed. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf agreed and Commissioner Herman requested an update regarding resource allocation. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf advised that the Committee had a Task Force working closely with Ms. White and a report could be provided at the next Commission meeting.

Regarding the mandatory Sensitivity Training Workshop Commissioner Herman had questions about the curriculum in relation to sensitivity issues surrounding the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender community. Mr. Roche responded that he attended the workshop, which was coordinated by Huber, Hunt & Nichols. He advised that they made a point of talking with not only the Giants executives, but also the subcontractors on site, and the executives from each of the 72 bid packages. Mr. Roche concluded by offering to provide Commissioner Herman with a break down of the workshop subject matter.

Director Bamba requested a tour of the BallPark for the Commissioners and Mr. Roche said a time could be arranged for a tour.

UPDATE ON THE AMERICAN TRANSPORTATION ASSOCIATION DECISION
Larry Brinkin, HRC staff person reported that the Judge on the above case did not grant a stay and benefits would be provided by the airlines.

REPORT OF GAY PRIDE PARADE DAY
Larry Brinkin reported the 50-person contingent proudly marched. The group included several Commissioners, staff members, Advisory Committee members, and family members. Mr. Brinkin reported that banners and signs were carried that showed what services are available to the public. Director Bamba thanked the Commissioners and staff for their participation. Commissioner Herman shared pictures from a Pride Parade held previously in New York.

DISCUSSION REGARDING OFF-SITE MEETINGS
Director Bamba reported a discussion with HRC staff person Larry Brinkin who agreed that the primary issue is outreach. She advised that off-site meetings held in 1996 were not successful. Director Bamba stated that there was a need to identify the communities and provide outreach to the neighborhood associations and organizations. The Director suggested looking at the Mission area and the gentrification that was occurring and the tension that exists. Director Bamba suggested the area be considered for an off-site meeting. Commissioner Herman mentioned The Mission Campus as a possible venue for consideration.

COMMITTEE REPORTS
YOUTH AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE
Commissioner Chey reported on the Committee meeting of June 17. She advised of changes in Committee members. Commissioner Chey advised that Sgt. Michael Slade of the San Francisco Police Department - Juvenile Division was a new member to the Committee, and the members leaving are Inspector White and Rev. Kelvin Sauls. Commissioner Chey stated that a report was provided from the CRC (Convention for the Rights of Children) Task Force. She advised that the Task Force met with Kate Washburn, Youth program Coordinator for the Women's Institute for Leadership Development (WILD) and Dan Macallair, Executive Director of the Center for Juvenile and Criminal Justice (CJCJ).

Commissioner Chey stated they discussed the process currently being developed by the Commission on the Status of Women (COSW) and WILD, under the auspices of CEDAW, to explore discrimination against women in City and County departments, especially in those areas where that process would interface with the CRC effort. She continued reporting that both WILD and CJCJ wholeheartedly endorsed the CRC effort. Commissioner Chey stated that the next phase of the task force's work involved soliciting input from agencies that would be affected by the adoption of a local version of the CRC as well as from community members.

Commissioner Chey advised that the Committee looked at the brochure developed by the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender (LGBT) Unit. Marianna Balquiedra, HRC staff person presented the brochure and sought input from the Committee. Commissioner Chey reported that the brochure was generated through a report adopted by the Board of Supervisors in 1997. She stated that one of the recommendations was to prepare a youth friendly brochure.

Commission Chey reported a complaint from participants in Sports Bridge who alleged discrimination on the basis of race. She stated the Committee requested the complaints be submitted in writing and upon receipt a determination was made to ask the Investigative Unit to look into the matter and send a letter to the Executive Director and members of the board.

Commissioner Chey introduced a new intern, Nancy Ko and concluded by thanking Don Hesse, HRC staff person, for his help in conducting the Committee meeting. Commission Chair Harry Low requested that any names of possible new members for the Committee be referred to Commissioner Chey.

It was moved by Commissioner Salazar-Hobson and seconded by Commission Vice Chair Saliba-Malouf at the recommendation of Commission Chair Harry Low to reduce the minutes of the Commission by 50 per cent. The motion was carried unanimously.

It was moved by Commissioner Dimapilis and seconded by Commissioner Littleton to approve the minutes of the June 24 meeting. The motion was carried.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS
Director Bamba advised that Commissioner Chey had asked that the application process be looked into. She reported that Nichole Truax had contacted the Human Resources Department and they would provide a report in August.

Commissioner Herman had questions concerning a letter regarding Jewish War Veterans. It was determined the letter was new and Commissioner Herman advised he would contact the author and report back regarding the issue.

Commission Chair Harry Low advised that Commissioner Saliba-Malouf would head up a committee to follow up on the evaluation process requested by Human Resources.
Commissioner Salazar-Hobson suggested that Director Bamba raise the issue of inclusion of the Native American during her visit to the White House. He reported that it had been 63 years since a President had visited a reservation.

Several Commissioners encouraged the Director if possible, to take an extra day during her visit to the White House, to touch base with national organizations.

Commissioner Littleton introduced Alan Dones, a licensed contractor specializing in residential and commercial construction, management and development. As an entrepreneur and community advocate for equal opportunity in employment and contracting, Mr. Dones offered his services to the Commission and expressed and interest in serving on the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee. Director Bamba commented that Mr. Dones was well known in the Bay Area for his leadership in the area of Affirmative Action and Minority Business Programs, and she welcomed his assistance.

PUBLIC COMMENT
There was no public comment. Commission Chair Harry Low advised that there would not be a second meeting in August due to vacation scheduling.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS
There was no new business.

ADJOURNMENT
The meeting adjourned at 6:45 P.M.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, September 9, 1999
TIME: 4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,

Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By:Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

07-22-99A08:37 RCVD

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUL 2 2 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

NOTICE

The regular meeting of the Human Rights Commission scheduled for July 22, 1999 has been cancelled.

NOTE: QUESTIONS MAY BE DIRECTED TO COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Virginia M. Harmon
Interim Director

DOCUMENTS DEPT

JUL 25 2000

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

DATE: Thursday, July 27, 2000
TIME: 4:30 pm
LOCATION: City Hall, Room 416
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Julia Globus-Sabori
Stephen Herman
Martha Knutzen
Larry Lee
Leslie Littleton
Harry Low
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Alan Watahara

INTERIM DIRECTOR

Virginia M. Harmon

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Toni A. Delgado, 252-2502

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meeting s are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.us./ethics.

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of July 13, 2000 [Action Item (**)]

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENT

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioner reports on Community Activities [Discussion Item (*)]
   b) Discussion and possible action on Commission response to Independent Task Force on Affirmative Action recommendations [Discussion/Action Item (*)]

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

   a) Chapter 12.D.A Waiver Report [Discussion Item (**)]
   b) Update on Bonding Program Legislation [Discussion Item (*)]
   c) Overview of Liberty Builders Appeal [Discussion/Action Item (*)]

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

   a) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
      Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
      Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
      Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

      1. Report of the July 18, 2000 Committee Meeting [Discussion Item (*)]

         NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will be held on Tuesday, August 15, 2000 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

   b) Employment Committee
      Commissioner Larry Lee, Chair
      Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

      1. No Report.

         NOTE: *The next meeting of the Employment Committee will be held on Thursday, August 3, 2000 at 1:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

   c) Issues Committee
      Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
      Emil DeGuzman, Committee Staff

LEGEND: (*) = Oral report, no attachment
(**) = Attachment provided
(***) = To be discussed at Commission Meeting

1. No Report.

   NOTE: *The next meeting of the Issues Committee will be held on Monday, September 11, 2000 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

d) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Leslie Littleton, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report of the July 19, 2000 Committee Meeting [Discussion Item (*)]

   NOTE: *The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will be held on Wednesday, August 16, 2000 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

e) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Alan Akira Watahara, Chair
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Co Chair
Toni A. Delgado, Committee Staff

1. No Report.
2. Discussion and approval of welcome letter to new SFUSD Superintendent Arlene Ackerman [Action Item (**)].
3. Discussion and approval of resolution for Diana Rathbone [Action Item (**)].

   NOTE: *The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will be held on Wednesday, August 2, 2000 at 4:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

8. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, AUGUST 10, 2000

LEGEND: (*) = Oral report, no attachment
(**) = Attachment provided
(***) = To be discussed at Commission Meeting

Citywide Bond & Finance Assistance Program

Managing Department
Human Rights Commission

Program Administrator:
Merriwether & Williams Insurance Services

Citywide Program Background

- Goals & Objectives
  - Provide substantive outreach to M/W/LBE firms in obtaining bond and financing for City contracts
  - Enhance the viability and growth of local firms
  - Meet department and project participation goals

Citywide Program Activity

- 1997 – Present (Fund Balance $350,000)

  With this fund, we supported:

  - $14,140,446 in contract bids (Bid Bonds)
  - $1,179,871 in approved Credit Enhancements
  - $7,422,304 in final contract awards (Performance and Payment Bonds)
  - $529,619 in Credit Enhancements issued
  - $0 in Bond Defaults
  - $0 in Loan Defaults

  Contractor Training, Funds Administration, and Financial Statement Assistance to over 80 contractors enrolled in the Citywide Program

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
BOND ACTIVITY REPORT
AS OF May 30, 2000

	Construction Firm	HRC Cert.	Date of Request	City Department	Contract Number	Bid Estimate	Credit Enhance* Approved	Ref No	Bid Result	Final Contract Bond Amount	Credit Enhance* Issued	Annual** Subtotal
1	AA Construction	LBE	Sep-97	Port of SF	2635	1,718,000	75,000	1	Not Low	N/A	N/A	
2	Construction Systems	Black	Sep-97	Rec & Park	4274	50,000	20,000	2	Low	50,360	$20,000	
3	King Securities	WBE	Nov-97	Public Transp	CC097-703	1,443,824	144,385	3	Low	1,543,824	$144,385	
4	AA Construction	LBE	Nov-97	Public Works	2635	1,300,000	97,500	4	Not Low	N/A	N/A	
5	Jamerson Construction	Black	Nov-97	Rec & Park	4273	31,471	7,000	5	Low	34,968	$7,000	
6	Ward's Building Maint.	Black	Dec-97	Puchasing	83611	144,000	6,000	6	Low	144,000	Not Issued***	
7	Ward's Building Maint.	Black	Dec-97	Public Works	83651	79,164	7,916	7	Low	79,164	$7,916	
8	Biller-McCoy Bldg.	Black	Apr-98	Port of SF	2617	204,256	81,702	8	Low	204,256	Not Issued***	$2,056,572
9	Applied Remedial	Asian	Sep-98	Public Works	1208K	358,000	143,200	9	Low	358,000	$143,200	
10	Jamerson Construction	Black	Nov-98	Public Works	1118D	67,795	11,143	10	Low	67,795	Not Issued***	
11	Applied Remedial	Asian	Jan-99	Public Works	1208K	210,000	26,250	11	Not Low	N/A	N/A	
12	Millard Tong Constr.	Asian	Jun-99	Public Utilitie	CW220/164	4,500,000	180,000	12	Low	4,900,000	$180,000	
13	Ward's Building Maint.	Black	May-99	Purchasing De	309	144,000	28,800	13	Not Low	N/A	N/A	
14	Ward's Building Maint.	Black	Jun-99	Purchasing De	83651	100,000	20,000	14	Not Low	N/A	N/A	$5,325,795
15	Jamerson Construction	Black	Nov-99	Rec & Park	4344	39,937	15,975	15	Low	39,937	$27,118	
16	Winson Construction	Asian	Oct-99	Public Works	5471A	450,000	85,000	15a	Not Low	N/A	N/A	$39,937
17	Mendelian Construction	Black	Feb-00	Public Utilitie	CW257/0116	300,000	30,000	16	Not Low	N/A	N/A	
18	Phoenix Electric	Asian	May-00	Public Works	1660N	3,000,000	200,000	17	Not Low	N/A	N/A	
	TOTAL					$14,140,447	$1,179,871			$7,422,304	$529,619	$7,422,304

* Credit Enhancement
** Final Contract Amount
*** Bond Requirement Waived or Not Necessary

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO SURETY BOND PROGRAM

TRACK RECORD

May 30, 2000

The City and County of San Francisco started in September of 1997. The Program's objective is to help the City and County of San Francisco increase M/W/LBE participation in City construction projects. To help the City reach this goal, the Surety Bond Program assists M/W/LBE contractors in qualifying for and obtaining surety bonds and working capital loans required to participate in those projects.

Since the start of the City Surety Bond Program, we have:

Currently 80 contractors enrolled in the program.

Services provided have assisted 6 M/W/SBE contractors without a bond history to qualify for their first bond.

Services provided have assisted 9 M/W/SBE contractors with a successful bond history to achieve improved bond conditions.

Provided over $1.2 million in guarantees for performance and payment bonds for contracts totaling $14 million.

Provided $0 in loan guarantees for loans totaling $0.

Approved 18 Credit Enhancements, 0 Loan Guarantees and 18 Bid Bonds. Of the 18 Bid Bonds issued, 7 Final Bonds (Performance and Payment Bonds) have been issued.

Assisted 8 contractors with cost subsidy for the preparation of financial statements.

Assisted 2 contractor(s) with cost subsidy for funds control.

Success Stories

The following categories and examples illustrate the types of contractors that have been assisted by the Citywide Surety Bond Program:

Contractors were bondable but needed creative underwriting assistance from the Program in increasing their bank line of credit.

A woman-owned construction company specializing in general engineering contacted the Program regarding a bank line of credit for City Projects. The contractor had an aggregate bond line of $1,900,000. After Program Staff reviewed their file, it became apparent that the contractor's existing bank line would not allow the company to grow beyond its current bond capacity. Together, the contractor and Program Staff approached the bank for an increased credit line. The bank honored the request for the increase with a guarantee from the Citywide Program. The contractor has continued to steadily grow with the support of the Program and now has annual revenue of $8,500,000. If their revenue continues to grow, they will no longer need Citywide Program services

A local minority owned contractor was interested in bidding on projects with the City but found that the size of the contracts exceeded his bond line and financial capabilities. An OCIP administrator advised him to contact the Citywide Program for assistance. Upon contacting the Citywide Program, he was invited in to discuss his needs and learn how it could be of benefit to him. Program Staff assisted him in the completion of the enrollment forms and packaging of information. It was determined that there was a primary need for an increase in his bank line of credit. Meetings were facilitated with his bond broker and bank that led to an increase in bonding capacity and the approval of a 100% increase in his line of credit. These enhancements allowed this contractor to compete more equitably with larger more established contractors in order to bid and be awarded contracts in excess of $20,000,000.

Success Stories

(Continued)

Contractor is a start-up and without a bond history and needs assistance from the Citywide Program.

A WBE specialty paving company had yet to establish a bank or bond line of credit. Therefore, they were unable to participate in public works projects. Our first step was to place the contractor with a surety broker experienced in working with small contractors. Next, we recruited a construction-oriented CPA to produce a quality financial statement, where the Citywide Program subsidized a portion of the cost of the statement. With the new financial statement in hand, Program staff and the contractor approached a bank regarding a line of credit. Subsequently, the contractor received a working capital loan from the bank with the help of a fifty (50) percent guaranty from the Citywide Program. A surety has since extended a surety line of credit as a result of the contractor having good quality financial statements and a bank line of credit. This contractor is successfully performing in excess of $500,000 in City contracts.

Airport Program

- 1995 to Present (Fund Balance $9 Million for the expansion project)

  $52,748,274 in contract bids (Bid Bonds)

  $7,464,116 in approved Credit Enhancements

  $18,422,741 in final contract awards (Performance and Payment Bonds)

  $2,356,116 in Credit Enhancements issued

  $4,150,000 in loans supported by $1,950,000 in Credit Enhancements

  $0 in Bond Defaults

  $0 in Loan Defaults

The Airport has also realized a $1.2 Million in contract savings due to the increased pool of contractors able to bid.

SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT SURETY BOND PROGRAM BOND ACTIVITY
As of April 1, 2000

	Construction Firm	HRC Certification	Date of Request	Contract No.	Bid Estimate	Credit Enhance* Approved	Ref No.	Bid Result	Final Contract Bond Amt	Credit Enhance Issued	Annual** Subtotals
1	Pyramid Construction	Asian	Jan 1995		$18,000			Low	$27,850		
2	Agbayani Construction	Asian	March 1995		$1,000,000			Not Low			
3	A.R. Construction	Hispanic	March 1995		$765,000			Non Responsive			
4	Agbayani Construction	Asian	March 1995	3427	$50,000	$5,000	1	Low	$45,636	$5,000.00	
5	Agbayani Construction	Asian	May 1995	3321A	$50,000	$5,000	2	Not Low			
6	Oliver Construction	Black	May 1995		$400,000			Withdrew Bid			
7	A.R. Construction	Hispanic	June 1995		$1,025,000			Not Low			
8	Pyramid Construction	Asian	June 1995		$42,000			Non Responsive			
9	A Answer Inc.	Black	June 1995		$111,000			Not Low			
10	A Answer Inc.	Black	June 1995		$38,000			Not Low			
11	Hopkins H & V	Black	June 1995		$95,000			Low	$87,440		
12	N & R Construction	Asian	June 1995		$1,500,000			Withdrew Bid			**$5,094,000**
13	Let's Get Busy	Black	Aug 1995		$95,000			Not Low			
14	Landmark Bldg & Eng	Asian	Aug 1995		$62,000			Withdrew Bid			
15	Leonard Nichols Construction	WBE	Aug 1995		$43,100			Not Low			
16	N & R Construction	Asian	Aug 1995		$61,200			Not Low			
17	Pyramid Construction	Asian	Aug 1995		$36,500			Low	$36,500		
18	JMB Construction	WBE	Sept 1995	3501	$317,500	$47,625	6	Low	$317,500	$47,625.00	
19	N & R Construction	Asian	Nov 1995		$405,000			Not Low			
20	Landmark Bldg & Eng	Asian	Nov 1995		$60,000			Not Low			
21	A. R Construction	Hispanic	Nov 1995		$380,000			Not Low			
22	Oliver Construction	Black	Nov 1995		$400,000			Not Low			
23	Leonard Nichols Construction	WBE	Nov 1995		$360,000			Not Low			
24	Granite Excavation & Demo	SBE	Nov 1995	3484	$800,000	$320,000	3	Not Low			
25	Mendelian Construction	Black	Dec 1995	3433A	$650,000	$65,000	4	Not Low			
26	Oliver Construction	Black	Dec 1995	3433A	$900,000	$100,000	5	Low	$722,316	$100,000.00	
27	Oliver Construction	Black	Dec 1995		$250,000			Not Low			
28	Mendelian Construction	Black	Dec 1995		$150,000			Not Low			
29	A. R. Construction	Hispanic	Jan 1996		$800,000			Not Low			
30	Millard Tong	Asian	Jan 1996		$565,000			Low	$613,299		
31	R & W Concrete	Hispanic	Feb 1996	3433A	$390,000	$77,800	7	Low	$390,000	$77,800.00	
32	Granite Excavation & Demo	SBE	Feb 1996	3583	$1,300,000	$520,000	8	Not Low			
33	N & R Construction	Asian	March 1996		$50,000			Not Low			
34	Oliver Construction	Black	March 1996		$50,000			Not Low			
35	N & R Construction	Asian	April 1996		$80,000			Not Low			
36	Millard Tong Construction	Asian	May 1996		$1,070,000			Low	$1,070,500		
37	Miller/Thompson Const	WBE	May 1996		$1,300,000			Not Low			
38	Oliver Construction	Black	May 1996		$700,000			Not Low			

January 1995 - April 2000

	Construction Firm	HRC Certification	Date of Request	Contract No.	Bid Estimate	Credit Enhance* Approved	Ref No.	Bid Result	Final Contract Bond Amt	Credit Enhance Issued	Annual** Subtotals
39	Granite Excavation & Demo	SBE	May 1996	506E	$2,500,000	$750,000	9	Not Low			
40	Miller/Thompson Const	WBE	May 1996		$1,700,000			Not Low			
41	JMB Construction	WBE	June 1996	5601	$600,000	$25,000	10	Low	$600,000	$25,000.00	**$16,075,300**
42	Oliver Construction	Black	July 1996	5902B	$900,000	$360,000	11	Not Low			
43	Robbins General Contractors, I	SBE	Aug-96	3646R	$1,400,000	$210,000	12	Not Low			
44	Oliver Construction	Black	Aug-96	3646R	$1,200,000	$480,000	13	Not Low			
45	BCN Company	WBE	Sept 1996	3435R	$500,000	$125,000	14	Not Low			
46	Oliver Transbay Construction	Black	Oct 1996	3062B	$2,100,000	$750,000	16	*** Low			
47	Airport Pavement Markings	WBE	Nov 1996	3586	$340,000	$102,000	18	Not Low			
48	Winson Construction	Asian	Dec 1996	3686	$50,000	$7,500	19	Not Low			
49	Let's Get Busy	Black	Jan 1997	3435R2	$520,000	$200,000	24	Not Low			
50	Winson Construction	Asian	Jan 1997	3435R2	$520,000	$208,000	21	Not Low			
51	BCN Company	WBE	Jan 1997	2349-F1	$550,000	$84,771	28	Low	$339,086	$84,771.00	
52	BCN Company	WBE	Jan 1997	3524A	$900,000	$225,000	25	Not Low			
53	Let's Get Busy	Black	Jan 1997	2349E	$520,000	$208,000	20	Not Low			
54	BCN Company	WBE	Feb 1997	3435R2	$550,000	$137,500	23	Not Low			
55	Hopkins Heating & Cooling	Black	April 1997	5950AR	$7,700,000	$750,000	29	Low	$5,813,000	$750,000.00	
56	Mendelian Construction	Black	May 1997	3069E	$1,934,000	$100,000	30	Low	$889,640	$100,000.00	**$19,684,000**
57	Temper Insulation	Asian	Sept 1997	5950AR	$104,000	$20,000	33	Low	$104,000	$20,000.00	
58	JC Metals	Asian	Mar-98	5500E	$2,410,000	$100,000	35	Low	$2,410,000	$100,000.00	
59	Fire Barrier	WBE	May-98	5500E	$480,000	$192,000	36	Low	$480,000	$192,000.00	
60	Silver Glass & Mirror	Hispanic	May-98	5602.A	$259,800	$103,920	37	Low	$259,800	$103,920.00	
61	Biller McCoy Builders	Black	Feb-99	4055	$450,000	$180,000	42	Not Low			
62	Winson Construction & Electric	Asian	Jul-99	5606A	$375,000	$75,000	44	Not Low			
63	A. Ruiz Construction	Hispanic	Nov-99	5703	$4,216,174	$750,000	45	Low	$4,216,174	$750,000.00	
64	Coppola West, LP	WBE	Dec-99	5510H	$3,600,000	$180,000	46	Not Low			$11,894,974
	TOTAL				**$52,748,274**	**$7,464,116**			**$18,422,741**	**$2,356,116**	**$52,748,274**

*** Credit Enhancement**

****Final Contract Amount / Fiscal Year End June 30**

***** Bid rejected due to error in completing bid documents**

January 1995 - April 2000

BONDING FINANCING PROGRAM
COST SAVINGS ANALYSIS
SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT
Prime Contractors

Contractor	Date of Contract	Project/Contract No.	Description	Awarded Contract Price	2nd Bidders Price	Difference
Agbayani Construction	5/1/1995	FOM #3427	Barber Shop Remodeling	50,000	52,500	2,500
BCN Construction	4/1/1997	2349-F.1	No. Terminal Restroom Renovation	339,086	392,168	53,082
JMB Construction	5/9/1996	5601	BDC Utility Relocations	600,000	624,000	24,000
Oliver Transbay Contruction	12/19/1996	3433A	Plot 3 Hardstand Phase A	722,316	749,974	27,658
R & W Concrete	3/1/1996	FOM #3433A	Plot 3 Hardstand Phase A	389,000	427,900	38,900
Fire Barrier	5/20/1997	5500E	General Construction-International	480,000	513,600	33,600
J.C. Metals Specialist	7/24/1997	5500J	No. Connector Package	2,410,000	2,530,500	120,500
JMB Construction	1/8/1996	3501	Underground Utility Repair	317,430	336,475	19,045
Hopkins Heating & Cooling	9/29/1997	5950.AR	Improvement of Central Plant	5,813,332	5,925,000	111,668
Mendelian Construction	5/20/1997	3069E	Garage Waterproofing	1,934,594	2,044,000	109,406
Silver Glass & Mirror	5/6/1998	5602.A	Employee Parking Facility	259,800	266,000	6,200
Temper Insulation	2/13/1998	5950.AR	Installation Chillers, Pumps	104,000	108,000	4,000
Pyramid Construction	1/1/1995			18,000	18,900	900
Pyramid Construction	6/1/1995	3389R	So. Terminal License & Permit	36,555	38,383	1,828
Hopkins Heating & Cooling	6/1/1995	3392R	HVAC Improvements	87,440	94,616	7,176
Millard Tong	1/1/1996	5903A	McDonnell Rd./R2 Widening	1,667,350	1,685,775	18,425
Miller Thompson	3/31/1997	5510E	Aircraft Hydrant Fueling Sleeve	150,000	165,000	15,000
Miller Thompson	3/3/1998	5903B	McDonnell Rd./R21 Alignment	2,900,000	3,190,000	290,000
Miller Thompson	3/1/1996	5510A	Boarding Area A Site Prep & Piling	3,500,000	3,850,000	350,000
			Totals:	**21,778,903**	**23,012,791**	**1,233,888**

Risk Management

The Citywide Program uses a number of measures to mitigate risk of losses. These include:

1. A thorough assessment of each contractor's ability to perform successfully on the contract.
2. Implementation of third party funds administration. This ensures contract proceeds are disseminated timely to subcontractors, material suppliers, or a credit provider where a loan has been supported via a guarantee
3. The source of funds to repay any supported loans comes directly from the contractors project proceeds, this in itself reduces the risk of the loan defaulting
4. Ongoing communication and monitoring of the contractors performance with the contractor and department project managers. Potential problems realized early can be avoided or intervened with proper action
5. In the event of a default, alternative remedies may be applicable to resolve the default, i.e. contractors are required to provide personal guarantees and/or assign receivables which may be attached first in a default situation
6. With the proposed ordinance changes, the HRC would have the ability of decertifying the contractor following an unresolved default situation. This will further motivate the contractor to avoid a default by any means necessary

Benefits of the Citywide Bond & Finance Program

- M/W/LBE contractors have "real" access to City contract opportunities through the elimination of the bonding and financing obstacles.
- Using more local contractors, keep more contract dollars local, creating an economic multiplicative impact from City contracting
- The cost savings benefit to the City resulting from the increased pool of contractors able to bid City and perform City contracts
- M/W/LBE contractors have the opportunity to mainstream their businesses eliminating the need for long-term assistance

Diversity Tracking System Steering Committee

Report to the Human Rights Commission July 13, 2000

❖ Participants

Human Rights Commission
Department of Telecommunications and Information Services
Airport Commission
City Attorney
Department of Public Health
Department of Public Works
MUNI
Office of the Controller
Port of San Francisco
Public Utilities Commission
Purchasing Department
Task Force on Affirmative Action in Public Contracting

❖ Goal

To identify, evaluate, prioritize, and implement technical enhancements to the Diversity Tracking System.

❖ Successes

1. Met twice, established rapport and productive group dynamics.
2. Fostered open process for Departments to work collaboratively to enhance the System.
3. Identified issues.
4. Evaluated issues to ascertain which can become enhancements.
5. HRC/DTIS informed group about current enhancements.
6. Developed criteria for prioritizing enhancements
7. Identified four **Working Committees**:
    - **Policy:** ensure enhancements are consistent with legal requirements
    - **Forms:** streamline data collection instruments
    - **Reports for Departments:** standard reports that would benefit all departments
    - **Technology:** technical efficiency of the (proposed) enhancements

❖ Future Accomplishments

Staffing the Working Committees

Identifying additional enhancements

12D Waiver List

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

Year 2000

Date Director Signed	Date of Contract	Department	Type of Contract	Dollar Amount	Name of Contractor	Type	Reason for Action
01-12-00	1/6/00	Public Works	Purchase order	$2,303.33	Hauck Manufacturing	SS	Specialized Services
01-12-00	1/11/00	Public Health	Health Services	$50,400.00	Stanford Healthcare	SS	Specialized medical services mandated by state fund
01-12-00	1/11/00	Public Health	Health Services	$92,282.00	UCSF Office of Research Affairs	SS	SS as mandated by federal fund
01-12-00	11/99 – 6/00	Community Health	Medical Equipment	$37,500.00	Alliance Medical Corporation	SS	SS for restoration of current equipment
01-13-00	4/20/99	Airport Airfield Development	Special Services	$150,000.00	California Academy of Sciences	SS	SS to catalog existing specimens
01-18-00	1/12/00	Port	Personnel Services	$76,000.00	Johns/rife Groups	SS	Complies with 12-D ordinance requirements for waiver
01-25-00	1/3/00	Arts Commission	Professional Services	$225,000.00	Keith Haring Estate	SS	Specialized art of native San Franciscan highly regarded in the art community
02-01-00	1/20/00	MUNI	Purchase Order POPT00006223	$18,639.55	Automotive Resources	SS	Sole bidder on contract for necessary goods an services
02-08-00	12/31/1998 to 12/31/1999	Public Health	Commodities	$600,000.00	Abbott Laboratories	SS	Renewal of Contract for purchase of SS diagnostic test lets for sexually transmitted diseases using specialized technology
02-11-00	7/1/99-6/30/2000	Assessor-Recorder	Professional Services	$71,293.00	Telecommunications Mgmt. Corp.	SS	Expertise in Viacom Cable TV property tax
02-11-00	thru 12/31/2000	Public Health	Commodity	$31,450.00	Abbott Laboratories	SS	SS for medical test kits with unique accuracy
02-11-00	11/1/99-12/31/200	Public Health	Commodity	$15,000.00	Midwest Bank Note	SS	Specialized security paper
02-11-00	02/02/00	Water, City Distribution Division	Repair/ Update	$4329.15	SPX Corporation	SS	SS for proprietary software upgrade for smog; test machine as mandate by change in state program.
02-16-00	1/31/00	Airport Commission Planning and Environmental Affairs	Professional Services	$49,999.00	The Regents of the University California		Dept, did not provide what 'good faith steps under taken in determining that the project should only be done by the Regents of University of California
02-22-00	2/18/00	Water Quality Bureau	Equipment Purchase	$12,000.00	Hydrolab Corp.	SS	SS for specialized laboratory equipment
02-23-00	2/17/00	Mayor's office/ Purchasing Dept.	Lease (12 months)	$10,725.00 annual	Ford Motor Company	SS	SS for leasing program that allows for month-to-month term; all other required minimum of 24 months
02-28-00	2/8/00	SFPUC - Water Quality Bureau	Repair	$2500.00	Hydrolab Corporation	SS	manufacturer is SS for need repair of proprietary equipment
03-08-00	03-07-00	Public Works	Professional Services	$185,286.00	Imbsen & Associates	SS	SS for retrofit & rehab strategy
03-09-00	3/6/00	Hetch Hetchy Water & Power	Construction	(2) $1.5 million	(1) Shimmick Construction, Co. (2) Mendelian Construction	Emergency	MBE prime for contract + subcontracting goals (regard) for both contracts
03-10-00	03-02-00	MUNI	City Contract 96947	$550,000.00	Docusystems, Inc.	SS	Only bidder on contract for printing fast passes
03-17-00	7/1/99 - 6/30/00	Public Health	Health Services	$979,967.00	Alameda Health Care Services	SS	Public entity offers clinical continuity in therapeutic treatment services

12D Waiver List

Year 2000

Date Director Signed	Date of Contract	Department	Type of Contract	Dollar Amount	Name of Contractor	Type	Reason for Action
03-20-00	03-14-00	Utilities Engineering Bureau	Consultant Services/Construction	$50,000.00	Treadwell & Rollo Geotech	SS	Emergency work in progress
03-20-00	03-14-00	Utilities Engineering Bureau	Consultant Services/Construction	$250,000.00	Malcolm Drilling Co., Inc.	SS	Emergency work in progress
03-23-00	3/16/00	Solid Waste Management Program	Personal Pervice Contract	$98,000.00	Alex E. Dong	SS	Complies with 12D-A unique expertiso; 2 year SS not to exceed $98,000.00
03-28-00		Water - City Distribution Division	Purchasing	$37,541.00	Teldata Inc. #42022	SS	SS for hardware and training compatible with proprietary software
03-28-00		Department of Public Works	Engineering Servicos	$137,650.00	Forell/ Elsesser Engineers, Inc.	SS	
03-29-00	FY 1998 – 1999	PUC Water Quality Bureau Laboratory	PO	$140,000.00	Varian Inc.	SS	Manufacturer is SS for needed laboratory supplies
04-04-00	thru FY 00/01	Public Health	Commodities	$85,000.00	Organon Teknikn	SS	Sole supplier of test reagents for oral fluid HIV - antibody screening
04-04-00	thru FY 00/01	Public Health	DBPO	$30,000.00	Greyhound Bus Lines	SS	Renewal of SS because vendor is only land transport anyway willing to issue nonrefundable designator specific tickets
04-04-00	thru FY 00 / 01	Public Health	Lab/ Test Kits	$250,000.00	Bayer Corp. Diagnostic Div.	SS	SS for diagnostic kits compatible with existing laboratory equipment
04-06-00	3/22/00	MUNI	PO POPT0000829(...)	$2521.54	Erico Inc.	SS	Manufacturer is SS for component of proprietary system used in bonding streetcar rails together
04-07-00	3/8/00	Human Resources	Personal Services	$17,594.00	Commission on Peace Officers	SS	Sole entity empowered to evaluate and confer peace officer status in CA
04-11-00	4/1/00 thru 3/31/01	Public Health	Professional Services	$270,000.00	Support for Families of Children Disabilities	SS	Specialized Services
04-16-00		Solid Waste Management Program	SS	$5,000.00	Sanitary Fill Company	SS	
04-17-00	thru FY 00/ 01	Community Health Network	Medical Equipment	$10,000.00	Padgett Medical Instruments	SS	Specialized medical equipment with existing equipment
04-17-00	thru FY 00/01	Community Health Network	Medical Equipment/ Supplies	$50,000.00	DePuy Acromed	SS	SS for specialized medical supplies
04-17-00	thru FY 00/01	Community Network	Medical Equipment/ Supplies	$150,000.00	Medtronic Pacemaker	SS	SS for specially manufactured pacemakers
04-18-00	4/18/00	MUNI	P.O. POPT00008854	$1,848.84	Betts Spring Co.	SS	SS for proprietary cable car equipment
04-19-00	3/8/00	Human Resources	Personal Services	$17,594.00	Commission on Peace Officers	SS	SS empowered to grant peace officer status in CA
05-01-00	4/27/00	MUNI	PO POPT00009068	$1,790.25	Meister Electronics	SS	Soulo Source for proprietary equipment for streetcar rail switch signals
05-08-00	4/19/00	PUC/WPCD	Purchase Orders	$326,000.00	Pearpoint 34408	SS	Specialized sewer inspection systems compatible for use in hazardous conditions

12D Waiver List

Year 2000

Date Director Signed	Date of Contract	Department	Type of Contract	Dollar Amount	Name of Contractor	Type	Reason for Action
05-17-00	5/2/00	Water Supply & Treatment	Purchase	$8,700.00	Cycle Center of Fremont	SS	Sole Vendor willing to enter into this contract
05-17-00	4/1/00 thru 3/31/09	81 Community health Network	Professional Services	$28,000.00	Harder & Co.	SS	Specialized Services
05-19-00	05-17-00	Port of San Francisco	Personal Services	$15,000.00	Ergo Insight	SS	Unique experience for this contract only
05-19-00	03-21-00	Solid Waste Management Program	Transit advertising	$36,000.00	TDI	SS	Only firm licensed to do work
05-22-00	01-31-00	Airport Commission	Professional Services	$49,999.00	The Regents of the U.C.	SS	Only group available to provide research on air quality
06-13-00		Hetch Hetchy Water & Power		$250,000.00	Chemical Lime Company	SS	Sole bidder on needed chemicals
06-15-00		Solid Waste Management Program	Transit Advertising	$36,000.00	TDI	SS	Only provider of transit advertising on public buses (inside & outside) within San Francisco
06-15-00		Solid Waste Management Program	Sole Source	$18,640.00	SF Apartment Association	SS	Only apartment organization provider with capacity to assist with outreach to apartment owners, managers & tenants through publications, meetings and direct contact.
06-20-00	07-01-00	81 Public Health	Professional Services	$55,000.00	Bay Area Communication Access	SS	Sole Source for certified ASL interpreters for the deaf community in the SF Bay Area.
06-23-00	06-15-00	PUC-Water Supply & Treatment	Software	$38,193.00	Dialogic Communications Corp.	SS	Only provider of a high speed notification system used for delivering interactive messages to agency and non-agency personnel in addition to citizens throughout the community.
06-27-00	05-04-00	Solid Waste Management Program	License Agreement	$42,500.00	Planet E-Productions	SS	Only provider of copyrighted animated recycling characters used in Public Service television spots.
06-27-00	05-04-00	Solid Waste Management Program	Personal Services	$50,000.00	Hilton, Farkopf & Hobson	SS	Specialized Services assisting in rate analysis.
07-05-00	FY 00/01	Port	Professional Services	$40,000.00	Journal Of Commerce	SS	Only provider of trade import/export statistics used for cargo marketing and only database of trade info that includes shipper and carrier information.
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV,QV,PO,DBPO	$10,000.00	Thermo Nutech	SS	Only state approved company providing radiological analysis of water samples. There is no other qualified vendor.
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV,QV,PO,DBPO	$8,000.00	Supelco Inc.	SS	Only manufacturer of chemical standards that must be used daily in quality control procedures to validate the precision of analytical instruments and ensure the accuracy of chemistry test results. Not sold through any distributor, no other vendor can provide these products.

Date Director Signed	Date of Contract	Department	Type of Contract	Dollar Amount	Name of Contractor	Type	Reason for Action
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV,QV,PO,DBPO	$65,000.00	Varian Inc.	SS	Varian is the manufacturer of Instrument Systems with support apparatus, including : Atomic Absorption equipment for the analysis of tract metal and inorganic chemicals; Gas Chromatograph equipment for detection of volatile/semi-volatile organic chemicals; and Mass Spectrometer for the performance of EPA methods for the detection of multiple volatile/semi-volatile organic chemicals. Manufacturer and only factory authorized service rep to provide fully trained technicians for technical assistance and expert/expedient maintenance and repair service.
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV,QV,PO,DBPO	$10,000.00	BioMerieux Vitek	SS	A technically complex, automated system ,which allows the laboratory to provide quick, accurate, and definitive speciation of the bacteria recovered from San Francisco drinking water sources. Provides the test reagents and materials needed to operate the system directly from the manufacturer. There are no authorized distributors.
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV, QV, PO, DBPO	$15,000.00	Dionex Corporation	SS	Only vendor to provide maintenance service, repair parts and specialized manufacturer sponsored training for the Ion Chromatograph DX-500 instrument. The manufacturer is the only authorized service representative of the equipment. The Water Quality Laboratory is required to use this instrumentation to analyze for anions (Fluoride, Chloride, Citrate, Bromate, Chlorate) present in our source and treated waters in order to be in compliance with the California Department of Health Services Drinking Water Regulations.
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV, QV, PO, DBPO	$80,000.00	Hach Company	SS	Only vendor which can be used to purchase equipment, reagents, control standards and special sample vials for the Process Chemical Analyses, including COD (Chemical Oxygen Demand), Turbidity (dirty water), and Colorimeter (chlorine level, pH (corrosiveness) and other field tests, to analyze water and wastewater samples. Only vendor to monitor for regulatory compliance. The EPA approved methods used require the use of HACH instrumentation and quality control standard which are only manufactured by HACH. Only vendor to validate the present on-line monitoring instrumentation for the treatment plants. Factory calibration/maintenance and repair of the current HACH equipment must be provided

Date Director Signed	Date of Contract	Department	Type of Contract	Dollar Amount	Name of Contractor	Type	Reason for Action
							only through HACH service representatives.
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV, QV, PO, DBPO	$75,000.00	Idexx Laboratories	SS	The exclusive manufacturer of Colisure, an EPA approved product used to detect the presence/absence of total coliform bacteria and fecal coliform bacteria which are indicators of water pollution. This culture medium has selective inhibitors, not available in other products, which minimize the occurrence of false positives and invalid results, providing more accurate results. Also, the only vendor that can supply the specially prepared containers that the laboratory has determined to be most satisfactory for collecting water samples for bacteriological analysis and ensuring accurate test results.
07-17-00	FY 00/01	PUC/Water Quality Bureau	DV, QV, PO, DBPO	$65.000.00	Steris Corporation	SS	Only vendor to provide high pressure steam sterilizers/autoclaves, and laboratory glassware washer. The autoclaves are used for dual purposes; for the preparation of sterile supplies such as reagents, culture media and glassware; and for terminal sterilization of contaminated materials and waste before disposal. The glassware washer is used to prepare scientifically clean apparatus to conduct highly sensitive laboratory analyses.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Virginia M. Harmon
Interim Director

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUL 25 2000

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

Memo

Date: July 20, 2000

To: Youth & Ed Committee Members

From: Toni A. Delgado

Re: Documents for your approval

Enclosed, please find revised draft versions of a letter welcoming Arlene Ackerman and a resolution for Diana Rathbone. These items will go before the Commission at the next Commission meeting, Thursday, July 27th.

If you have any corrections, please forward them to my attention by the close of business Wednesday, July 26th:

415-252-2502	**Phone**
415-431-5764	**Fax**
Toni_Delgado@ci.sf.ca.us	**E-mail**

t. ☺

Operations
415.252.2502

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Virginia M. Harmon
Interim Director

DRAFT

August 1, 2000

Ms. Arlene Ackerman
Superintendent
San Francisco Unified School District
555 Franklin Street
San Francisco, CA 94102

COMMISSIONERS

Harry W. Low
Chair

Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Vice-Chair

Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Julia Globus-Sabori
Stephen J. Herman
Martha Knutzen
Larry Lee
Leslie D. Littleton
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Alan Akira Watahara

Dear Ms. Ackerman:

On behalf of the Human Rights Commission of the City and County of San Francisco, I would like to extend a warm welcome to you, your family and your new position with the Unified School District.

The Human Rights Commission (HRC), is responsible for enforcement of local anti-discrimination and affirmative action laws. The HRC works to provide advocacy and leadership to promote, protect, and secure human rights for all people. The Commission is composed of several working committees, involving key community leaders. The most relevant to you is our Youth & Education Committee. Throughout the HRC's 36 years, this committee has worked closely and cooperatively with the SFUSD on a variety of issues.

I have enclosed some information about the HRC for your perusal. The Human Rights Commission and its Youth & Education Committee look forward to working cooperatively with you and your staff. Ms. Toni A. Delgado, staff to the Youth & Education Committee, may be reached at 252-2502.

Welcome!

Sincerely,

Harry Low
Commission Chair

CC: Alan Watahara, HRC Y&E Committee Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Y&E Committee Co-Chair

25 Van Ness Avenue
Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

DRAFT

RESOLUTION OF COMMENDATION TO DIANA RATHBONE

WHEREAS, Diana Rathbone served as staff to the Human Rights Commission's (HRC's) Youth and Education Committee from March of 1998 through May of 2000; and

WHEREAS, Diana Rathbone has been an outstanding leader, exhibiting great dedication, persistence, and integrity in carrying out her responsibilities as staff to the Youth and Education Committee; and

WHEREAS, Diana Rathbone, through her consistent, diplomatic, and fair support of Committee members, has empowered the Youth and Education Committee to implement its mission; and

WHEREAS, Diana Rathbone, utilizing her excellent communication and documentation skills, has demonstrated her respect for the members of the Youth and Education Commission, guest speakers, and the group process as a whole.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Human Rights Commission highly commends Diana Rathbone for her dedicated and committed service to the Youth and Education Committee and to the Human Rights Commission on Youth and Education Committee matters; and

FURTHER, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Commissioners, members of the Youth and Education Committee, and staff of the Human Rights Commission convey their appreciation to Diana Rathbone for her service to and for her support of the Youth and Education Committee.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

Fax Copy Ist Posted 8/9/99
DOCUMENTS DEPT.

AUG 1 2 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THURSDAY, AUGUST 12, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Mary Gin Starkweather 252-2527 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of July 8, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Equal Benefits Ordinance / 2 Year Report (**)
2. Department of Human Resources Presentation on Hiring Procedures
3. Adoption of: Discrimination Complaint Rules of Procedures;
   Adoption of: Equal Benefits Rules of Procedures;
   Adoption of: Minority/Women/Local Business Utilization Rules And Regulations

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of August 5, 1999

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, September 2, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report on the Committee meeting of July 15, 1999 (*)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, August 19, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

c) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of July 20, 1999 (*)
2. Approval of the Letter to the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce Commending Them For Their Stand Against Attacks On Same Sex Marriage

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, August 17, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

d) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of July 12, 1999 (***)
2. Report of the Committee Meeting of August 2, 1999 (***)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will Be held on July 5, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

e) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. No Report.

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, September 15, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION.

9. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(b):

PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:
MARIVIC BAMBA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
-REVIEW OF MEA GOALS AND OBJECTIVES

10. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(a).)

11. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

12. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

13. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, September 10, 1999

A:\agenda 8/12/99

LEGEND: (*) = Oral Report No Attachment
(**) = Attachment Provided
(***) = To be distributed at Commission Meeting

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 1 9 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

99

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF AUGUST 12, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present:Youn Chey; Stephen Herman; Antonio Salazar-Hobson; Agar Jaicks; Martha Knutzen; Leslie Littleton; Harry Low; and Ghada Saliba-Malouf

Excused:Shirley Dimapilis, Julia Globus-Sabori, and Alan Watahara

HRC Staff

Present:Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Carol Ackles, Marianna Balquiedra, Larry Brinkin, James Fields, Cynthia Goldstein, Don Hesse, Kabir Hypolite, David Treanor, Nichole Truax, Carla Vaughn, and Tamra Winchester

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; Louis Calabro, Charlotte Laughon, Victoria Lewis, Dana Van Gorder, Dorothy Yee, and Sam Kinghorne

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made to approve the July 8 minutes. ***Moved (Saliba-Malouf) Seconded (Herman)

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.
PUBLIC COMMENTS
There were none.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

Commission Chair Harry Low noted that the Commission was aware of comments made in the media regarding the Commission and other City agencies affiliated with the Commission. He reported a restricted order had been placed by the Court on general comments. Commission Chair Low affirmed the dedication, commitment and pride of the Commissioners regarding the Human Rights Commission and stated that the focus will be on increasing competence of the Commission and making improvements in those areas that need improvement. Commission Chair Low advised that complaint, certification and appeal process procedures were currently being reviewed. Chair Harry Low stated that deficiencies that need more resources or attention would be pointed out. In closing, Chair Low assured the staff and the public that the Commission was mindful and supportive of the good work that has been done and he advised that the Commission was committed to following the law and carrying out the mandates of the City's
Ordinances and Laws.

Commissioner Herman thanked Commission Chair Harry Low on behalf of the Commissioners and reported that Rod Roche of the Giants organization had provided clarification regarding the Sensitivity Training, which had

provided per a request from the Commission.

Director Bamba thanked Commissioner Herman for his diligence in identifying deficiencies in the Giant's Sensitivity Training program.

Commissioner Herman reported that he hosted a meeting for guests from the Mexican Lesbian, Bisexual, and Gay Human Rights Forum. He requested a letter be forwarded to the local INS to review their asylum policies towards Lesbians, Gays, and Transgenders from Mexico. In closing, Commissioner Herman expressed outrage at the Jewish Community Center shooting in Los Angeles and requested a letter of support from the Commission for the Jewish Community Center in Los Angeles and the families affected by the shooting. Commissioner Herman also requested a letter for the Jewish Community Relations Council in San Francisco.

Commission Chair Harry Low and Director Bamba agreed with Commissioner Herman and added that the Intergroup Clearinghouse hosted a meeting with members of the Jewish Community. Mr. Don Hesse was asked to report to Intergroup Clearinghouse that the Commission is acting proactively regarding the hate crime
Director Bamba
Stated that a letter would be drafted on behalf of the Commission.

Commissioner Youn Chey reported being contacted by a reporter from the Examiner. She expressed concern for the agency and stated that more would be discussed in the closed session.

Commissioner Knutzen endorsed the statement of Commission Chair Harry Low and advised the Commission staff of the commitment of the Commissioners to the agency.

Commission Jaicks agreed and added that the media should use caution in the way headlines are used.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson expressed his support for the HRC staff and Commissioner Littleton concurred adding that she hoped the press would spend as much time reporting positive issues concerning the Commission as they had reporting negative issues.

Commission Chair Harry returned to Public Comment.

PUBLIC COMMENT

LOUIS CALABRO
Louis Calabro of the European-American Issues Forum reported difficulties with different government agencies within San Francisco in regard to equal, fair and reasonable treatment of European-Americans. Commission Harry Low advised that all of the Commissioners represent all San Franciscans.

Louis Calabro requested mediation between his organization and the Police Department.
Commission Chair Harry Low advised that one Commission would not mediate an issue with another Commission. As former President of the Police Commission, Chair Low acknowledged his awareness of the Police Department.

Louis Calabro asked for the City Attorneys position on the matter and was advised by Susan Frankel, City Attorney, that one City agency does not have the authority to force another City agency into mediation.
Commission Chair Harry Low advised that the Commission would take another look at the issue.

CHARLOTTE LAUGHON
Charlotte Laughon, a member of the International alliance of Theatrical Stage Employees, Moving Pictures Technicians, Artists and Allied Crafts of the United States, Its Territories and Canada, on behalf of herself, Lewis, and Laura Chariton, reported being unable to join Local 16, the International Alliance of Theatrical Stage Employees local union.

Ms. Laughon cited determent, sexual discrimination, sexual harassment, and retaliation as ploys of the union in refusing membership to the above named individuals. In conclusion Ms. Laughon stated that the National Labor Relations Board has charged Local 16 with being an exclusive hiring hall, and the Equal Employment opportunity Commission determined that the charges of sex discrimination and retaliation are meritorious.

Commission Chair Harry Low advised Ms. Laughon to leave the necessary information with the Commission staff in order to provide follow-up.

VICTORIA LEWIS
Victoria Lewis stated that she had been trying to join Local 16 for 10 years. Ms. Lewis recounted an incidence of verbal abuse from a union member. She stated that she was laid-off a project that went union, and union membership was denied. Ms. Lewis provided paperwork from Laura Chariton, who was unable to attend the Commission meeting, which verified the allegations of discrimination.

Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf advised Ms. Lewis to contact Pansy Waller, staff person of the Employment Committee, to initiate the complaint process.

Commissioner Knutzen asked if the Film Commission had been contacted and Ms. Lewis replied, "Yes." Commissioner Knutzen suggested that the complainants invite the Film Commission to join the investigation with the Employment Committee.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson posed questions regarding the complaint filed with the National Labor Relations Board.

Ms. Lewis advised that the hearing had been postponed until February 2000 and the complainants needed to work immediately.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson suggested that all paperwork regarding this complaint be provided for further investigation.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

LESBIAN, GAY, BISEXUAL, TRANSGENDER COMMUNITY CENTER
James Fields, HRC Contract Compliance Officer assigned to the Lesbian/Gay Community Center project, and Mr. Dana Van Gorder, Vice-President of the Community Center project Board of Directors, were introduced by Director Bamba and provided an overview to the Community Center project.

Mr. Van Gorder reported that the groundbreaking on a new center at 1800 Market Street was scheduled for October 20, along with a large community celebration on Friday evening, October 22nd.

Mr. Van Gorder reported that the $11.9 million dollar construction project to date had raised approximately $9.5 million of the funds needed to complete the construction. Mr. Van Gorder reported that the actual construction cost was $8.65 million. Mr. Van Gorder stated that there was commitment to advance economic development programs in the City. In conclusion Mr. Van Gorder commended HRC staffers James Fields and Larry Brinkin for their work in making a very complicated process easier.

Commission Knutzen thanked the Commissioners for listening to the report and invited them to be a part of the outreach effort.

Commissioner Herman echoed the remarks of Commissioner Knutzen and added that City College was eager to provide training programs.

Commissioner Jaicks congratulated Mr. Van Gorder on the building and questioned if the outreach included LGBT communities of color. Mr. Van Gorder stated that through the Advisory Committee a better job could be done.

Director Bamba thanked Mr. Van Gorder and James Fields for their work.

EQUAL BENEFITS ORDINANCE
Director Bamba introduced Larry Brinkin, HRC Division Manager who in turn introduced the members of the Division. Mr. Brinkin also thanked Diana Rathbone, HRC staff person, for her assistance in designing a software program that is user friendly, and John Waite from the Department of Telecommunications. The Division introduced were David Treanor, Tamra Winchester, Carol Ackles, Ron Capistrano, Kabir Hypolite, Marianna Balquiedra, Kim Iwamoto,(summer intern), and Cynthia Goldstein.

Ms. Goldstein provided a brief history of the Domestic Partnership Movement in the United States and an overview of the San Francisco Equal Benefits Ordinance. Ms. Goldstein provided compliance statistics, which showed that as of June 30, 1999, 8005 contractors have submitted compliance paperwork to the Commission. Ms. Goldstein reported that contractors offering nondiscriminatory benefits employ approximately one million individuals nationwide. She stated that with actuarial statistics indicating an enrollment rate in domestic partner

medical benefits offered to both same and opposite sex couples averaging 3% in the private sector, nearly 30,000 domestic partners have taken advantage of this benefit through the programs offered by City contractors. Ms. Goldstein said that complying companies are located in at least 41 states and the District of Columbia, and in over 700 cities across the country. Regarding waiver use Ms. Goldstein expressed frustration over the fact that not much had changed in that area. Ms. Goldstein offered insight into the Air Transport Association vs. the City and County of San Francisco lawsuit. In closing Ms. Goldstein pointed to current challenges such as reducing the number of waivers used.

Commission Chair Harry Low thanked Ms. Goldstein for her work and Commissioner Knutzen also acknowledged the efforts of those working on implementation of the Ordinance.

Commissioner Jaicks had questions regarding the implementation of the Ordinance by other City Departments.

Ms. Goldstein advised that a "Liaison" program was created to help departments identify people who would work with their vendors in the area of compliance. She stated that some departments had begun the program and others had not allocated the funds to do so. She continued that the task might have been given to people who already had overwhelming workloads, or that the task had not yet been assigned to anyone.
Ms. Goldstein suggested that more work be done to convince these departments that it is their responsibility as well as the HRC's to make the law successful.

Commissioner Jaicks asked how the process could be quickened and Ms. Goldstein responded that an audit of the different departments would be helpful. Commissioner Jaicks asked if it would be helpful for the Commission to urge the other departments to comply. Director Bamba stated that this was a wonderful idea. In conclusion the Director stated that she would report back to the Commission in the event their assistance was in fact needed.

Commissioner Herman thanked Larry Brinkin and his staff for a job well done. Commissioner Knutzen noted for the record that she does not have domestic coverage through her current employer the State of California. Commissioner Herman said that domestic coverage was available through his employer, the Community College. Commissioner Herman stated that the bigger issue was in regard to others besides the Lesbian/Gay communities that benefit from the ordinance and everyone needs to be represented on the issue.

It was moved by Commissioner Knutzen and seconded by Commissioner Herman to accept the report. The report was unanimously adopted.

DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES PRESENTATION
Ms. Dorothy Yee and Mr. Sam Kinghorne from the Department of Human Resources provided a presentation at the request of Commissioner Youn-Chey regarding the way applications denote ethnicity. Ms. Yee and Mr. Kinghorne answered questions regarding the employment selection procedure. Mr. Kinghorne pointed out that the applications contain a perforated section for the ethnic information that is maintained by the Human Resources Department in compliance with the law. Mr. Kinghorne advised that the information was retained for in-house statistics only.

Commissioner Chey expressed concern regarding the application form, specifically the area showing 6 ethnic categories. Commission Chey asked what happens if a person's ethnic group is not listed. Mr. Kinghorne replied that the status of 'other' is used in cases where no ethnic specification is provided.

Commissioner Chey cited incidents within the San Francisco Fire Department where applicants claimed discrimination had occurred against them due to their ethnicity. Ms. Yee advised that any complaints should be directed to the Equal Employment Opportunity office at the Department of Human Resources.

Commissioner Chey had questions regarding the availability of applications to those that may not fully understand the English language. Mr. Kinghorne advised that resources were not available to convert all of the brochures and applications to other languages at this time. Ms. Yee advised the Commission that there was a pool of bilingual interpreters available to provide assistance to non-English speaking applicants.

Commissioner Herman asked for a review of the actual areas from which statistics are being taken and suggested more categories be included.

Commission Chair Harry Low asked Ms. Yee and Mr. Kinghorne to provide in writing any answers to the questions that had been set forth.

Mr. Kinghorne and Ms. Yee pointed out that they had not received questions in advance. Mr. Kinghorne suggested the Commission provide a letter stating their concerns so he and Ms. Yee could respond to it. Commission Chair Harry Low agreed.

Commissioner Salazar-Hobson noted that the ability to provide endless translation service is very hard.

ADOPTION OF DISCRIMINATION COMPLAINT RULES OF PROCEDURES; ADOPTION OF EQUAL BENEFITS RULES OF PROCEDURES;
ADOPTION OF MINORITY/WOMEN/LOCAL/BUSINESS UTILIZATION RULES AND REGULATION
An overview was provided by Nichole Truax, HRC staff person. In conclusion she thanked Larry Brinkin, Veronica Ng, and Virginia Harmon for their help on the project.

Commission Chair Harry Low asked Commissioner Knutzen to act as coordinator on this project.

Commissioner Littleton commented on the changes that were being made and the possible urgency of completing the project.

Commission Chair Harry Low stated that it would be best to have the changes in writing so they could be studied.

Nichole Truax, HRC staff person advised that with respect to 12D a summary had been prepared, and the Equal Benefits Ordinance Rules and Regulations did not change with one exception. She explained that the massive change came with the first section, the Discrimination Complaints, which was last adopted in 1985.

Commission Chair Low requested a summary of the key changes. Commissioner Littleton requested clarification on the issue and Commission Chair Low advised that it would be best to continue the issue and share with the other Commissioners and the City Attorney.

Commission Chair Low suggested staff consider in which manner the summaries, once adopted, would be distributed so those individuals with discrimination complaints would know the process and what limitations might exist.

Director Bamba noted a suggestion by Commission Knutzen to have user-friendly brochures, which would contain the relevant information from the voluminous procedure manual.

Commissioner Youn-Chey asked Director Bamba about her trip to the White House for the President's Conference on Diversity. Director Bamba reported that of the 14 attendees, two were from California.
The Director reported that the attendees were asked to provide recommendations as to how President Clinton incorporate some recommendations for dealing with the large issue of diversity. She advised that the outcome would be by way of a chapter in his book, a work-plan chapter for the nation. She advised that the President wanted to leave a legacy with his successors. She stated that within the work-plan he would include a series of events. The first is a meeting he had with the nation's top lawyers and members of the Bar Associations across country wherein he asked for assistance in the preparation of documents or cases regarding diversity. The Director advised that she raised a question as to whether or not these people were asked to contribute to some sort of study of discrimination which is something we have done. Director Bamba stated that she reported as example, having outside people who provided pro bono assistance in helping us reauthorize 12D.

The Director continued that in terms of focus the President wanted to mimic what President John F. Kennedy did before, calling lawyers to action in assisting the Civil Rights Movement at that time. Director Bamba stated that by emulating the process President Clinton hoped to get assistance in conducting an assessment as to what is happening with respect to diversity hate crimes and general economic disenfranchisement.

Director Bamba reported that the other event was a meeting with religious leaders who were asked to assist and address the issue of hate crimes and racial tension. The Director stated that another event held was a visit to the reservations, and President Clinton and his staff have introduced legislation, called the New Target Market, to encourage small business development in under-represented areas as well as under-developed areas. The Director noted that this was something we could look at with respect to under developed neighborhoods in San Francisco. Director Bamba advised that the President is looking for endorsements for that legislation. Director Bamba stated that the attendee from Minneapolis advised that Native Americans were discouraged by the lack of representation on the diversity panel.

Director Bamba reported that the last request made of the panel was to create a set of recommendations. The

Director advised that bullets were provided on the work done by the San Francisco HRC and there was discussion regarding the Equal Benefits Ordinance and hate crimes. Director Bamba stated that the three levels looked at were policy, funding, and outreach.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

EMPLOYMENT COMMITTEE
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf reported that two important issues and presentations were brought before the committee at the meeting of Thursday, August 5th. The Commissioner reported that a presentation was provided by Deputy City Attorney, Virginia Alexandro on the First Source hiring program, which is a collaboration between the Department of Human Resources, the Private Industry Council, and the Mayor's Office. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf advised that the program provided training to many people who for the first time will have the opportunity to apply for entry-level jobs.

Regarding the women elevator workers issue, Commissioner Saliba-Malouf reported that L.J. Dolan, a female elevator worker has requested a follow-up report regarding the recommendations made at prior Commission meetings.

Commissioner Saliba-Malouf advised that Ms. Dolan has recommended that companies or contractors be pursued that are not abiding by the 20% contract requirement. Commissioner Saliba-Malouf noted that follow-up letters were being drafted, including one to Carole Migden on legislation she was proposing.

YOUTH AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE
Commissioner Chey reported that the Youth and Education Committee meeting on July 15 started with a video, which was produced by Ms. Patricia Steele on UN Civil Rights in Celebration of the 50th Anniversary of the UN. Commissioner Chey advised that the video was made at the request of the United Nations Resource Center. Commissioner Chey reported that Ms. Steele, an independent filmmaker, made the film in three segments, (Free Speech; Civil Rights Movement; and the Gay Rights Movement). Commissioner Chey reported that the file contained an introduction and comments from Mayor Brown. Commissioner Chey continued her report, stating that Director Bamba attended the Committee meeting where committee members gave input and felt the video should provide a broader perspective. Commissioner Chey said Ms. Steele advised that she would continue the work and seek additional funding. Commissioner Chey reported that many Committee members felt that the video could be useful as a source of material for educational purposes, however it needs to be looked into further and there should be a study guide to accompany the video.

Commissioner Chey reported a presentation from policy analyst, Lateka Machony, from the San Francisco Commission on the Status of Women. Ms. Machony reported on the implementation status of CEDAW gender analysis, and advised the committee that all departments are currently undergoing a gender analysis based on their service delivery, employment practices, and budget allocation. Commissioner Chey reported that the pilot departments for the gender analysis are DPW and Juvenile Probation. Commissioner Chey reported that the analysis was helpful because the Committee members are looking into the adoption of the Convention on the Rights of Children. Commissioner Chey noted that many HRC and CORE Interns participated in the discussion.

In conclusion, Commissioner Chey announced that there will be an update on the CRC Task Force at the next Committee meeting and the complaints presented regarding Sports Bridge were handed over to the HRC Complaint Investigation Unit.

LESBIAN GAY BISEXUAL TRANSGENDER ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Knutzen reported a discussion and a report on a San Francisco Weekly article regarding a Nicaraguan transsexual woman and her detention by the Immigration Naturalization Service.
Commissioner Knutzen noted that the Committee would come back with action items regarding this issue after initial discussion. Commissioner Knutzen advised that there were two reports from the ongoing Task Forces. Commissioner Knutzen reported that the Diana Jaicks Anti-Racism Task Force, which came up with a brochure that was widely distributed during the Gay Pride Event, would now distribute that brochure at all points within the community. Commissioner Knutzen noted the ongoing work of economic empowerment.

Commissioner Knutzen reported that the action item for the evening was a letter commending the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce for their stance on same sex marriage. Commissioner Knutzen moved, and Commissioner Herman seconded the motion to forward the letter to the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce. It was unanimously carried.

ISSUES COMMITTEE
Commissioner Salazar-Hobson announced that 2 new members had joined the Issues Committee, they are Attorney Lawrence Jacobson, who heads up the Hate-Crimes Unit in Alameda, and Mary Kinkle, a San Francisco businesswoman. Commissioner Salazar-Hobson called upon HRC staff person, Don Hesse who reported that because of the summer meeting schedule two Committee reports were available.

Mr. Hesse reported that at a prior Commission meeting an issue regarding the Housing Authority and tenants from the North Beach Development was referred back to the Issues Committee. Mr. Hesse advised that at the Issues Committee meeting on July 12, Mr. Ronnie Davis, Executive Director of the Housing Authority came along with the tenants and their representatives from North Beach.

Mr. Hesse noted that through the efforts of Commissioners Jaicks and Salazar-Hobson, the parties listened to each other and agreed that they would work together to arrive at a mutually agreeable document (exit contract) as to what the responsibilities of each party would be. Mr. Hesse reported that it is expected that the end result of on-going negotiations will be an agreement acceptable to both the tenants and the Housing Authority.

Mr. Hesse reported that the August meeting was limited to a discussion of the census and how it will affect San Francisco. Mr. Hesse noted that each Commissioner had received a packet of information and the presentation had been educational and interesting.

Mr. Hesse advised the Commissioners that for each person undercounted the city would lose $2500. He noted that the last census had an undercount of 22,000 and it was feared that the current undercount could be as large as 40,000.

Mr. Hesse advised that it was not just the loss of information to the Census Bureau, but a substantial loss of income to the City, not to mention the loss of power that the under-counting in specific communities would mean.

Mr. Hesse noted that the Committee is working on this issue and would be back with the role that the Commission and staff can play. Mr. Hesse recommended that each Commissioner point out to their community the importance of the census.

Mr. Hesse reminded the Commissioners regarding the earlier discussion with the representatives of the Department of Human Resources, the Issues Committee some months back talked about the issue of lack of language access among City agencies.
In closing, Mr. Hesse reminded the Commissioners that an ad-hoc group, primarily non-profit and legal-aide organizations, had been working to develop legislation to address this issue. Mr. Hesse noted that the end result would be that every City department would be required to provide all of the material distributed to the public in languages that the large language minority groups need.

Commissioner Jaicks stated that although the census presentation was impressive he felt that nothing was really going to change and we're going to come out undercounted again. Commissioner Jaicks noted that areas where undercounting occurred were identified, however there is no program to offset the situation.

Commission Chair Harry Low agreed and added that what was needed was more education with regard to the census-taking process.

PUBLIC COMMENT RELATED TO THE CLOSED SESSION
There were no public comments.

CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND
SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 65.10(b)
Review of MEA Goals and Objectives

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION
The Commission unanimously voted not to disclose any discussions held in closed session (San Francisco Administrative code section 67.14(a).)

UNFINISHED BUSINESS
Commissioner Herman requested that the Information Booth at City Hall be restocked.

NEW BUSINESS REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

There was none.

ADJOURNMENT
On behalf of the Commission and HRC staff, Commission Chair Harry Low adjourned the meeting in honor of Adma Saliba, mother of Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf at 8:05pm.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, September 23, 1999
TIME: 4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,
Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Contract Compliance
Dispute Resolution/Fair Housing
Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender & HIV Discrimination

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

(Agenda)

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 9, 1999

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

SEP 07 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

Fax Copy 1st Posted 9/4/1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of- the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

    a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of August 12, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

    a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

        1. Approval of Letter to San Jose Mercury News Criticizing an Article in which a Transsexual Woman is Referred to Repeatedly as Male (**)

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Ordinance for Disabled-Owned Businesses
2. Quarterly Report of the Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise (**)
3. Intergroup Clearinghouse Presentation (*)
4. Adoption of Resolution and Letter to the Ileto Family (***)

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of September 2, 1999 (*)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, October 7, 1999, at 2:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of August 17, 1999 (*)
2. Approval of Letter Commending Univision KDTV 14 for Featuring a Well-Researched Documentary About Violence and Hate Crimes Against LGBT Youth-Action Item (**)
3. Approval of letter Commending the Bay Area Reporter for prominently Covering the Murder of an Orinda FTM and the Suicide of His Son and Calling the Writer's Attention to the Use of inappropriate Pronouns In the Articles-Action Item (**)

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, September 21, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

c) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, September 16, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

d) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will Be held on October 4, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

e) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. No Report.

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, September 15, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. PUBLIC COMMENT RELATED TO THE CLOSED SESSION

9. VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION TO CONFER WITH LEGAL COUNSEL. (SF ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.11(A.)

10. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54956.9(C)ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.11(B).

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – EXISTING LITIGATION

1. HSQ Technology vs. City and County of San Francisco

11. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

1. Possible report on action taken in closed session (Govt. Code section 54957.1(a) (2) and SF Admin Code section 67.17 (b) (2).)

12. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION.

13. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B):

PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:
MARIVIC BAMBA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

14. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(a).)

15. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

16. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

17. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, September 23, 1999

A:\agenda 9/9/99

LEGEND: (*) = Oral Report No Attachment
(**) = Attachment Provided
(***) = To be distributed at Commission Meeting

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 19 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 9, 1999

Commission Vice-Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present:Shirley Dimapilis; Stephen Herman; Agar Jaicks; Martha Knutzen; Leslie Littleton; Harry Low; Ghada Saliba-Malouf and
Alan Watahara

Excused:Youn Chey, Antonio Salazar-Hobson, and Julia Globus-Sabori

HRC Staff
Present:Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin, Virginia Harmon, Don Hesse, Nichole Truax, Carla Vaughn,
and Pansy Waller

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; L.J. Dolin, Jill Tregor, Sema Dudum, Kanwarpal Dhaliwal, and Helen Marte-Bautista

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of the Commission Meeting of August 12th were approved with changes.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.

At 4:45 P.M. Commission Vice-Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf announced that the meeting was moving forward to Agenda Item #8, which was Public Comment related to the Closed Session. There was no public comment. It was moved, seconded, and voted to go into Closed Session. Moved(Herman)Seconded(Dimapilis)

At 4:55 P.M. Returning from the Closed Session Commission Chair Harry Low requested a vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions held in closed session.

It was moved, seconded, and voted not to disclose any discussions held in closed session. Moved(Saliba-Malouf) Seconded(Dimapilis)

Commission Chair Harry Low returned to the regular agenda.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were none.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

Commission Chair Harry Low reported that during that last few weeks there had been a considerable amount of activity. He stated that the goal of the Commission was to move forward to do the job of providing an equal playing field, not only in contracting, but also in every aspect of San Francisco's diverse community. Chair Low reported a request had been made to the City Attorney to take a look at the Norman-Scott matter, an investigation was proceeding, and a report should be available by the next Commission meeting. Chair Low reported that the Blue Ribbon Committee, which was appointed by the Mayor, would be meeting on September 10 and would begin to outline some of the things that need to be done to improve and enhance the work of the Human Rights Commission. He stated that one goal would be to find any flaws that need correcting in the legal process, and provide a strong affirmative action as well as a strong protection of minority and women's rights and all other groups that we are assigned to protect. He advised that independent counsel would be selected to assist in reviewing the laws with the help of the City Attorney. Chair Low added that a management consultant would be engaged to help find ways to improve the implementation of the practices, policies, and processes that the Commission is engaged in. Chair Low continued noting the progress that had been made by HRC staff with the proposals for improving the complaint process and providing better structure to the complaint process. Chair Low reported that the certification process was under review and a proposal had been provided, which was being tracked by Commission Knutzen. Chair Low advised that he was assured by the City Attorney's office that within the next two weeks they will provide comments regarding the proposals that are being made. Chair Low added that positive and constructive comments were welcomed from the community.

He noted that the goal of the Blue Ribbon Panel is to serve the City and to make the process fair and understandable. Chair Low added that he would keep the Commission informed.

Commissioner Jaicks had a question regarding Chair Low's remarks. He asked if any suggestions the Commissioners may have regarding improving the structure of the Commission should be held in abeyance.

Chair Low advised that the Commission was on a two-track basis, setting policies and procedures, along with recommending improvements. He stated that the long-range work was also being done by the Blue Ribbon Panel.

a) INDIVIDUAL COMMISSIONERS REPORT ON THEIR ACTIVITIES IN THE COMMUNITY

Commissioner Jaicks reported that he attended the memorial for a 78-year-old woman/anti-drug activist who was killed on Webster Street. He stated that after the memorial service he spoke with some of the event planners and they expressed concern regarding the African American members of the community and the White members of the Alamo Square community. Commissioner Jaicks stated that there might be a role for the HRC to play in trying to bring the two communities together in discussion. He continued advising that the Chair of the Issues should be involved. Commissioner Jaicks reported that he spoke with the President of the Alamo Neighborhood Improvement Association and members of the African American community, who seemed amiable to the suggestion. However, he noted that a number of African American residents in the area feel uncomfortable about coming into a meeting where they might be subject to reprisal.

Chair Low suggested that Commissioner Jaicks set up a meeting on behalf of the Commission.

Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis reported that she attended the memorial for Mr. Ileto, the slain postal worker, which was well attended by both the Jewish and Filipino communities. Commissioner Dimapilis advised that a letter and a resolution would be presented to the family of Mr. Ileto.

b) APPROVAL OF LETTER TO SAN JOSE MERCURY NEWS CRITICIZING AN ARTICLE IN WHICH A TRANSSEXUAL WOMAN IS REFERRED TO REPEATEDLY AS MALE

Chair Low requested public comments, commission comments, and a motion to adopt the letter to the San Jose Mercury News expressing the dismay of the Commission regarding the article recently published by them.

Commissioner Herman commented that the issue of properly addressing people in the Transgender community was growing. He stated that the letter attempted to discuss the issue in relation to Shoshanna Gillick, a psychiatrist who committed suicide and had a lot of personal angst around her Transgender identity and the discrimination she felt.

It was moved, seconded, and unanimously voted to adopt the letter. Moved(Herman) Seconded(Knutzen).

Chair Low noted that he had written an opinion in 1986 where he commented on the linguistic discrimination and the legal flotsam that seems to be prevalent among the legal community and other communities. Chair Low requested that City Attorney Frankel locate the opinion and provide it to the Commission.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Director Bamba requested a moment of silence for HRC staff person Carol Ackles who had recently advised the LGBT Division that she would be leaving her current staff position. The Director cited Ms. Ackles for her contributions to the department and noted that a Resolution would be provided to formally acknowledge Ms. Ackles.

ORDINANCE FOR DISABLED-OWNED BUSINESSES
Mr. August Longo, who serves on the Mayor's Commission for the Disabled thanked the Human Rights Commission for being available to conduct hearings and gather testimony and other evidence to explore amending the San Francisco Administrative Code to ensure full and equitable opportunities for utilization of disabled person business enterprises.

QUARTERLY REPORT OF THE MINORITY/WOMEN/LOCAL BUSINESS ENTERPRISE
The quarterly report was presented by Virginia Harmon.

INTERGROUP CLEARINGHOUSE PRESENTATION
Jill Tregor, founder of the Intergroup Clearinghouse, provided an overview of the organization, whose primary mission is to provide assistance to victims of all kinds of hate violence. Ms. Tregor reported that in 1989, when Intergroup Clearinghouse was asked to take on the role of coordinating and developing services for all victims of hate violence in San Francisco, there were few resources for victims and their communities, and even less understanding about the phenomenon. Ms. Tregor stated that since that time, Intergroup Clearinghouse has provided leadership and vision to ensure that service gaps are identified, if not filled; underrepresented communities are provided information about hate violence, and have a voice in addressing the violence affecting their communities; communities have a forum in which to communicate with one another and be heard about inter-group tensions; coordination exists among and between individual victims, advocacy groups, government agencies, law enforcement, business and religious communities in order to establish a dialogue among those who are impacted by and can positively impact upon hate violence in San Francisco.

Sema Dudum, Intergroup Clearinghouse Community Organizer, reported that meetings were organized with the Asian community leaders in response to hate violence incidents and an anti-Chinese hate flyer that was circulated in the Sunset, Richmond and Chinatown districts. Ms. Dudum reported that in response to an anti-Latino hate circulated in the Mission District, an organized Town Hall meeting with MALDEF and La Centro legal was held at the Mission Cultural Center.

Kanwarpal Dhaliwal, Intergroup Clearinghouse Schools Program Coordinator cited various activities provided to facilitate understanding and tolerance in the schools.

The Commissioners praised the Intergroup Clearinghouse staff for their efforts and Commissioner Youn Chey stated that a tremendous service was being provided, especially for individuals with limited English proficiency. Commissioner Chey questioned the outreach capabilities of the 3 staff person organization.

Ms. Tregor advised that with the help of the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor's Office, and with support from the HRC, additional support was provided from the City through the Mayor's Criminal Justice Council Office. Ms Tregor stated that once the contract is in place it would provide extra funds for translation services and more aggressive outreach. Ms. Tregor reported that the written material would be translated into Spanish and Chinese. She continued stating that the voicemail system will be able to accommodate those languages also, including Vietnamese and others.

Commissioner Chey requested translation services in the Korean language. Ms. Dudum stated that as a Palestinian she often felt marginalized because Arabic was not a priority language. She advised that her was to address people, expressing concern, finding someone who could speak the language and hearing people out one on one. She noted that caring, shows. In closing she quoted the Platinum Rule, which is, "Treat Others The Way They Would Like To Be Treated". Ms. Dudum noted that although it would not be possible to provide translated materials in all of the languages, the organization does what it can.

ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION AND LETTER TO THE ILETO FAMILY

Director Bamba reported that she attended the memorial for Joseph Ileto on August 31st and spoke on behalf of the Commission. The Director stated that she expressed the concern and commitment of the Commission in addressing the issue of hate crimes and hate violence. Director Bamba reported that she mentioned the efforts that have been exerted to eliminate hate crimes and the prevention of hate crimes. The Director suggested that policy and education would provide preventative measures to derail future violence. Director Bamba reported that the memorial was not just a gathering to honor Mr. Ileto and his family. The Director stated it was a call to action for all of us, and his death will fuel our collective fight against racism. Director Bamba thanked Commissioner Herman for calling and showing support.

Commissioner Dimapilis read the Resolution, which was moved, seconded, and unanimously adopted by the Commission. (Moved) Dimapilis (Seconded) Herman.

ADOPTION OF RULES AND REGULATIONS
Director Bamba thanked Commissioners Knutzen and Littleton for working closely with staff on the Rules and Regulations, and advised the Commissioners that staffers Nichole Truax and Larry Brinkin were available to answer questions.

Chair Low offered a reminder that this was the item that the Commission had requested the City Attorney's office to review.

HRC staff person, Veronica Ng addressed the Commission stating that the Rules and Regulations had been reviewed by the City Attorney's office prior to the presentation to the Commission.

Commissioner Littleton added that the revisions had also been reviewed by the City Attorney's office.

Chair Low addressed City Attorney Frankel who advised that the review was on going. Chair Low reported that the City Attorney was conferring with counsel for other agencies that might be affected by our Rules. He stated that there would be other comment as to that portion, as well as to see if our Rules are consistent with that of other agencies.

Ms. Ng stated that this revision was related to the Revision of the Certification Process, making it clearer and standardized. Ms. Ng reported that she had spoken with City Attorney Buck Delventhal, and under his direction and approval had worked with George Wong's office on certification since a lot of the situations also relate to departments bid protests. Ms. Ng advised the Commission that the revisions were not related to the general full revision of the Rules and Regulations.

Chair Low acknowledged the great amount of work that had been done by staff. Commissioner Knutzen requested to clarify the procedures. Commissioner Knutzen advised that the question was not whether or not the City Attorney's office was working on the item, but as a final way of preparing the item for the Commission it had been decided that Susan Frankel, Commission City Attorney, would receive the final packet, take a look at it, and be prepared to provide an approval.

Ms. Ng had a question regarding what would be the final review and which City Attorney would handle the review. Commissioner Knutzen addressed City Attorney Susan Frankel who advised the Commission that her supervisor, Buck Delventhal, Theresa Stricker and Randy Riddle, who are in charge of PROP 209 litigation. Ms. Frankel stated that the main contracting departments City Attorneys would also review the packet.

Chair Low stated that this issue may be placed on the calendar as soon as the next meeting.

Director Bamba stated the importance of due diligence. She noted that with the current climate under PROP 209 she welcomed the additional input from the City Attorney's office.
However, the Director cautioned the Commission regarding some of the changes that were being recommended. Director Bamba reported that the changes were necessary enhancements.

Commissioner Littleton reported that she had cleared her schedule to assist Ms. Ng in completing the process and she agreed that it was important to have all of the necessary reviews. Commissioner Littleton noted Ms. Ng's frustration from a compliance standpoint, at not having all of the language. Commissioner Littleton reported that the Advisory Committee expressed concern that there was not enough strength in the current regulations.

Commissioner Herman had questions regarding why Ms. Ng was working with other City Attorneys and not Susan Frankel, the attorney assigned to the Commission.

Ms. Ng responded that Buck Delventhal was the City Attorney working with her office on 12D-A, therefore he was working on the revisions and the original adoption. Ms. Ng advised the Commission that she had asked Mr. Delventhal if she should work with him, or if she should work with Mr. George Wong City Attorney, who specializes in construction related Rules and Regulations. Ms. Ng stated that Mr. Delventhal had advised that it was all right to work with Mr. Wong's office.

Chair Low advised that the Commission would await the final report of the City Attorney. Ms. Frankel addressed the Commission stating that Mr. Delventhal is her immediate supervisor, his office being a stones throw from hers. Ms. Frankel noted that she works with him on everything she does for the Commission and he is completely involved in every piece of work provided to the Commission and staff. Ms. Frankel stated that there must have been a miscommunication because as far as Mr. Delventhal knows he has not signed off on the matter.

Commissioner Jaicks had questions regarding the substance of the revisions. Commissioner Knutzen advised that the language had been requested to help decide whether the HRC as a whole had jurisdiction over a complaint, and if not complainants would be notified in a timely manner.

Director Bamba added that it was a great idea because it allowed for a process to be established.

HRC staff person Larry Brinkin addressed the commission regarding jurisdiction. He stated that jurisdiction is established at the first meeting when the discrimination is reported. He stated that it is immediately known if there is jurisdiction. Mr. Brinkin noted that in some rare cases the City Attorney might be consulted to ultimately determine jurisdiction.

Commissioner Watahara noted that the Chair had asked the City Attorney to review the document upon the request of the Commission to approve the item at the previous meeting, yet he noted that the City Attorney had received the document just a few days prior to the meeting. Susan Frankel, City Attorney added that the latest version had been received recently. Commissioner Watahara asked if revisions had been made after the request to approve the document had come before the Commission. Nichole Truax, HRC staff person, reported that there were minor changes requested by Commissioner Littleton regarding the certification process, approximately three changes. Ms. Truax stated that the Rules of Procedure that the City Attorney was asked to look at had been sent to Susan Frankel, City Attorney on Tuesday.

Commissioner Jaicks had a question regarding the "Reconsideration of a Complaint". Mr. Brinkin advised that with the previous Rules a Commission staff person having closed a complaint could decide to reopen it, and with the new rules a complaint would be reopened with the permission of the Director.

Commissioner Littleton had a question regarding the service of process by facsimile. Susan Frankel, City Attorney advised that many courts were accepting the service of process by facsimile. Commission Chair Harry Low advised that the item would be placed on the agenda after reviewing the City Attorney's comments. Nichole Truax provided clarification for Commissioner Watahara, stating that on August 12th a first draft of the Rules and Regulations had been provided to the Commission. Ms. Truax continued that a memo was sent listing 3 small changes and this information had been forwarded to everyone, including the City Attorney's office.

Commissioner Jaicks commented that he had received an advanced copy of the Director's Finding on Mr. Greene and it was outstanding.

Regarding Liberty Builders, Commission Chair Harry Low stated that the issue was unresolved and would be placed on a future calendar.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

EMPLOYMENT COMMITTEE
Commissioner Jaicks provided a report of the September 2nd Employment Committee meeting. He reported that the Director of the Retail Clerks and Meat Packers Union met with the Committee. Commissioner Jaicks stated that the Union Representative talked about the hiring practices of some of the retail stores in downtown San Francisco. He advised that the report from the Union was positive and that Management would be invited to the next meeting. Commissioner Jaicks stated that staff person Diana Rathbone provided a report regarding the close out of the Grand Southern Hotel and the role of the unreinforced masonry buildings and seismic safety local program.

Commissioner Jaicks reported that there would be further follow up with regard to the Elevator Union. L.T. Dolan, elevator worker, provided a State document entitled 'Public Policy Encouragement of Apprenticeship Programs'. She added that an apprenticeship program was not in place.

Pansy Waller reported that several women from the Film Industry had attended the Committee Meeting and a force had been formed to address their issues.

LESBIAN GAY BISEXUAL TRANSGENDER ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Herman provided the report of the August 17th Committee meeting. He reported the release of the Nicaraguan Transsexual Woman who was detained by the Immigration and Naturalization Service. The letter commending Univision KDTV 14 for featuring a well-researched documentary about violence and hate crimes against LGBT Youth was approved. (moved) Herman (seconded) Dimapilis. The letter commending the Bay Area Reporter for prominently covering the murder of an Orinda FTM and the suicide of his son and calling the writer's attention to the use of inappropriate pronouns in the article was approved. (moved) Herman (seconded) Dimapilis. Commissioner Herman cited a report from the Economic Empowerment Task Force. He advised that the task force was doing a survey to gather data on the economics of the Gay and Lesbian Community. Commissioner Herman stated that there was a report from the Diana Jaicks Anti-Racism Task Force.

In closing, Commissioner Herman reported that several members of the committee were upset and were questioning their roles with regard to serving on the committees. He advised that they were concerned about their reputations and he noted that other committee members might feel the same. Commissioner Watahara suggested staff draft a letter to the committees indicating the opening comments of Commission Chair Low. Commission Chair Low agreed and directed Director Bamba to draft the letter. Commissioner Knutzen suggested that the comments of Chair Low be summarized and provided to all the committees and staff. Director Bamba agreed and stated that a larger audience might be considered.

MBE/WBE/LBE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Littleton advised that the committee was going forward with their retreat on September 15th, at 2:00 p.m. She stated that the location would be the executive conference room at the Port of San Francisco and invited all Commissioners to attend.

Don Hesse reminded the Commissioners that next Thursday, September 16th at the Unitarian Church on the corner of Geary and Franklin, a memorial service would be held for the second Director of the HRC, Bill Becker. He stated that a small reception would follow. Commission Chair Harry Low shared fond memories of working with Mr. Becker.

CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B)
At 6:32 P.M. Commission Chair Low announced the closed session to review and evaluate the Executive (moved) Dimapilis (seconded) Knutzen.

There was no public comment.

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION
At 7:55 P.M. the Commission reconvened and voted not to disclose any discussions held in closed session. (moved) Saliba-Malouf (seconded) Herman

UNFINISHED BUSINESS
Commission Chair Harry Low advised that issues regarding Liberty Builders would be looked into.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:02 P.M. in memory of Bill Becker.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, September 23, 1999
TIME:4:30 P.M.

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,
Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By:Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Housing
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

F
80
1
/23/99
c.2

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

SEP 2 4 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY
Fax Copy 1st Posted 9/21/99 S

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033
Website: http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
E-mail: sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of August 12, 1999
   b) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of September 9, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

   1. Liberty Builders Review

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Program Unit Activities

1. Adoption of: Discrimination Complaint Rules of Procedures;
   Adoption of: Equal Benefits Rules of Procedures;
   Adoption of: Minority/Women/Local Business Utilization Rules And Regulations
2. Status Report of Employment Assessment

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dinapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report on Highlights of the Planning Session held September 15, 1999
2. Report and summary of the Regular Meeting held September 15, 1999
   a) Resolution Urging the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors to establish a Payment Terms and Conditions Agreement Ordinance. (**)
   b) Resolution Urging the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors to establish a Municipal Community Reinvestment ordinance (MCRO) Non-discrimination in lending policy. (**)
   c) Resolution Urging the Airport Commission and other City Departments to unify its M/WBE Contract reporting with the Human Rights Commission.
   d) Resolution issuing a Vote of Confidence to the Director of the San Francisco Human Rights Commission and the new 12D-A MBE/WBE/LBE Ordinance

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, October 20, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of September 21, 1999 (*)

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, October 19, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

c) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will Be held on Thursday, October 21, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

d) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will Be held on October 4, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, October 7, 1999, at 2:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eight Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION – PERSONNEL MATTER

9. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B):

PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:
MARIVIC BAMBA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

10. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(a).)

11. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION:

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – ANTICIPATED LITIGATION AS PLAINTIFF

12. VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION TO CONFER WITH LEGAL COUNSEL. (SF ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.11(A)):

ANTICIPATED LITIGATION AS PLAINTIFF

13. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54956.9 (SF ADMIN CODE SECTION 67.10(B):

14. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(a).)

15. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

16. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

17. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, September 23, 1999

A:\agenda 9/23/99

LEGEND:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 1 9 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 23, 1999

Commission Vice-Chair Ghada Saliba-Malouf called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Present: Shirley Dimapilis; Stephen Herman; Agar Jaicks; Martha Knutzen; Leslie Littleton; Harry Low; Ghada Saliba-Malouf and
Alan Watahara

Excused:Youn Chey, Antonio Salazar-Hobson, and Julia Globus-Sabori

HRC Staff
Present:Marivic Bamba, Executive Director; Larry Brinkin, Virginia Harmon, Don Hesse, Nichole Truax, Carla Vaughn,
and Pansy Waller

Guests:
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney; L.J. Dolin, Jill Tregor, Sema Dudum, Kanwarpal Dhaliwal, and Helen Marte-Bautista

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of the Commission Meeting of September 9th were approved with changes.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS

The General Communication file was circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS
There were none.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR

LIBERTY BUILDERS REVIEW
Commission Chair Harry Low reported that the issues regarding Liberty Builders would be reviewed.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

ADOPTION OF: DISCRIMINATION COMPLAINT RULES OF PROCEDURES
ADOPTION OF: EQUAL BENEFITS RULES OF PROCEDURES
ADOPTION OF: MINORITY/WOMEN/LOCAL BUSINESS UTILIZATION RULES AND REGULATIONS
Staff persons, Nichole Truax and Virginia Harmon provided information regarding the pending adoption of the Rules and Regulations.

STATUS REPORT OF EMPLOYMENT ASSESSMENT
Susan Alunan and Rosanna Moore of the Luster Group provided a status report of the employment assessment.

CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 5457 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B)
At 5:23 P.M. Commission Chair Low announced the closed session to review and evaluate the Executive
(moved) Knutzen (seconded) Herman.

There was no public comment.

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION
At 7:20 P.M. the Commission reconvened and voted not to disclose any discussions held in closed session.
(moved) Watahara (seconded) Herman.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 7:30 P.M. in memory of those slain during the notorious Zebra murders.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, October 14, 1999
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place,Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,
Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By:Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved.

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Housing
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 14, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

Fax Copy 1st Posted 10/8/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

OCT 15 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033
Website: http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
E-mail: sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

    a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of September 23, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

    a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

    1. Approval of Letter and Resolution for Carol Ackles

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Division Activities

1. Adoption of: Discrimination Complaint Rules of Procedures;
   Adoption of: Equal Benefits Rules of Procedures;
   Adoption of: Minority/Women/Local Business Utilization Rules And Regulations

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
   Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
   Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
   Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report on Highlights of the Planning Session held September 15, 1999
2. Report and summary of the Regular Meeting held September 15, 1999
   a) Resolution Urging the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors to establish a Payment Terms and Conditions Agreement Ordinance. (**)
   b) Resolution Urging the Airport Commission and other City Departments to unify its M/WBE Contract reporting with the Human Rights Commission.
   c) 12-D Rules and Regulations approved changes by the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, October 20, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
   Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
   Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
   Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
   Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of September 21, 1999 (*)

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, October 19, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

c) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of October 4, 1999 (*)
2. Approval of letter to Governor Gray Davis protesting his veto of SB 78, the "California Traffic Stops Statistics Act."

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will
Be held on November 1, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

d) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of September 16, 1999
2. Approval of Letter to Linda Davis, Acting Superintendent San Francisco Unified School District Requesting a Report on the Status of Counseling in the School District
3. Approval of Letter to Ms. Diane Webb, Thanking Her for Her service on the Youth and Education Committee and Commending Her Outstanding Commitment to the Rights of Children and Youth
4. Approval of Letter to Mr. Robert D. Haas, Chairman of the Board and CEO, Levi Strauss and Company Requesting a Response to our previous Letter Expressing concern at the Theme of an Advertisement "Our Models Can Beat Up Their Models"

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will
Be held on Thursday, October 21, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of October 7, 1999 (*)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will Be held on Thursday, November 4, 1999, at 2:00 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION – PERSONNEL MATTER

9. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B):

PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:
MARIVIC BAMBA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

10. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(a).)

11. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

12. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

13. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, OCTOBER 28, 1999

A:\agenda 10/14/99

LEGEND: (*) = Oral Report No Attachment
(**) = Attachment Provided
(***) = To be distributed at Commission Meeting

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Housing
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

F
80
1
/14/99
pecial
2

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING

MONDAY, OCTOBER 14, 1999

6:00 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey	Leslie Littleton
Shirley Dimapilis	Harry Low
Stephen Herman	Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Antonio Salazar-Hobson	Julia Globus-Sabori
Agar Jaicks	Alan Watahara
Martha Knutzen	

For Copy 1st Posted 10/14/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

OCT 15 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are the 26, 42, and 71 and the Metro station at Van Ness and Market. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of 25 Van Ness Avenue. The following services are available upon request with 48 hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033
Website: http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
E-mail: sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102. telephone (415) 554-9510 fax (415) 703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

1. ROLL CALL

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION.

3. VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION TO CONFER WITH LEGAL COUNSEL. (SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.11 (A).)

4. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SESSION 54956.9 AND SAN FRANCISCO. ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.11 (b).

   CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – ANTICIPATED LITIGATION AS PLAINTIFF

5. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

   A. Possible report on action taken in closed session. (Government Code section 54957.1 (a) (2) and San Francisco Administrative Code section 67.14 (b) (2).)

   B. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions held in closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code section 67.14 (a).)

6. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION OF THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

7. ADJOURNMENT

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 19 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING
OF OCTOBER 14, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 7:24 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present: Shirley Dimapilis; Stephen Herman; Agar Jaicks; Martha Knutzen; Leslie Littleton; Harry Low; Ghada Saliba-Malouf; Julia Globus-Sabori and Alan Watahara

Excused: Youn Chey and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

HRC Staff

Present: Carla Vaughn

Guests:

Present: Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney

PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION
There was no public comment.

VOTE ON WHETHER TO HOLD CLOSED SESSION TO CONFER WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - ANTICIPATED LITIGATION AS PLAINTIFF
It was moved and seconded to hold closed session to confer with legal counsel. (moved) Salazar- Hobson (seconded) Littleton

RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION
At 7:39 P.M. it was moved and seconded not to disclose any discussions held in closed session. (moved) Saliba - Malouf (seconded) Globus-Sabori

PUBLIC COMMENT
There was no public comment.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 7:45 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,
Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By: Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to

Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco All rights reserved

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Housing
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

=Agenda

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

fax Copy 1st Posted 10/26/99

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 28, 1999

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

OCT 28 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Stephen Herman
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Agar Jaicks
Martha Knutzen
Leslie Littleton
Harry Low
Ghada Saliba-Malouf
Julia Globus-Sabori
Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of October 14, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

   1. Approval of the Resolution Honoring the Korean Center on its 25th Anniversary (**)
   2. Appeal of Tutor-Saliba to Director's Finding

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

a) HRC Division Activities

1. Report on Staff Attendance at American Contract Compliance Training Conference.

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co Chair
Commissioner Leslie Littleton, Co Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Regular Meeting held October 20, 1999 (*)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, November 17, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of October 19, 1999 (*)

NOTE: *The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, November16, 1999, at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102*

c) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Don Hesse, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will
Be held on November 1, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA. 94102

d) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of October 21, 1999
2. Approval of Letter to Diana Rathbone Commending her work as Staff Person to The Youth and Education Committee – Presented by Commissioner Herman (**)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will
Be held on Thursday, November 18, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. No Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will
Be held on Thursday, November 4, 1999, at 2:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

9. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 4, 1999

A:\agenda 10/28/99

LEGEND:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 19 2002

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor
San Francisco, CA. 94102
(415) 252-2500
TDD: (415) 252-2550

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING OF OCTOBER 28, 1999

Commission Chair Harry Low called the meeting to order at 4:35 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Present:Shirley Dimapilis; Stephen Herman; Agar Jaicks; Martha Knutzen; Leslie Littleton; Harry Low; Ghada Saliba-Malouf;
and Alan Watahara

Excused:Youn Chey; Julia Globus-Sabori; and Antonio Salazar-Hobson

HRC Staff
Present:Larry Brinkin, Maria Cordero, Bayard Fong, Diana Rathbone,
Mary Gin Starkweather, Carla Vaughn, and Pansy Waller

Guests
Present:Susan Frankel, Deputy City Attorney

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
The approval of the minutes of the October 14, 1999 Commission meeting were deferred to November 4, 1999.

GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS
The General Communication file was circulated.

PUBLIC COMMENTS
There were none.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR
Commission Chair Harry Low congratulated HRC staff person Mary Gin Starkweather for receiving the Public Service Achievement Award from Common Cause and noted her outstanding contributions to the Human Rights Commission.

A resolution honoring the Korean Center on its 25th Anniversary was approved. (Moved) Herman (Seconded) Dimapilis. Commissioner Herman attended the event. Commissioner Herman reported that Commissioner Knutzen was honored at an event sponsored by Wilkes-Bashford.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR
Director Bamba reported that Larry Brinkin would accept on behalf of the department the 1999 Challenge award issued by the California State Association of Counties.

Director Bamba introduced Bayard Fong and Maria Cordero who reported on staff attendance at the American Contract Compliance Training Conference, which was held in Florida. Commissioner Herman requested that a letter be forwarded to Florida in a show of support for their efforts regarding Human Rights.

COMMITTEE REPORTS
MBE/WBE/LBE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Dimapilis provided a report on the Ballpark and Port from the regular

meeting held October 20th.

LESBIAN GAY BISEXUAL TRANSGENDER ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Commissioner Knutzen reported on the Committee meeting held October 19th , with comments from Commissioners Herman and Jaicks. Larry Brinkin reported that plans for the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Community Center were moving forward

ISSUES COMMITTEE
There was no report from the Issues Committee.

YOUTH AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE
In the absence of Commissioner Chey, Commissioner Herman provided the report from the October 21st meeting of the Youth and Education Committee. Commissioner Herman presented a letter to Diana Rathbone, HRC staff person, commending her work on the youth and Education Committee. The letter was unanimously approved. (Moved) Dimapilis (Seconded) Knutzen.

EMPLOYMENT COMMITTEE
There was no report from the Employment Committee.
UNFINISHED BUSINESS
Issues regarding Liberty Builders were agendized for the next regular meeting. Commissioner Littleton requested that the Rules and Regulations for 12-D(a) be agendized.

PUBLIC COMMENT
There was no public comment.

ADJOURNMENT
The meeting was adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

NEXT MEETING
DATE:Thursday, November 4, 1999
TIME:4:30 P.M.
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416
San Francisco, CA 94102

Respectfully submitted,
Marivic Bamba
Executive Director

By:Carla Vaughn
Commission Secretary

Return to
Meetings Information

SFGov home | living | working | government | visiting | online services

© 2000-02 City & County of San Francisco. All rights reserved

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Housing
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

Agenda

F
80
1
/4/99
.2

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 4, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 408
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Harry Low, Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Julia Globus-Sabori
Stephen Herman
Agar Jaicks
Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Martha Knutzen
Leslie Littleton
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Alan Watahara

for City 1st Posted 10/29/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

NOV 0 3 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are the 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033
Website: http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
E-mail: sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510 fax (415) 703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   (a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of October 28, 1999
   Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of October 14, 1999
   Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of September 23, 1999
   Approval of minutes of Commission meeting of September 9, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

(a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

1. Liberty Builders Appeal
2. Tutor Saliba's Appeal to Director's Findings in Tutor Saliba vs. Green

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

(a) HRC Division Activities

1. Rules and Regulations for 12D-A

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

(a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co-Chair
Commissioner Leslie Littleton, Co-Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, November 17, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, Ca 94102

(b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co-Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co-Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Approval of letters to various Supervisors, City attorneys, community activists, And HRC employees commending them for their work on the Equal Benefits Ordinance.(**)

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, November 16, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

(c) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of November 1, 1999

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will
Be held on December 6, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

(d) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. The endorsement of the Human Rights Commission against the "Gang Violence and Juvenile Crime Prevention Act"

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will
Be held on Thursday, November 18, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

(e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co-Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. Report of the Committee Meeting of November 4, 1999
2. Letter to the Airport Commission regarding certified payroll records

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will
Be held on Thursday, December 2, 1999, at 2:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

9. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDAR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting will be held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 408, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 1999

A:\AGENDA 11/4/99

Legend:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission

Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Housing
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING

THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 4, 1999

6:00 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 408
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Stephen Herman
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Agar Jaicks
Martha Knutzen
Leslie Littleton
Harry Low
Ghada Saliba-Maloul
Julia Globus-Sabori
Alan Watahara

Fax Copy 1st Posted 11/3/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

NOV 05 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The City Hall Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033
Website: http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
E-mail: sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)554-9510 fax (415)703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION – PERSONNAL MATTER

3. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B):

   PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:
   MARIVIC BAMBA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

4. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

   VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(A).)

5. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

6. ADJOURNMENT

All meetings are held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 1999

A:\agenda 11/4/ 99

LEGEND:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterpri
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Hou
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

CANCELLATION NOTICE

THE PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED SPECIAL MEETING FOR NOVEMBER 18, 1999, HAS BEEN CANCELLED.

The next regular meeting will be held on December 9, 1999 @ 4:30pm… by-passing the Holiday Season, the following meetings will be held on January 13th & 27th, 1999 at their regular times.

NOTE: QUESTIONS MAY BE DIRECTED TO COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DOCUMENTS DEPT.
NOV 17 1999
SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033
Website: http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
E-mail: sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us

City and County of San Francisco

Willie Lewis Brown, Jr.
Mayor

Human Rights Commission
Equal Opportunity & Minority/Women/Local Business Enterprise
Nondiscrimination in Employment, Public Accommodations & Housing
Lesbian, Gay, Transgender & HIV
Youth & Education

Marivic S. Bamba
Executive Director

F
80
1
2/9/99
.2

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

= Agenda

REGULAR MEETING

Fax Copy 1st Posted 12/4/99

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

DEC 0 6 1999

SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 9, 1999

4:30 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 408
1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Harry Low, Chair
Youn-Cha Shin Chey
Shirley Dimapilis
Julia Globus-Sabori
Stephen Herman
Agar Jaicks
Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Vice Chair
Martha Knutzen
Leslie Littleton
Antonio Salazar-Hobson
Alan Watahara

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Marivic S. Bamba

COMMISSION SECRETARY
Carla Vaughn
252-2538

DISABILITY ACCESS

The HRC Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station and the closest Muni Metro station is the Van Ness Station. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are the 42 and 71. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall, including the Civic Center Underground Garage. The following services are available upon request with 48-hour advance notice: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting or sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. To make arrangements or for information, contact Carla Vaughn 252-2500 (Voice) or 252-2550 (TDD). In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800
San Francisco
California 94102-6033
Website: http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/sfhumanrights

TEL (415) 252-2500
FAX (415) 431-5764
TDD (415) 252-2550
E-mail: sfhumanrightscom@ci.sf.ca.us

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force at 554-6075.

ATTENTION: Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510 fax (415) 703-0121 and web site http://www.ci.sf.ca.es./ethics.

AGENDA

Items designated by "CC" shall automatically be approved, unless a request for removal for discussion or explanation is received from the audience, Commission or Commission staff.

Public testimony will be taken on each item.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

   (a) Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of October 28, 1999
   Approval of minutes of Commission Meeting of November 4, 1999

3. GENERAL COMMUNICATIONS FILE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS

   (a) Presentation by Jakkee Bryson on HRC issues from 1998 through 1999

5. REPORT OF THE CHAIR

   (a) Individual Commissioners Report on their Activities in the Community

   1. Director's Findings in Tutor Saliba vs. Green

6. REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

(a) HRC Division Activities

1. December Quarterly Report
2. Update on Appeal Hearings for: - Tutor Saliba vs. Green
   West Bay Builders
3. Report on California State Association of Counties 1999 Challenge Award
4. Report on Airport Activities – Kevin Williams

7. COMMITTEE REPORTS

(a) MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee
Commissioner Shirley Dimapilis, Co-Chair
Commissioner Leslie Littleton, Co-Chair
Commissioner Alan Watahara, Member
Maria Cordero, Committee Staff

1. Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the MBE/WBE/LBE Advisory Committee will Be held on Wednesday, December 15, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

(b) Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee
Commissioner Martha Knutzen, Co-Chair
Commissioner Stephen Herman, Co-Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Larry Brinkin, Committee Staff

1. Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender Advisory Committee will Be held on Tuesday, December 21, 1999 at 5:30 p.m. at the Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

(c) Issues Committee
Commissioner Antonio Salazar-Hobson, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Member
Committee Staff

1. Report
2. Letter regarding atrocities against the women of Afghanistan

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Issues Committee will
Be held on January 3, 2000 at 5:30 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

(d) Youth and Education Committee
Commissioner Youn-Cha Shin Chey, Chair
Commissioner Julia Globus-Sabori, Co-Chair
Diana Rathbone, Committee Staff

1. Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Youth and Education Committee will
Be held on Thursday, December 16, 1999 at 4:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

(e) Employment Committee
Commissioner Ghada Saliba-Malouf, Chair
Commissioner Agar Jaicks, Co-Chair
Pansy Waller, Committee Staff

1. Report

NOTE:
The next meeting of the Employment Committee will
Be held on Thursday, January 6, 2000 at 2:00 p.m. at the
Human Rights Commission offices, 25 Van Ness Avenue,
Eighth Floor Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ALL MATTERS PERTAINING TO THE CLOSED SESSION – PERSONNEL MATTER

9. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B):

   PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:
   MARIVIC BAMBA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

10. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

    VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(a).)

11. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

12. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDER FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

13. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting will be held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 408, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, JANUARY 13, 1999

A:\AGENDA 12/9/99

Legend:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting

9. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 AND SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.10(B):

   PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION:
   MARIVIC BAMBA, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

10. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION:

    VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION (SAN FRANCISCO) ADMINISTRATIVE CODE SECTION 67.14(a).)

11. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

12. NEW BUSINESS – REQUEST BY COMMISSIONERS TO CALENDER FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

13. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting will be held at: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 408, San Francisco, CA 94102, unless otherwise stated.

NEXT MEETING: THURSDAY, JANUARY 13, 1999

A:\AGENDA 12/9/99

Legend:	(*)	=	Oral Report No Attachment
	(**)	=	Attachment Provided
	(***)	=	To be distributed at Commission Meeting